

**RECORD NOTE OF DISCUSSIONS ON
THE MEETING HELD ON 25.03.2019 AT 10.30 A.M. BY THE
DY. C&AG (HR & LB) WITH THE OFFICE BEARERS OF THE
NATIONAL AUDIT FEDERATION**

1. An Agenda meeting was held by the Dy. C&AG (HR & LB) with the office bearers of the National Audit Federation was held on 25.03.2019 at 10.30 A.M. in Committee Room No. 1. List of the participants who attended the meeting is at Annexure A.
2. At the outset, the Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General welcomed the representatives of the National Audit Federation and hoped that the ensuing deliberations would be fruitful and constructive.
3. Discussions commenced thereafter on the 13 Agenda Items.

ANNEXURE- A

**LIST OF PARTICIPANTS WHO ATTENDED THE MEETING HELD BY DEPUTY COMPTROLLER
AND AUDITOR GENERAL (HR & LB) WITH THE OFFICE BEARERS OF THE NATIONAL
AUDIT FEDERATION ON 25.03.2019 AT 10.30 A.M.**

S/Shri/Smt.

A W K Langstieh	Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General (HR & LB)
Khalid Bin Jamal	Director General (Staff)
V. S. Venkatanathan	AC (N)
Raj Kumari Sharma (JCM)	Administrative Officer
A. K. Das	President (of the Federation)
Shri L. S. Sujith Kumar	Secretary General (of the Federation)
Shri Jai Shankar Kumar	Additional Secretary
Shri K.V. Subbarao	Asstt. Secretary General

Demand No.1: Cadre re-structuring –implementation of short term/long term plan.

Explanation:

National Audit Federation has been repeatedly demanding comprehensive cadre restructuring in IA&AD, since 2006. We have also submitted a detailed memorandum on 3rd October 2018 to the Dy. CAG in support of our demand. We had demanded creation of separate promotion channel (Non-IA&AS) for AO/SAO in order to neutralize the stagnation in the department and to provide career advancement to the cadre. We were happy when the CAG of India constituted a committee in January 2018 for cadre restructuring in Group B & C cadres. Though the committee was directed to submit its report within a period of two months, it is understood that the report has not been submitted so far (30-9-2018).

Further, a short term plan and a long term plan have been devised by the CAG office for implementation before and after 2020 respectively. While the long term plan provides for increase in sanctioned strength as well as person in position across all cadres, short term plan reduced the cadre strength. However, the meagre increase of strength in AO/Sr. AO cadre in few offices provided promotion to some AAOs. It is also felt that both the plans should be complementary to each other than contradictory. Reduction in strength for achieving the intended ratio of 1:2:2.5 among AO, AAO and Auditor and making it as sacrosanct is not a welcome step, especially when the number in the long run is to be augmented. Due to short term plan, more than 3000 posts were reduced in field offices and are experiencing acute shortage of staff and stagnation in Group B cadres. Work load in these cadres has increased manifold due to reduction in staff strength. Hence, we demand urgent implementation of long term plan to increase the staff strength in those offices where there is shortage of staff. As far maintenance of idealistic ratio of 1:2:2.5 is concerned, it may be achieved in long run by gradual process without downsizing the strength at this moment. We also seek to expedite the process of comprehensive cadre restructuring. The report of the cadre restructuring committee is under process.

Official response to the Demand:

DAI informed that the cadre re-structuring is under consideration and efforts are being made to expedite it. On rationalization, it was informed that implementation of short term plan is underway. The rationalization exercise is to be reviewed after implementation of the short term plan.

Demand No.2: Supervisor cadre-Regularize all temporary promotions, or create supernumerary posts to avoid reversions-treat at par with AAOs.

Explanation:

Due to dearth of staff in AAO cadres, the strength in Supervisor cadre in the field Audit offices was increased by 6 per cent of the sanctioned strength of AAO cadre as a temporary measure, in addition to the existing 4 per cent, taking total strength in Supervisor cadre to 10 per cent of the regular sanctioned strength of AAO. During an agenda meeting, DAI ensured that the temporarily promoted Supervisors would not be reverted and if necessary, creation of supernumerary posts would be considered. Later on due to rationalisation, sanctioned strength of AAOs in many field offices was reduced and temporarily promoted Supervisors were reverted. Reversion from any cadre will adversely affect the morale of the reverted employees and will only weaken them both mentally and financially. Hence, we demand regularization of all temporary posts (additional 6 per cent) in Supervisor cadre with retrospective effect. If this is not feasible, supernumerary posts may be created in order to avoid reversions.

Since the nature of work and scale of pay of both AAO and Supervisor are one and the same, we demand change in nomenclature of Supervisor cadre and to treat at par with AAOs.

Official response to the Demand:

The regular sanctioned strength of Supervisor cadre is fixed at 4% of total sanctioned strength of AAO cadre. Additional 6% of AAO cadre can be operated in the cadre of Supervisors as a temporary measure in offices where there is vacancy of more than 15% in the AAO cadre. The scheme itself provides that it is a temporary measure.

Only SAS examination qualified officials can be promoted as AAOs. Supervisor is a promotional post of Senior Auditors. Hence, the nomenclature of Supervisor cadre cannot be changed to AAOs.

This agenda item may be treated as closed.

Demand No.3.: DEO cadre-Allow promotion to mainstream cadre (Auditor /Accountant).

Explanation:

DEOs (Grade A) recruited directly were given assurances that they would be promoted to the next grade (DEO-Grade B) on completion of five years service. But in many offices, these assurances were not fulfilled due to want of vacancies. Hence, we had requested DAI to allow DEOs (Grade A) to appear in the Departmental Examination for Auditor/Accountant. In response to this, DAI informed us (23-11-2016) that in the revised Recruitment Rule, provision has already been made to allow DEOs (Grade A) to appear in the Departmental Examination for Auditor/Accountant and on notification of the same, DEOs will also become eligible to attend the Departmental Examination for Auditor/Accountant. But till date, the recruitment rules have not been notified and the benefit has not been given to the DEOs. It may also be noted that, as many of the MTS who joined service much later than the DEOs have already been promoted as Auditor/Accountant in field offices through departmental examinations. Hence, it is once again requested to expedite the process.

Official response to the Demand:

The distribution of DEO grade 'A' and 'B' is in the ratio of 80:20 and the EDP cadre has its own promotional channel from Grade 'A' to Grade 'G'. Moreover, DEOs are allowed to appear in SAS examination.

This agenda item may be treated as closed.

Demand No. 4.: Rajbhasha cadre-Career progression in line with Rajbhasha cadre-Stagnation in the cadres-Transfer Policies.

Explanation:

In Consequent upon implementation of the recommendations of Sixth Central Pay Commission, the Government of India notified revised pay structure for the Official Language Cadre belonging to Central Secretariat Official Language Service (CSOLS) vide OM dated 24/11/2008 and subsequent corrigendum dated 27/11/2008. Model Recruitment Rules for the various posts in Official Language Cadre for Subordinate Offices was also issued by the Government of India, Ministry of Personnel, PG & Pensions, DoPT vide OM dated 19/09/2013 and all Ministries/Departments were directed to review the existing rule and notify the revised rules conforming to the Model Recruitment Rules. These Rules provide smooth career prospects of staff in Rajbhasha cadre as shown below:

Sl. No.	Designation	Pay Scale
1.	Junior Translator	PB-2 GP Rs.4200
2.	Senior Translator	PB-2 GP Rs.4600
3.	Asstt. Director (OL)	PB-3 GP Rs.5400
4.	Dy. Director (OL)	PB-3 GP Rs.6600
6.	Jt. Director (OL)	PB-3 GP Rs.7600
7.	Director (OL)	PB-3 GP Rs.8700

It is understood that though the CAG has adopted the said Model Recruitment Rules, revision took place only in the RRs for Junior / Senior Translator cadres. It may also be noted that the issue of Rajbhasha cadre has not been included in the terms of references for the recently constituted Committee for Cadre Restructuring of Group 'B' and 'C' staff in IA&AD.

It is therefore, demanded that the Rajbhasha Cadre in IA&AD may also be reviewed on the basis of the Government of India directions and to expedite its implementation process without further delay.

Recently, option forms were obtained from these officials for considering their place of posting and are categorised under local/all India cadres. It is observed that the option forms were obtained from only those who were appointed prior to 2010. We therefore request that the option forms may be obtained from all officials for consideration in posting in various regions as a one time measure.

Official response to the Demand:

The Rajbhasha cadre posts are operated according to the functional requirements of the department. Recruitment after 2010 was made with all India transfer liability and the same was mentioned in the offer of appointment also. Hence, option cannot be considered for post-2010 appointees.

This agenda item may be treated as closed.

Demand No. 5: Departmental Examination.

Explanation:

1. Provide unlimited chances – Scheme of negative marking may be dispensed with – provide previous year's questions – Publish results/marks scored in each examinations immediately after completion of the examination.

Subordinate Audit/Accounts Service (SAS) Examination is the life line of Group 'B' & 'C' staff belonging to non-Gazetted cadres in IA&AD. It provides career advancement and sets the future for each employee. Passing of SAS examination has become more and more difficult now a days due to the introduction of negative marking scheme and limited number of chances. Hence, in-order to facilitate and motivate the aspirants for SAS Examinations, we demand that the negative marking scheme may be dispensed with, previous year's questions may be made available to the candidates for reference and unlimited chances may be allowed, at least for those with only 2 or 3 papers left for clearing the exam.

Computer Based Examinations are introduced in IA&AD for better transparency. But still the candidates are very much anxious on the transparency, due to the inordinate delay in publication of results. Hence, we demand for the publication of results/marks scored, immediately after the completion of examination.

As the other departmental examinations, viz., Incentive / RA /CPD examinations are conducted only to acquire/update knowledge of the staff, it is requested that the above mentioned demands in the case of SAS examinations shall be made applicable to these departmental examinations also.

2. SAS Preliminary / other departmental Examinations shall be MCQ method.

As the SAS examinations are now conducted with MCQ model on Computer Based environment, there is a genuine demand from the staff to conduct its preliminary test and all other departmental examinations also in similar Computer Based MCQ model. Hence, we demand for introduction of MCQ on Computer Based environment for all departmental examinations.

Official response to the Demand:

Ten chances (6 regular plus 4 additional) to qualify nine papers of SAS examination are adequate. Negative marking cannot be dispensed with to avoid guess work. Further, in an MCQ based examination, providing previous years question papers is not feasible.

SAS preliminary/other departmental examinations are conducted by field offices.

Declaration of the results immediately after the completion of examination is not possible due to the introduction of descriptive questions, the evaluation of which is not programme driven. Descriptive examination at this level is required to check the drafting skills of the candidates. However, efforts will be taken to expedite early declaration of results.

This agenda item may be treated as closed.

Demand No. 6: Recruitment of staff - introduce regional recruitment system in all entry cadres.

Explanation:

It is a positive sign that the department is regularly recruiting staff against vacancies in all the entry cadres. On the other hand, the centralized recruitment process through Staff Selection Commission is creating many issues in the field offices. Since many State Governments are following the respective regional languages as their official language, correspondences with state administrations and its understanding while performing Audit functions, is a major concern. Hence, we demand introduction of regional level recruitment in all the entry cadres. Otherwise, 'Knowledge of regional language' may be made compulsory for posting in a particular state.

Official response to the Demand:

The issue has been taken up with the Department of Personnel and Training and is under examination.

Demand No. 7: Transfer and Deputation policies:

Explanation:

Every year, many candidates are being recruited through SSC in DEO/Auditor/Accountant/AAO cadres. But, due to the centralised recruitment policy of the Government of India, many candidates are being posted in states other than their home states. This is adversely affecting their family obligations. Many are forced to stay away from their families. Hence, looking after aged and ailing parents in today's nuclear family set up has become a big issue. It is the moral and social responsibility of the employer to help its staff in minimizing these issues and to concentrate on their official obligations. Hence, we demand setting apart of 25 per cent of the total vacancies arising every year, for accommodating outstation staff by way of unilateral transfer.

This will not create any gap in the manpower availability and affect the working strength in any office. Allocation to various offices can easily be done through an automated web based application system to be installed in the server located in the headquarters office. Field offices may be allowed to input data from those applications as and when received at their end.

We also seek to issue directions to all field offices for strict compliance with GoI guidelines relating to transfer posting of officials on spouse ground in those offices where there are more than one office under the same Cadre Controlling Authority.

Official response to the Demand:

Unilateral transfers within IA&AD had been dispensed with since 1997. Unilateral transfer would result in huge vacancies in some offices and this would disrupt the functioning of the department. DoPT guidelines on spouse ground cases are followed in the department.

The agenda item may please be treated as closed.

Demand No. 8: UN audit – Dies-non without break in service shall not be treated as disqualification for UN audit assignments.

Explanation:

Officials on whom 'Dies-Non' was awarded in the past are not eligible for being considered for empanelment for the audit of UN and its agencies as per Hqrs. Office directions. Imposing lifelong ban for UN assignments on such employees having dies-non without break in service is denial of natural justice. Though it is a penal action taken by the administration for un-authorized absence from duty, it is not a major penalty. Hence, we seek to allow those employees having dies-non without break in service for applying assignments like UN Audit

Official response to the Demand:

The issue has been noted for consideration. Action/decision taken will be communicated.

Demand No. 9: Grant pay protection to those joining in lower cadres after availing technical resignation from posts carrying equal or higher pay levels.

Explanation:

As per Government of India orders dated 17-06-1965, the resignation is treated as a technical formality where a Government servant has applied through proper channel for a post in the same or some other department, and is on selection, required to resign the previous post for administrative reasons. The resignation will be treated as technical resignation if these conditions are met, even if the government servant has not mentioned the word "Technical" while submitting his resignation. Government of India also allowed pay protection, eligibility of past services for reckoning of the minimum period for grant of Annual Increment in case of Technical Resignation vide OM dated 17-08-2016 (para 2.4).

Further, Honourable High Court of MP has upheld the above directions of the GoI while dismissing a writ petition (17-07-2017) filed by the GoI against the orders of the CAT, Jabalpur dated 20-03-2017 (OA.NO. 202/01012/2015 dated 20-03-2017) in favour of Shri. Manoj Kumar Singh. In compliance of the above order, Pay in respect of Shri Manoj Kumar Singh, Auditor was refixed after reckoning the past service in Railways and protecting the pay drawn by him vide orders of the AG(G&SSA), MP, Gwalior dated 15-03-2018.

Applications of similarly placed officials from various field offices under the CAG of India have been turned down by the headquarters office stating that "this case may not be treated as a precedent". Considering the above, we request that the CAG should consider applications of similarly placed officials and direct the respective field offices to reckon their past services and to protect their pay in their previous employment.

Official response to the Demand:

The matter has been referred to DoPT.

Demand No. 10: Compassionate Appointments - re-visit evaluation procedure for short listing of applications for appointment.

Explanation:

Headquarters office vide circular No.34 dated 28-09-2016, circulated a seven point evaluation form and instructed all field offices to follow the revised evaluation system based on a number of parameters prescribed in the scheme with suitable weights assigned to each for consideration of the applicants eligibility. In the circulated seven point marking system, apart from grading for monetary benefits received, dependency and assessment of immovable property, item No. (vi) relates to assessment of any other jobs in the family and No. (vii) to ascertain the left over service of the deceased official as shown below:

Sl. No.	Particulars	Maximum Marks	Range	Marks to be provided
(vi)	Job	15	No job in family	15
			Job in family	0
(vii)	Service left	20	Less than 02 years	05
			02 years to less than 05 years	10
			05 years to less than 10 years	15
			10 years and above	20

Whereas, para 11 in the Consolidated Instructions on compassionate appointment issued by the Government of India, Department of Personnel & Training, vide OM No. F.No.14014/ 02/2012 --Estt. (D) dated 16th January, 2013 states that:

"11. WHERE THERE IS AN EARNING MEMBER

(a) In deserving cases even where there is already an earning member in the family, a dependent family member may be considered for compassionate appointment with prior approval of the Secretary of the Department/Ministry concerned who, before approving such appointment, will satisfy himself that grant of compassionate appointment is justified having regard to number of dependents, assets and liabilities left by the Government servant, income of the earning member as also his liabilities including the fact that the earning member is residing with the family of the Government servant and whether he should not be a source of support to other members of the family.

(b) In cases where any member of the family of the deceased or medically retired Government servant is already in employment and is not supporting the other members of the family of the Government servant, extreme caution has to be observed in ascertaining the economic distress of the members of the family of the Government servant so that the facility of appointment on compassionate ground is not circumvented and misused by putting forward the ground that the member of the family already employed is not supporting the family."

Hence, awarding '0' marks for 'job in family' of the deceased for consideration for compassionate appointment is totally wrong and against the interest of the scheme as envisaged in the above Government orders and to be excluded from the evaluation form.

Further, in the OM it is nowhere mentioned to compute the left over service of a deceased government employ for consideration of compassionate appointment to his/her dependant family member. Unilateral inclusion of the 'service left' clause by CAG is not in the better interest of the objectives of the scheme and intends to restrict employment of a family member of the deceased Government servant.

Hence, we demand exclusion of clauses at Sl. No. (vi) and (vii) from the revised evaluation system for short listing applications for appointment on compassionate ground.

Official response to the Demand:

The revised evaluation system was prepared in consonance with the guidelines issued by the Government of India. These guidelines provide objectivity in considering the compassionate appointment cases. The Committee is not to be guided only by the parameters listed. However, specific cases of deviation from the guidelines, if any, may be forwarded for examination.

The agenda item may please be treated as closed.

Demand No. 11: Granting of NFU for all employees who has completed four years of continuous service in level 8.

Explanation:

7CPC has recommended that, “all officers in organized accounts cadres (in the Indian Audit and Accounts Department, Defence Accounts Department, Indian Civil Accounts Organization, Railways, Post and Telecommunications) who are in GP 4800 should be upgraded, on completion of four years’ service to GP 5400 (PB-2), viz., Pay Level 9, in the pay matrix.”, (Para 11.12.140 of the report). Whereas, Government while implementing the above after much delay omitted the cadres of Supervisor, Hindi Officer, Welfare Assistant, etc., who are also placed in Pay Level 8. Denying the assured benefit is unjustifiable and injustice to those cadres. Hence, we demand that all employees who are drawing pay in level 8 in the new Pay Matrix shall be upgraded to Pay level 9 after completion of 4 years’ service as envisaged by 7CPC.

Though, NFU has been granted to AAOs, Assistant Accounts officers placed under Adhoc/Regular Temporary in A&E offices has not been upgraded even after putting more than 10 years service in the cadre.

Official response to the Demand:

Granting of NFU to Divisional Accounts Officer-I and Supervisor has been taken up with the Ministry of Finance.

Demand No. 12: Transit time: sufficient transit time may be granted for travel-exclude Saturday/Sunday/holidays.

Explanation:

Many field offices are compelling the Audit staff to travel on Sunday/ Holidays. In some offices, field audit parties are not allowed to claim TA/DA during weekends/holidays. In some offices, field audit parties are asked to report to respective headquarters forcefully during holidays. Transit time allowed for field audit parties also varies from office to office. Reports have been received from various offices that the staff are over burdened with work and due to compulsion are not able to bestow proper attention to their family. This is causing distraction in work as well as imbalances on their family life.

As per CAG's directions, Transit may not be provided on Sundays and other important holidays. Also One day transit shall be provided where journey is beyond 200 Km. The above provisions are also not followed in many field offices. Hence, we demand that directions may be issued to all field offices for maintaining a uniform policy in allowing transit time. It is also requested to direct the Accountants' General to permit field audit parties to either stay in camp with TA/DA or allow them to return to their residence during weekends/holidays.

Official response to the Demand:

In States, the week is of six working days and in Central units week is of five working days. The transit period is accordingly allowed for completing the objectives prescribed in the Annual Audit Plan. Audit programmes are made by field offices as per their functional requirement and in compliance with various rules. Specific instances where problem were encountered, if any, may be brought out for further examination.

The agenda item may be treated as closed.

Demand No. 13: Permission to conduct General Body meetings during lunch hour in O/o the AG (G&SSA), Odisha, Bhubaneswar.

Explanation:

Accountants' General in some field offices are not permitting the recognised associations to conduct normal General Body meetings during lunch hour even inside the allotted association rooms. A general body of an association is a formal meeting of its members with a minimum quorum, as per the approved constitution, to discuss the general issues of its members. It is the primary duty of every association to convene its general body meeting as and when necessary or at least twice a year. Hence, we demand that directions may be issued to all field offices to permit recognised associations for conducting their General Body meetings as and when necessary, during lunch hour in their allotted working space.

Official response to the Demand:

Associations are allowed to hold meetings during lunch hour in all offices in the department. Exceptions are due to local issues. The field Accountant Generals has the responsibility of ensuring that the office decorum is not affected. Therefore, such issues may be taken up with the Accountant General concerned.

The agenda item may be treated as closed.