## CHAPTER 7: AUDIT EFFECTIVENESS

### 7.1 Audit objections issued, settled and outstanding

During the year 2004-05, based on the results of test audit, a total of 14756 Audit objections were issued through Special letters, Part-I Audit Notes and Inspection Reports. Besides these, there was a carry forward of 25637 audit objections pertaining to the previous years. A total of 15456 Audit objections were settled during the year after the Railway Administrations recovered/ agreed to recover the amounts involved or initiated corrective/ remedial action. The balance 24937 audit objections outstanding as on 31 March 2005 involve financial irregularities amounting to Rs.9252.22 crore.

### 7.2 **Recoveries at the instance of Audit**

As a result of cases of undercharges in realisation of freight and other earnings, overpayments to staff and other agencies, non-recovery of dues of the Railway etc. brought to the notice of the Railway Administration during the year 2004-05, an amount of Rs.47.09 crore was recovered or agreed to be recovered. Out of this Rs.32.08 crore pertained to transactions which were checked by Accounts but the errors could not be detected by them. An amount of Rs.0.01 crore pertained to recoveries made by Railway Administration, as a result of further review done by them on the basis of audit objections. The Railways where more than Rs. one crore was recovered or agreed to be recovered at the instance of Audit are Southern (Rs.5.55 crore), Northern (Rs.5.30 crore), South Eastern (Rs.5.26 crore), East Central (Rs.3.94 crore) North Western (Rs.3.87 crore), Western (Rs.3.86 crore), South East Central (Rs.3.62 crore), North Eastern (Rs.3.10 crore), Eastern (Rs.2.78 crore), South Central (Rs.2.21 crore), Northeast Frontier Rs.1.59 crore), North Central (Rs.1.51 crore), West Central (Rs.1.48 crore) and Central (Rs.1.29 crore) Railways.

# 7.3 Response of the Ministry of Railways (Railways Board) to provisional paragraphs

In order to implement the recommendations of the Public Accounts Committee (PAC), Ministry of Finance issued instructions (June 1960) to send replies to draft audit paragraphs (provisional paragraphs) proposed for inclusion in the Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India within six weeks from the date of issue.

For this Railway Audit Report, 95 provisional paragraphs were issued. Replies to 13 provisional paragraphs have been received (December 2005).

### 7.4 Follow up on Audit Reports

To ensure the accountability of the executive on all issues dealt with in the Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India, the PAC had decided (1982) that the concerned Ministries/ Departments of the Government of India should furnish corrective/ remedial Action Taken Note (ATN) on all paragraphs contained therein.

Taking a serious view of the inordinate delays and persistent failures in furnishing ATNs within the prescribed time limit, PAC had desired in their Ninth Report (Eleventh Lok Sabha) presented to Parliament on 22 April 1997 that henceforth corrective/ remedial ATNs, duly vetted by Audit, on all paragraphs included in the Reports be furnished within four months after the Report is laid on the table of the Parliament.

The position of ATNs furnished by the Railway Board (September 2005) on the paragraphs included in the Reports of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India – Union Government (Railways) upto the year ended 31 March 2004 is given below:

Year	Total	No. of para on	No. of Paragraphs on which ATNs are pending				
	para.	para on which ATNs finalised	Not received	ATNs on which comments sent to Railway Board	ATNs finally vetted.	ATNs under verification by Audit.	Total
1994-95	77	75	0	0	2	0	2
1995-96	85	81	0	1	2	1	4
1996-97	95	93	0	1	1	0	2
1997-98	96	90	1	2	2	1	6
1998-99	106	91	3	6	5	1	15
1999-00	101	73	8	3	12	5	28
2000-01	101	81	5	8	6	1	20
2001-02	101	46	16	16	15	8	55
2002-03	110	19	21	16	32	22	91
2003-04	114	0	61	10	13	30	114
Total	986	649	115	63	90	69	337

ATNs in respect of 134 Paragraphs relating to the Reports for the year 1997-98 to 2003-04 have not been furnished at all (December 2005). Besides, 63 ATNs received for vetting by Audit are outstanding because adequate remedial action has not been taken. In 69 cases the action stated to have been taken is under verification by Audit.

New Delhi Dated:

#### (KANWAL NATH) Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General

Countersigned

New Delhi Dated:

### (VIJAYENDRA N. KAUL) Comptroller and Auditor General of India