

## CHAPTER I GENERAL

### 1.1 Trend of revenue

The tax and non-tax revenue raised by the Government of West Bengal during the year 2008-09, the State's share of divisible Union taxes and grants-in-aid received from the Government of India during the year and the corresponding figures for the preceding four years are mentioned in the following table:

		(Rupees in crore)				
Receipts		2004-05	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09
<b>I.</b>	<b>Revenue raised by the State Government</b>					
	• Tax revenue	9,924.46	10,388.38	11,694.77	13,126.33	14,419.15
	• Non-tax revenue	1,345.66	1,018.81	1,248.76	1,473.09	4,966.39
<b>Total</b>		<b>11,270.12</b>	<b>11,407.19</b>	<b>12,943.53</b>	<b>14,599.42</b>	<b>19,385.54</b>
<b>II.</b>	<b>Receipts from the Government of India</b>					
	• State's share of net proceeds of divisible Union taxes	6,384.89	6,668.33	8,505.60	10,729.06	11,321.78
	• Grants-in-aid	2,263.18	5,650.37	4,379.18	4,838.90	6,197.07
<b>Total</b>		<b>8,648.07</b>	<b>12,318.70</b>	<b>12,884.78</b>	<b>15,567.96</b>	<b>17,518.85</b>
<b>III.</b>	<b>Total receipts of the State Government (I+II)</b>	<b>19,918.19</b>	<b>23,725.89</b>	<b>25,828.31</b>	<b>30,167.38</b>	<b>36,904.39<sup>1</sup></b>
<b>IV.</b>	<b>Percentage of I to III</b>	<b>57</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>48</b>	<b>53</b>

Thus, during the year 2008-09, the revenue raised by the State Government (Rs. 19,385.54 crore) was 53 *per cent* of the total revenue receipts (Rs. 36,904.39 crore) against 48 *per cent* in the preceding year. The balance 47 *per cent* of the receipts was from the Government of India.

<sup>1</sup> For details, please see Statement No. 11 – Detailed accounts of revenue by minor heads in the Finance Accounts of the Government for the year 2008-09. Figures under the heads 0020 - Corporation tax, 0021 - Taxes on income other than corporation tax, 0032 - Taxes on wealth, 0037 – Customs duty, 0038 - Union excise duties, 0044 - Service tax, -'Share of net proceeds assigned to States' booked in the Finance Accounts under A - Tax revenue have been excluded from revenue raised by the State and included in State's share of divisible union taxes in this statement.

### 1.1.1 Tax revenue

The following table presents the details of tax revenue raised during the period from 2004-05 to 2008-09:

(Rupees in crore)

Sl. no.	Head of revenue	2004-05	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	Percentage of increase (+)/ decrease (-) in 2008-09 over 2007-08
1.	• Sales tax/VAT	5,086.33	5,394.81	6,279.83	7,262.92	8,134.07	(+) 11.99
	• Central sales tax	629.97	713.97	799.20	797.54	821.02	(+) 2.94
2.	State excise	671.56	743.46	817.36	935.46	1,082.94	(+) 15.77
3.	Stamp duty and registration fees	1,006.54	1,177.59	1,258.57	1,416.96	1,509.49	(+) 6.53
4.	Taxes and duties on electricity	269.65	382.46	526.35	506.69	587.52	(+) 15.95
5.	Taxes on vehicles	527.66	537.56	508.97	532.07	608.01	(+) 14.27
6.	Other taxes on income and expenditure-tax on professions, trades, callings and employment	237.43	249.15	264.85	295.06	321.60	(+) 8.99
7.	Other taxes and duties on commodities and services	359.68	269.36	284.73	341.18	367.15	(+) 7.61
8.	Land revenue	1,132.55	917.11	952.69	1,039.58	983.78	(-) 5.37
9.	Other taxes	3.09	2.91	2.22	(-) 1.13	3.57	
<b>Total</b>		<b>9,924.46</b>	<b>10,388.38</b>	<b>11,694.77</b>	<b>13,126.33</b>	<b>14,419.15</b>	<b>(+) 9.85</b>

The increase in tax revenue receipts in 2008-09 over the preceding year from Sales tax/VAT (11.99 *per cent*), State excise (15.77 *per cent*) and Taxes and duties on electricity (15.95 *per cent*) as intimated by the respective departments was mainly due to increased receipts of sales tax, duty from sale of spirits and foreign liquor, duty on consumption and sale of electricity, fees from electrical inspection of cinemas etc. The other departments did not inform (October 2009) the reasons for variation despite being requested (June 2009).

**1.1.2 Non-tax revenue**

The following table presents the details of the non-tax revenue raised during the period from 2004-05 to 2008-09:

**(Rupees in crore)**

Sl. no.	Head of revenue	2004-05	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	Percentage of increase (+)/ decrease (-) in 2008-09 over 2007-08
1.	Interest	589.31	378.08	683.66	689.96	3,999.90 <sup>2</sup>	(+) 479.73
2.	Dairy development	38.42	26.44	22.25	26.94	29.84	(+) 10.76
3.	Roads and bridges	19.57	19.98	18.11	13.66	18.58	(+) 36.02
4.	Forestry and wildlife	40.44	38.61	40.87	49.84	45.33	(-) 9.05
5.	Non-ferrous mining and metallurgical industries	18.94	19.88	11.56	7.03	9.91	(+) 40.97
6.	Food storage and warehousing	180.23	191.50	87.67	247.71	340.17	(+) 37.33
7.	Housing	13.96	9.67	10.43	9.68	9.07	(-) 6.30
8.	Medical and public health	71.51	53.16	68.13	42.83	66.36	(+) 54.94
9.	Education, sports, art and culture	30.67	22.64	16.22	21.42	44.62	(+) 108.31
10.	Public works	7.29	6.73	5.42	7.86	6.70	(-) 14.76
11.	Police	56.85	57.05	71.33	63.02	66.88	(+) 6.12
12.	Others	278.47	195.07	213.11	293.14	329.03	(+) 12.24
<b>Total</b>		<b>1,345.66</b>	<b>1,018.81</b>	<b>1,248.76</b>	<b>1,473.09</b>	<b>4,966.39</b>	<b>(+) 237.14</b>

The increase in non-tax revenues in 2008-09 over the preceding year from 'Interest receipts' (479.73 per cent), 'Medical and public health' (54.94 per cent) and 'Education, sports, art and culture' (108.31 per cent) was mainly due to increase in receipts of interest from public sector and other undertakings, Employees State Insurance Scheme and general education. The other departments did not inform (October 2009) the reasons for variation despite being requested (June 2009).

<sup>2</sup> Includes Rs. 3,547.80 lakh, Rs. 124.87 lakh and Rs. 3,239.74 lakh by book adjustment to the heads "2700 - Major irrigation", "2701 - Medium irrigation", "2711 - Flood control and drainage" respectively.

## 1.2 Initiative for mobilisation of additional resources

In the budget for the year 2008-09, the Government had emphasised the need for reducing deficit and protecting plan expenditure through mobilisation of additional resources by extending the modified scheme for settlement of disputes relating to sales tax till March 2009 and by simplifying the procedure of payment/filing of tax return etc. Further, additional resource of Rs. 75 crore comprising Rs. 30 crore from one time settlement of disputes of sales tax, Rs. 15 crore from increase in one time tax on motor cars and omni buses and Rs. 30 crore from excise duty was also expected. The Government also planned that tax compliance would be made easier through a modern and improved tax administration.

The actual collection of the tax revenue of Rs. 14,419.15 crore was less than the budget estimate (BE) of Rs. 16,222 crore by Rs. 1,803 crore (11.11 *per cent*) which was compensated by receipt of the non-tax revenue of Rs. 4,966 crore against the budget estimate of Rs. 1,771 crore. The overall collection of revenue of (Rs. 19,385.54 crore), was Rs. 1,391.54 crore more than (7.82 *per cent*) the budget estimate (BE) for (Rs. 17,994 crore) as discussed in the following paragraph.

## 1.3 Variations between budget estimates and actuals

The variations between the budget estimates and actuals of revenue receipts for the year 2008-09 in respect of the principal heads of tax and non-tax revenue are mentioned in the following table:

(Rupees in crore)

Sl. No.	Head of revenue	Budget estimates	Actuals	Variations excess (+) or shortfall (-)	Percentage of variation
<b>Tax revenue</b>					
1.	Sales Tax/VAT	9,794	8,955	(-) 839	(-) 8.57
2.	State excise	1,115	1,083	(-) 32	(-) 2.87
3.	Land revenue	1,489	984	(-) 505	(-) 33.92
4.	Taxes on vehicles	673	608	(-) 65	(-) 9.66
5.	Stamp duty and registration fees	1,738	1,509	(-) 229	(-) 13.18
6.	Profession tax	335	322	(-) 13	(-) 3.88
7.	Electricity duty	696	588	(-) 108	(-) 15.52
8.	Other taxes and duties on commodities and services	379	367	(-) 12	(-) 3.17
9.	Agricultural income tax	1	4	(+) 3	(+) 300.00
10.	Others	2	(-) 1	(-) 3	(-) 150.00
<b>Total</b>		<b>16,222</b>	<b>14,419</b>	<b>(-) 1,803</b>	<b>(-) 11.11</b>
<b>Non-tax revenue</b>					
11.	Forest receipts	50	45	(-) 5	(-) 10.00
12.	Interest receipts	829	4,000	(+) 3,171	(+) 382.51

13.	Dairy development	27	30	(+) 3	(+) 11.11
14.	Food storage and warehousing	238	340	(+) 102	(+) 42.86
15.	Medical and public health	96	66	(-) 30	(-) 31.25
16.	Education, sports, art and culture	20	45	(+) 25	(+) 125.00
17.	Public works	7	7	NIL	NIL
18.	Roads and bridges	22	19	(-) 3	(-) 13.64
19.	Police	170	67	(-) 103	(-) 60.59
20.	Major and medium irrigation	8	7	(-) 1	(-) 12.50
21.	Minor irrigation	23	20	(-) 3	(-) 13.04
22.	Others	281	320	(+) 39	(+) 13.88
<b>Total</b>		<b>1,771</b>	<b>4,966</b>	<b>(+) 3,195</b>	<b>(+) 180.41</b>

The reason for variation (382.51 *per cent*) between BE and actual in respect of Interest receipts was mainly due to writing off of interest on government loans to West Bengal State Electricity Board for finalising West Bengal Power Sector Reforms Transfer Scheme, 2007.

The reasons for variation between BEs and actuals were not furnished by the other departments despite being requested (June 2009).

#### 1.4 Analysis of collection

The break-up of the total collection at pre-assessment stage and after regular assessment of the sales tax, agricultural income tax and amusement tax for the year 2008-09 and the corresponding figures for the preceding two years as furnished by the department is as mentioned in the following table:

(Rupees in crore)							
Head of revenue	Year	Amount collected at pre-assessment stage	Amount collected after regular assessment	Penalties for delay in payment of taxes and duties	Amount refunded	Net collection	Percentage of column 3 to 7
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
Sales tax/VAT	2006-07	6,993.04	94.57	31.03	39.62	7,079.02	99
	2007-08	8,223.06	99.87	33.17	32.12	8,323.98	99
	2008-09	8,857.15	98.53	36.12	24.40	8,967.40 <sup>3</sup>	99
Agricultural income tax	2006-07	0.95	0.17	0.03	0.10	1.05	90
	2007-08	0.05	0.27	0.05	3.02	(-) 2.65	
	2008-09	0.12	6.86	2.30	0.40	8.88	1
Amusement tax	2006-07	59.09	7.72	0.09	0.03	66.87	88
	2007-08	72.00	6.63	0.16	1.65	77.14	93
	2008-09	56.81	13.76	0.72	3.70	67.59	84

<sup>3</sup> Departmental figure is at variance with the Finance Account figure which is to be reconciled.

Thus, the collection of tax at pre assessment stage during the last three years ranged between 84 to 99 *per cent* except in the case of Agricultural income tax. This indicates that voluntary compliance for payment of tax by the dealers was good.

### 1.5 Cost of collection

The gross collection in respect of the major revenue receipts, expenditure incurred on their collection and the percentage of such expenditure to gross collection during the years 2006-07 to 2008-09 along with the relevant all India average percentage of expenditure on collection to gross collection for the year 2007-08 are given in the following table:

(Rupees in crore)

Head of revenue	Year	Gross collection	Expenditure on collection	Percentage of expenditure to gross collection	All India average percentage of expenditure on collection for the year 2007-08
Sales tax/VAT	2006-07	7,079.00	83.79	1.18	0.83
	2007-08	8,060.46	92.42	1.15	
	2008-09	8,955.09	100.34	1.12	
State excise	2006-07	817.00	42.38	5.19	3.27
	2007-08	935.47	49.59	5.30	
	2008-09	1,082.94	65.76	6.07	
Stamp duty and registration fees	2006-07	1,259.00	44.97	3.57	2.58
	2007-08	1,416.96	60.10	4.24	
	2008-09	1509.49	53.61	3.55	
Taxes on vehicles	2006-07	509.00	9.89	1.94	2.09
	2007-08	532.07	10.86	2.04	
	2008-09	608.01	11.92	1.96	

The percentage of expenditure on collection of sales tax/VAT, State excise and Stamp duty and registration fees was well above the all India average. There is considerable scope for the Government to improve the efficiency of tax collection.

### 1.6 Analysis of arrears of revenue

The arrears of revenue as on 31 March 2009 in respect of some heads of revenue as furnished by the departments, amounted to Rs. 152.72 crore, of which Rs. 84.72 crore was outstanding for more than five years as shown in the following table:

(Rupees in crore)

Head of revenue	Amount outstanding as on 31 March 2009	Amount outstanding for more than five years as on 31 March 2009
Sales tax/VAT	Not furnished by department	Not furnished by department
Amusement tax	42.59	13.97
Agricultural income tax	99.63	64.66
Excise duty	10.50	6.09
<b>Total</b>	<b>152.72</b>	<b>84.72</b>

The stages at which these were pending had not been intimated by the departments concerned (September 2009) despite being requested (June 2009).

### 1.7 Arrears in assessments

The following table shows the details of pending assessment cases in the preceding three years as furnished by the departments:

Year	Opening balance	Cases due for assessment during the year	Total	Cases finalised during the year	Balance at the close of the year	Arrears as percentage of total cases
<b>Sales tax/VAT</b>						
2006-07	1,69,076	80,077	2,49,153	1,34,054	1,15,099	46
2007-08	1,15,099	39,271	1,54,370	1,21,325	33,045	21
2008-09	33,045	62,085	95,130	67,558	27,572	29
<b>Profession tax</b>						
2006-07	1,32,113	54,536	1,86,649	51,514	1,35,135	72
2007-08	1,35,135	88,068	2,23,203	71,951	1,51,252	68
2008-09	1,51,252	77,336	2,28,588	83,536	1,45,052	63
<b>Amusement tax</b>						
2006-07	8,040	3,126	11,166	2,499	8,667	78
2007-08	8,667	4,088	12,755	2,567	10,188	80
2008-09	10,188	4,266	14,454	3,160	11,294	78
<b>Agricultural income tax</b>						
2006-07	2,560	665	3,225	676	2,549	79
2007-08	2,549	670	3,219	633	2,586	80
2008-09	2,586	8,189	10,775	1,713	9,062	84

Immediate action needs to be taken to finalise the remaining cases in sales tax as value added tax has been introduced in the state from 2005-06. However, the number of pending cases in profession tax, amusement tax and agricultural income tax is large. The department should initiate steps to complete the assessments within a definite time frame.

### 1.8 Evasion of tax

The details of cases of evasion of tax detected, cases finalised and the demands for additional tax raised as reported by the departments is mentioned in the following table:

Name of tax/duty	Cases pending as on 31 March 2008	Cases detected during 2008-09	Total	No. of cases in which assessments/investigations completed and additional demand including penalty etc. raised		No. of cases pending finalisation as on 31 March 2009
				No. of cases	Amount demanded (Rs in crore)	
Sales tax/VAT	198	41	239	33	18.57	206
State excise	8	Nil	8	1	Not available	7
Amusement tax	22	Nil	22	Nil	Nil	22

While the number of pending cases in respect of sales tax increased, the progress in disposal of amusement tax cases was not satisfactory.

### 1.9 Refunds

The number of refund cases pending at the beginning of the year 2008-09, claims received and refunds made during the year and the balance at the close of the year 2008-09, as reported by the departments are mentioned in the following table:

**(Rupees in crore)**

Category	Sales tax/VAT		Amusement tax		Agricultural income tax	
	No. of cases	Amount	No. of cases	Amount	No. of cases <sup>4</sup>	Amount
Claims outstanding at the beginning of the year	252	1.20	Nil	Nil	7	0.26
Claims received during the year	281	25.02	11	3.70	16	0.20
Refunds made during the year	381	24.40	11	3.70	17	0.40
Balance outstanding at the end of the year	152	1.82	Nil	Nil	6	0.06

While there was no case outstanding for refund in case of amusement tax, there was improvement in processing the refund cases in respect of sales tax and agricultural income tax.

### 1.10 Status of recovery against audit observations accepted by the Government

A review of the replies of the Government to the paragraphs of the Audit Reports for the last five years from 2003-04 to 2007-08 shows that against the revenue effect of Rs. 2,298.44 crore of the audit observations accepted by the departments, the actual recovery is very low at Rs. 324.94 crore (14.14 per cent). A year-wise break-up of the recovery of revenue till June 2009 is given in the following table:

<sup>4</sup> The department has stated that there was an unintentional error in the figure for the year 2007-08 which has been corrected.

(Rupees in crore)

Year of Audit Report	Revenue effect of the Audit Report	Amount accepted by the departments	Amount recovered
2003-04	1,335.20	483.13	29.64
2004-05	554.93	442.16	285.33
2005-06	711.36	170.81	0.08
2006-07	2,483.81	1008.60	9.41
2007-08	616.07	193.74	0.48
<b>Total</b>	<b>5,701.37</b>	<b>2,298.44</b>	<b>324.94</b>

### 1.11 Departmental audit committee meetings

For prompt settlement of old outstanding inspection reports (IRs), departmental audit committees were constituted by the Government in the year 1985. The administrative department is required to convene meetings of the audit committees comprising the Secretary of the administrative department concerned, a senior officer of the Finance Department not below the rank of Joint Secretary and a representative of the office of the Accountant General, West Bengal.

The number of meetings held and the paragraphs settled during the last three years are mentioned in the following table:

(Rupees in crore)

Year	Name of the department	Number of meeting(s) held	Number of paragraphs settled	Money value of the paragraphs settled
2006-07	State Excise	1	59	2.83
2007-08	State Excise	1	33	39.37
2008-09	State Excise	1	42	13.05
	Land Reforms	1	1	0.01
	Industrial Reconstruction	1	1	1.62

Thus, out of eight departmental audit committees, one committee held meetings regularly during the last three years and two committees held meetings during the last year only and settled 136 paragraphs involving money value of Rs. 56.88 crore. The other departments did not hold any audit committee meeting till August 2009 despite several reminders.

### 1.12 Failure of senior officials to enforce accountability and protect the interest of the Government

The Accountant General (Receipt, Works and Local Bodies Audit), West Bengal arranges periodic inspection of the Government departments to test check the transactions and verify the maintenance of accounts and other records as per the prescribed rules and procedures. Following the inspections, IRs are issued to the heads of offices inspected with copies to the administrative departments for taking prompt corrective action. The Government have provided that first replies to the IRs should be furnished within three weeks of receipt. The heads of the offices and the Government

are required to comply with the observations contained in the IRs and rectify the defects and omissions promptly and report their compliance to the office of the Accountant General within two months from the date of issue of the IRs. Serious irregularities are also brought to the notice of the heads of the departments by the office of the Accountant General.

Of the Inspection reports issued up to March 2009, 3,161 paragraphs relating to 1,145 IRs involving Rs. 4,179.03 crore remained outstanding at the end of September 2009. Of these, 272 IRs containing 520 paragraphs involving Rs. 57.88 crore had not been settled for more than 10 years; the concerned departments were Finance, Forest, Commerce and Industries, Transport and Land and Land Reforms. In respect of 1,987 paragraphs of 540 IRs issued between April 1984 and March 2009 even the first replies were not furnished. As a result, the serious irregularities commented upon in these IRs remained unattended as of 30 September 2009.

A department wise break-up of the IRs and audit observations outstanding as on 30 September 2009 is given in the following table:

**(Rupees in crore)**

Sl. no.	Department	Position of IRs issued up to March 2009 but not settled at the end of September 2009			Position of IRs and paragraphs not settled for more than 10 years			Position of IRs in respect of which even the first reply has not been received		
		No. of IRs	No. of Para-graphs	Money value	No. of IRs	No. of Para-graphs	Money value	No. of IRs	No. of Para-graphs	Earliest year to which IR relates
1.	<b>Finance</b>									
	Sales tax/VAT	86	458	52.05	NIL	NIL	NIL	80	450	2004-05
	Profession tax	100	239	11.13	26	33	0.26	52	160	2002-03
	Stamp duty and registration fees	266	409	52.57	30	35	1.75	164	278	1997-98
	Electricity duty	52	100	8.50	22	27	1.86	8	29	1998-99
	Amusement tax	69	135	27.30	31	48	2.04	26	54	1984-85
2.	<b>Forest</b>									
	Forest receipts	113	259	65.75	28	35	1.30	61	187	1997-98
3.	<b>Land and Land Reforms/Commerce and Industries</b>									
	Mines and minerals	82	272	107.22	21	43	1.61	34	208	1992-93
4.	<b>Land and Land Reforms</b>									
	Land revenue	98	583	160.68	45	183	19.03	39	227	1992-93
5.	<b>Excise</b>									
	State excise	43	122	42.73	Nil	Nil	Nil	29	226	1992-93
6.	<b>Transport</b>									
	Motor vehicles	131	366	25.50	30	43	0.46	11	65	2003-07
7.	<b>Other</b>									
	Departmental receipts	105	218	3,625.60	39	73	29.57	36	103	1995-96
	<b>Total</b>	<b>1,145</b>	<b>3,161</b>	<b>4,179.03</b>	<b>272</b>	<b>520</b>	<b>57.88</b>	<b>540</b>	<b>1,987</b>	

This indicates the failure of the departmental officials in initiating action to correct the defects, omissions and irregularities pointed out in the IRs. The Principal Secretaries/Secretaries of the departments were informed of the position through half yearly reports, but there was no improvement in the position.

### 1.13 Settlement of paragraphs of the Audit Reports

The Committee on Public Accounts (PAC) discusses the Receipt Audit Reports and presents its own reports and recommendations for compliance by the Government. Normally 20 *per cent* of the total number of paragraphs of the Audit Report are selected every year for discussion. The remaining paragraphs are disposed of on the basis of replies of the Government.

As of 31 March 2009, the Government had not furnished explanatory notes in respect of 34 selected and 1,301 unselected paragraphs including 377 sub paragraphs<sup>5</sup> of Audit Reports from 1981-82 to 2006-07. The lack of response from the Government would adversely impact the revenue realisation.

### 1.14 Follow-up on the Audit Reports - summarised status

As per the Rules of Procedure of the PAC of the West Bengal Legislative Assembly (Internal Working) framed in 1997, the concerned department shall send action taken notes (ATN) on the recommendations contained in the Report of the PAC within six months from the date of its presentation to the House. The position of outstanding ATNs due from the departments is mentioned in the following table:

PAC Report	Date of presentation in the Assembly	Name of the Department	Year of Audit Report	No. of ATNs due
Seventeenth Report of 1988-89	5 May 1989	Irrigation and Waterways	1978-79 1983-84	3 1
Twenty second Report of 1990-91	26 March 1991	Transport	1979-80 1980-81	1 1
Second Report of 1991-92	9 April 1992	Board of Revenue	1980-81 1983-84	2 1
Seventh Report of 1991-93	23 March 1993	Finance	1983-84	1
Seventeenth Report 1993-94	31 March 1994	Land and Land Reforms	1985-86 1986-87	1 1
Twenty fifth Report of 1994-96	1 August 1995	Transport	1983-84	1
		Home (Police)	1988-89	1
Seventeenth Report of 1998-99	28 June 1999	Land and Land Reforms	1988-89 1992-93	1 1
Twenty ninth Report of 1999-2000	2 December 1999	Irrigation and Waterways	1990-91	1
Sixteenth Report of 2002-03	8 July 2003	Finance	1997-98	1
			1998-99	2
Twenty second Report of 2003-04	7 July 2004	Finance	1998-99	8
Thirty fifth Report of 2004-05	8 July 2005	Land and Land Reforms	1999-2000	5
<b>Total</b>				<b>33</b>

<sup>5</sup> Sub-paragraphs of the Audit Reports for the years 1981-82 to 1991-92 which have not been selected by the PAC have since been included in the outstanding list awaiting replies from the Government.

The table shows that the departments failed to submit ATNs within the stipulated six months in respect of 33 paragraphs included in the Audit Reports upto the year ended 31 March 2000.

### **1.15 Results of audit**

Test check of the records of sales tax, land revenue, stamp duty and registration fees, motor vehicles tax, state excise, electricity duty, other tax receipts, forest receipts and other non-tax receipts conducted during the year 2008-09 indicated underassessment/short levy/loss of revenue amounting to Rs. 1,529.27 crore in 723 audit observations of which the departments accepted Rs. 565.51 crore in 292 audit observations and recovered Rs. 17.87 crore in 68 cases at the instance of audit. No replies have been received in respect of the remaining cases.

This Report contains 50 paragraphs including three reviews relating to non/short levy of taxes, duties, interest and penalties etc., involving Rs. 784.58 crore. The departments accepted audit observations involving Rs. 495 crore of which Rs. 14.70 crore had been recovered. These are discussed in the succeeding chapters II to IX.