

CHAPTER – III

PERFORMANCE REIVEWS

This chapter contains performance reviews on Functioning of Sadar/ Sub-Divisional Hospitals (3.1), Food Security and Distribution (3.2), Educational Development of SCs and STs (3.3), Implementation of Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (3.4) and Conservation of Tigers and Eco-Development (3.5).

HEALTH, MEDICAL EDUCATION AND FAMILY WELFARE DEPARTMENT

3.1 Functioning of Sadar/Sub-Divisional Hospitals

Highlights

Health care services are provided in the urban areas of Jharkhand through 12 Sadar hospitals, 15 Sub-divisional hospitals and three Medical Colleges and Hospitals. A review on the functioning of Sadar and Sub-divisional hospitals disclosed that quality health services could not be delivered due to inadequate budget provisioning, shortage of hospitals, inadequate infrastructure and shortage of medical and para-medical staff. Poor availability of medicines, supply of sub-standard medicines, non-availability of essential drugs, non-availability of equipment, out of order equipment and poor monitoring of the functioning of these hospitals also adversely affected the quality of health services rendered.

Government of Jharkhand spent only three per cent of its total Budget outlay on health sector in 2005 as against eight per cent recommended by National Health Policy (NHP), 2002. The per capita expenditure on health was also very poor in the State.

[Paragraph 3.1.6.1]

Rs 6.46 crore was unauthorisedly drawn by the officers other than the notified DDOs. Treasuries also failed to exercise the checks against such draws.

[Paragraph 3.1.6.4]

Against 22 districts and 33 sub-divisions in the State, only 12 Sadar hospitals and 15 Sub-divisional hospitals existed in the State.

[Paragraph 3.1.7.1]

Substandard medicines were administered to patients of Sadar Hospital, Hazaribagh; while in some other hospitals due to non-receipt of test report and absence of testing, possibility of administration of sub-standard medicines could not be ruled out.

[Paragraph 3.1.8.4]

Due to dilapidated hospital buildings and lack of hygiene in the hospital premises, bed occupancy rate was low. Basic diagnostic facilities were absent in most of the hospitals. In six test checked hospitals, 14 to 76 per cent of indoor patients left the hospital against medical advice (LAMA) due to poor infrastructure, non-availability of medicines etc. during 2001-06.

[Paragraphs 3.1.7.3, 3.1.7.4, 3.1.9.2, 3.1.9.3 and 3.1.9.6]

There was 26 per cent shortage in the cadre of medical officers while shortage of para-medical staff ranged between 20 and 30 per cent which adversely affected the delivery of medical and public health services.

[Paragraph 3.1.9.8]

Incinerators were not being used for the disposal of bio-medical waste and such waste was being dumped in open pits within hospital premises posing health risks to patients, staff, attendants and public.

[Paragraphs 3.1.10.1 and 3.1.10.2]

3.1.1 Introduction

In Jharkhand, 22 per cent of the population of the state resides in urban areas while 78 per cent lives in rural areas. Health Care services are provided in the State through 12 Sadar hospitals and 15 Sub-divisional hospitals in urban and semi urban areas. In rural areas, health services are provided through Referral Hospitals, Primary Health Centers, Additional Primary Health Centers and Health Sub Centers. Tertiary health services are provided throughout the state by three medical colleges and hospitals. The Government prepared its Health Policy in 2004. In its Mission Statement, Government of Jharkhand declared that it was determined to provide quality health care services, particularly for those in remote and difficult areas, in order to reduce morbidity and mortality.

3.1.2 Organisational set-up

The Secretary, Health and Family Welfare Department (H&FWD) is the Head of the Department. He is assisted by three Joint Secretaries, four Deputy Secretaries and five Under Secretaries. Though Health Directorate was formed in October 2004, it has not become operational as the Secretary is also performing the functions of the Director. The Superintendent is the Drawing & Disbursing officer (DDO) at the district level whereas at Sub-division level, Deputy Superintendent functions as DDO.

3.1.3 Audit objectives

The objectives of the Performance Audit were to assess whether:

- the budget allotment and expenditure towards health service sector was adequate and financial controls exist;
- sadar and sub-divisional hospitals in the State were adequate and the infrastructural facilities were satisfactory;

- medicines and diagnostic equipment were available and utilised effectively;
- quality of health care services provided by the Sadar and Sub-divisional hospitals were satisfactory;
- the system of disposal of biomedical waste was effective; and
- the efforts redeemed the Mission Statement and Health Objectives and also the effectiveness of the evaluation and monitoring mechanism.

3.1.4 Audit criteria

Audit adopted the following main criteria to arrive at audit conclusions:

- Adequacy of budgetary provisions in consonance with the Health Objectives and Mission Statement;
- Vision and Mission Statement of Department of Health, Government of Jharkhand, 2004 and National Health Policy, 2002;
- Norms for the purchase of medicines and equipment, stores and stocks;
- Medical Waste (Management and Handling) Rules, 1995; and
- Monitoring system.

3.1.5 Scope of Audit and methodology

A performance review of “Functioning of Sadar and Sub-divisional Hospitals” was conducted during March to August 2006, by test check of records of the office of Secretary, H&FWD, five* out of 12 Sadar Hospitals and four** out of 15 Sub-divisional Hospitals, covering the period from 2001-02 to 2005-06.

In addition, interviews were conducted with 49 *per cent* of patients admitted on the dates of interviews in Sadar hospitals, Chaibasa, Ranchi and Gumla and Sub-divisional hospital, Garhwa. Physical evidence was obtained by taking photographs and by joint physical verification of facilities available in the hospitals.

Entry conference was held in April 2006 with the Secretary, H&FWD where the objectives of audit were discussed. The audit observations were also discussed with the Secretary, H&FWD and all the audit observations were accepted in the exit conference held in November 2006. The audit findings are brought out in the succeeding paragraphs.

* Chaibasa, Dhanbad, Gumla, Hazaribagh and Ranchi.

** Chas, Garhwa, Latehar and Tenughat.

Audit Findings

3.1.6 Financial Management

3.1.6.1 Allotment and expenditure

Budget provision, release and expenditure during 2001-06 towards Health and Family Welfare Department were as under:

(Rupees in crore)

Year	Budget Provision	Allocation	Expenditure	Savings	Percentage
2001-02	60.00	48.25	47.23	1.02	2
2002-03	75.17	25.05	21.97	3.08	12
2003-04	82.53	73.62	37.46	36.16	49
2004-05	89.92	86.44	80.24	6.20	7
2005-06	231.54	181.70	143.67	38.03	21
Total	539.16	415.06	330.57	84.49	20

(Source: Appropriation Accounts)

It is seen from the above table that against the budget provision of Rs 539.16 crore, release of fund was only Rs 415.06 crore during 2001-06 of which the department could spend only Rs 330.57 crore. Savings during 2001-06 ranged between 2 and 49 *per cent*. This shows unrealistic budgeting and lack of control over expenditure. The irony of the savings lies in the backdrop of the fact that test checked hospitals did not have essential medicines (discussed in para 3.1.8.1).

National Health Policy, 2002, recommended that state health sector spending should be seven *per cent* of the Budget in 2005 and eight *per cent* by 2010.

The Government of Jharkhand (GOJ), however, could spend only three *per cent* of its total budget outlay (Rs 13279.94 crore) on the health sector in 2004-05. It was found that as compared to national average of Rs 200 in 2002, the per-capita expenditure on health in 2005-06, even after four years, was only Rs 178 which was very low.

3.1.6.2 Withdrawal of funds to avoid lapse of budget grant

In Sadar Hospitals, Chaibasa, Dhanbad, Hazaribagh and Ranchi, Rs 3.11 crore was drawn in advance during 2003-06 under the sub-heads "Machine and Equipment" and "Samagri Purtiyan" to avoid lapse of budget grant and parked in the bank as of November 2006 due to non-finalisation of purchase procedure.

In Hazaribagh, Ranchi and Gumla Sadar/Sub-divisional hospitals, Rs 15.47 lakh and Rs 17.51 lakh were drawn for purchase of X-ray and Ultra-sound machines respectively against pre-receipted bills during 2005-06 to avoid the lapse of budget grant.

Secretary, H&FWD allotted (March 2005) Rs 5.82 lakh to each Sadar and Sub-divisional hospital for purchase of medicines with the instruction to draw the funds and transfer them to respective district Reproductive Child

State health sector spending was only three *per cent* of the budget as against eight *per cent* recommended by National Health Policy, 2002

Rs 3.11 crore was drawn in advance to avoid the lapse of budget grant

Health (RCH) societies though RCH societies are not authorised to purchase medicines and the amount remained parked in RCH's accounts as of June 2006. Instead of allotment to 12 existing Sadar hospitals, the allotments were made to 22 Sadar Hospitals. Thus the allotment (Rs 58.20 lakh) to non-existing hospitals needs investigation.

3.1.6.3 Double drawal of diet money

Defalcation by Deputy Superintendent, Tenughat

In Tenughat hospital, Deputy Superintendent drew Rs 0.22 lakh under the subhead, "Diet" during March 2003. This amount was again drawn on the strength of the same bill for the same purpose and for the same period during 2004. This was a case of defalcation of Government money and action should be initiated against the guilty.

3.1.6.4 Drawal of funds by unauthorized officers

Rs 6.46 crore was irregularly drawn by officers other than the notified DDOs

In Sub-divisional hospitals Bokaro, Garhwa and Tenughat, Deputy Superintendents were notified as DDO and in Sadar hospital, Gumla, there was no notified post of Superintendent. Civil Surgeons of these districts drew funds amounting to Rs 6.46 crore during 2001-06 although they were not authorised to draw funds. Even the treasuries failed to exercise the required checks. No reason for such irregular drawals was furnished to Audit.

3.1.6.5 Other irregularities

44 to 100 per cent of expenditure was incurred during March against the norms of 35 per cent for last four months

During 2001-06 in Sadar hospitals, Chaibasa, Dhanbad, Gumla, Hazaribagh and in Sub-divisional hospitals, Garhwa, Latehar and Tenughat, though allotments for Medicine, Samagri Purtiyan, Machine and Equipment were available, expenditure ranging between 44 and 100 per cent was incurred only during the month of March of each year. This is in contravention of rules which specify that not more than 35 per cent of allotment was admissible to be drawn in the last four months of the financial year.

Executive Engineers did not furnish utilisation certificates of Rs 14.29 crore

In Sadar Hospital Dhanbad, Rs 14.29 crore was released to the Executive Engineer, Building Construction, Electric Works and Drinking and Sanitation divisions during 2001-06 for construction, renovation, electrification, facility for supply of drinking water and sanitation. But neither the progress of work done was reported/ monitored nor were utilisation certificates furnished by the concerned divisions. The progress of work done as of June 2006, therefore, could not be ascertained.

3.1.7 Adequacy of Hospitals and infrastructural facilities

3.1.7.1 Inadequate number of Sadar/Sub-divisional Hospitals

Only 12 out of 22 districts and 15 out of 33 sub-divisions had Sadar and sub divisional hospitals respectively

A district is the unit for setting up a Sadar Hospital and a Sub-division is the unit for setting up sub-divisional hospitals. In Jharkhand, there were 12 Sadar and 15 Sub-divisional Hospitals as against 22 districts and 33 Sub-divisions. Ten districts and 18 sub divisions have no hospitals. Thus, there was shortage of Sadar and Sub-divisional hospitals in the State. Though the

State Government had formulated its Health Policy, neither roadmap nor milestones to operationalise them were fixed.

3.1.7.2 Physical and Medical infrastructure

All hospitals need good infrastructure in terms of building with particular specifications for outdoor patients, operation theatres, rooms for X-ray, ultra sound, pathological tests, blood banks, wards, uninterrupted power supply, diagnostic and other medical equipment and compound wall for security etc. Scrutiny however, showed poor infrastructural facilities, as discussed in the succeeding paragraphs.

3.1.7.3 Bed capacity of hospitals

Sanctioned bed capacity and actual functional beds in hospitals during 2001-06:

Sl. No.	Name of hospital	Sanctioned bed capacity	Number of functional beds	Percentage of functional beds
1.	Sadar hospital, Hazaribagh	220	149	68
2.	Sadar hospital, Ranchi	217	90	41
3.	Sub-Divisional hospital, Latehar	20	12	60

It is seen from the above that in Sadar Hospitals, Hazaribagh and Ranchi and Sub-divisional Hospital, Latehar, functional beds were only 68, 41 and 60 *per cent* respectively of the sanctioned bed capacity. Reasons for hospitals functioning with lower bed capacity were attributed by the hospital authorities mainly to dilapidated buildings and lack of infrastructure.

3.1.7.4 Inadequate Diagnostic facilities

Basic diagnostic facilities were not available

Test check of the availability of basic diagnostic facilities showed that in Ranchi, Gumla, Chaibasa and Hazaribagh Sadar Hospitals and in Garhwa, Chas and Latehar Sub-divisional hospitals, the X-ray, Ultrasound machines, Electro Encephelo Gram (EEG) and Electro Cardio Gram (ECG) machines were either not available or purchased but not installed as of July 2006 as detailed in *Appendix-3.1*.

In Sadar hospital, Hazaribagh, Rs 0.98 lakh was drawn during 2001-02 for repair of the X-ray machine but the same was not repaired even after four years and thus remained idle. Similarly in Chas Sub-divisional Hospital, X-ray machine remained idle for want of repair since 2001.

Ultrasound machines worth Rs 5.24 lakh could not be utilised for want of radiologist and technicians

In Dhanbad and Chas, Ultrasound machines were purchased by Civil Surgeons at Rs 5.24 lakh each during 2003-04. The machine purchased for Sadar hospital, Dhanbad was installed in Primary Health Centre, Govindpur and the machine purchased for Chas hospital was not commissioned till June 2006. In reply, Civil Surgeon, Dhanbad stated that Sadar hospital, Dhanbad was not under his administrative control. Civil Surgeon, Bokaro stated that the machine could not be utilised for want of Radiologist and Technician.

In Sadar hospital, Dhanbad and Sub-divisional hospital, Chas, 10 and 8 Glucometers respectively were purchased (July 2004) without strips at a cost of Rs 0.59 lakh and Rs 0.48 lakh respectively and hence remained idle.

3.1.7.5 Non-functional Sexually Transmitted Disease (STD) clinic

STD clinic not functioning due to lack of doctors and non – installation of machines

Two machines for Sexually Transmitted Disease (STD) clinic valued at Rs 0.71 lakh were supplied (March 2005) to Sub-divisional hospital, Chas and Sadar hospital, Gumla by Project Director, State Aids Control Society. These machines were not installed even after more than a year of supply. One doctor was posted in Sub-divisional hospital, Chas for STD Clinic whereas no doctor was posted to Sadar hospital, Gumla. The machine worth Rs 0.71 lakh thus, remained idle and the expenditure towards pay and allowances became unfruitful.

3.1.7.6 Absence of blood bank

In view of the requirements of indoor and emergency patients, blood bank is an essential infrastructure in Sadar and Sub-divisional Hospitals. No blood bank existed in the hospitals of Chas, Garhwa, Gumla, Latehar, Ranchi and Tenughat. No norm was fixed by the Government for setting up of blood bank. In the absence of blood banks, critical service was denied to patients and they were compelled to purchase blood from distant places.

3.1.7.7 Interrupted power supply

Uninterrupted power supply is mandatory in the Sadar and Sub-divisional hospitals. It was, however, noticed that there were no generators in Chaibasa, Garhwa and Gumla hospitals to meet the contingencies of interrupted power supply. Generators were supplied in hospitals of Chas, Latehar, Ranchi and Tenughat, but could not be utilised for want of allotment of fund for fuel.

3.1.7.8 Non-availability of specialised treatment for serious and infectious diseases

Facility for specialised treatment was not available

Facility of specialized treatment for cancer, burn cases, mental health care, AIDS etc. was not available in any of the test checked hospitals. Even separate isolation wards for indoor patients suffering from infectious diseases did not exist in any of the test checked hospitals.

3.1.8 Medicine and diagnostic equipment

3.1.8.1 Non-availability of essential medicines

Essential medicines were not available in the hospitals for long periods

Keeping in view the guidelines suggested by the World Health Organisation (WHO), the medicine selection committee, headed by the Director General of Medical and Health Services identified a list of 79 essential medicines for secondary health care. It was noticed that in Chaibasa and Latehar Hospitals 65 (82 *per cent*) and 52 (66 *per cent*) out of 79 identified essential drugs were not available. In Gumla and Garhwa hospitals 11 and 17 essential drugs

were not available for periods ranging from 5 to 33 months and 3 to 54 months respectively during 2001-06.

3.1.8.2 Purchase of medicine without assessing requirement

In Chaibasa, Garhwa, Gumla, Latehar, Tenughat and Ranchi Hospitals, medicines purchased were less than the requirement during 2002-05. Patients suffered due to non-availability of medicines. However, medicines purchased in 2005-06 were 60 to 75 per cent in excess of requirement. Excess purchases could render medicines decreasing in potency and thus becoming useless or toxic for reasons of expiry.

3.1.8.3 Diversion of medicines to APHC/PHC/NGO

Although medicines were not surplus in the Garhwa hospital, 59 per cent of total stock of medicines, worth Rs 11.50 lakh, was stated to have been diverted during 2004-06 to various APHC/PHC/NGO without any indent from the respective units. As a result, some medicines remained out of stock in Garhwa hospital for the period ranging between 1 to 28 months. Also, the hospital authorities were unable to produce any proof of stock transfer or receipt. In the absence of proof of stock transfer and receipt, possibility of misappropriation of Rs 11.50 lakh could not be ruled out.

Medicines were diverted from Garhwa Hospital without any indent

3.1.8.4 Distribution of medicines without obtaining quality test report

State Drug Policy envisaged that each batch of medicines received should be tested immediately at the designated Government or private laboratories before its distribution to the patients.

Scrutiny showed that 77 samples were collected (2001-06) by the Drug Inspectors in Chiabasa, Dhanbad, Gumla, Hazaribagh and Ranchi hospitals. Of these, test reports for only 17 samples were received, that also after 6 to 34 months of their collection. Test reports of the rest 60 samples were not received as of June 2006, though medicines were distributed to the patients. The samples were never collected from Sub-divisional hospitals of Chas, Garhwa, Latehar and Tenughat (2001-06) for tests before distribution among patients.

Sub standard medicines were administered to patients

In Sadar hospital, Hazaribagh, 4000 Metronidazole tablets were collected by the Drug Inspector for quality test. However, 1000 tablets were distributed among patients without awaiting the test results. Subsequently the reports revealed that quality of the medicines was sub-standard. Thus, sub-standard medicine was distributed without obtaining quality test report. In other test checked hospitals also, the possibility of administration of sub-standard medicine could not be ruled out due to non-receipt of test report and non-testing of quality of medicine.

3.1.8.5 Loss in the absence of centralised rate approval

An X-ray machine of 500 MA was purchased by the Superintendent, Gumla at Rs 4.95 lakh whereas the Superintendent, Ranchi purchased the machine

Non-finalisation of centralised rate contracts resulted in excess expenditure of Rs 3.01 lakh

of same specifications for Rs 6.22 lakh. The excess expenditure of Rs 1.27 lakh could have been avoided had the department fixed the rate contracts centrally. Similarly, in Hazaribagh Sadar Hospital, ultrasound machine was purchased at Rs 7 lakh whereas a similar machine was purchased in Ranchi hospital at Rs 5.26 lakh resulting in extra expenditure of Rs 1.74 lakh.

3.1.8.6 *Physical verification of stock not undertaken*

Stocks of medicines and equipment were not regularly physically verified

Test check of stock registers of medicines and equipment revealed that the physical verification of Stores and Stock was not conducted regularly during 2001-06 in any of the test checked units.

3.1.9 Quality of Health Services

Health Policy was framed by GOJ in 2004 to focus Government efforts in the area of public health. The Health policy laid down areas of emphasis like health care systems, human resources development, programmatic and systemic interventions and the targets regarding public health which should be available to every person in the state. Although the Sadar and sub divisional hospitals are major instruments for delivering health services in the districts and sub divisions, GOJ had neither defined nor assigned any role to Sadar and Sub-divisional Hospitals in delivering quality health services to the people of the State.

3.1.9.1 *Non-fixation of norms*

Basic norms like patient/doctor ratio, doctor/ hospital ratio, population/ hospital ratio, population/bed ratio were not fixed. No guidelines were laid down for the proper functioning of these hospitals and for the disposal of medical waste generated by these hospitals. It is, therefore, imperative for the Government to fix norms and guidelines and to ensure the maintenance of basic records as these records will provide an insight into the adequacy and quality of health services being provided by these hospitals, lessons to be learnt and correctives to be effected, if required.

3.1.9.2 *Poor maintenance of hospitals*

Hospitals were poorly maintained and lacked basic facilities

While visiting Gumla, Garhwa and Chaibasa hospitals, indoor patients of male, female and surgical wards were interviewed by Audit. Patients stated that drinking water and proper sanitation facilities were non-existent, cleanliness was not maintained, bed sheets were not changed regularly, generator facility was not available and security was a problem. 20 to 50 *per cent* interviewed patients stated that no medicine was provided to them while others stated that medicines were only partially provided.

3.1.9.3 *Bed occupancy*

Poor bed occupancy due to lack of infrastructure, paucity of medicines, poor maintenance etc.

In Ranchi, Chas, Chaibasa, Dhanbad, Latehar and Tenughat hospitals, it was seen that the functional bed occupancy ranged between 11 and 87 *per cent*. Reasons for poor bed occupancy were attributed by the hospital authorities to lack of infrastructure facilities as well as paucity of funds for medicines.

Interviews of patients also indicated lack of infrastructure facilities and poor maintenance of hospitals which is shown in the photographs below:



Paying ward of Sadar Hospital, Ranchi



Paediatric Ward, Ranchi

3.1.9.4 Indoor Patients were deprived of diet

The State Government revised the rate of diet from Rs 3.55 to Rs 15 per day with effect from August 2001 to meet the dietary needs of the patients. Regular diet to the patients was to be provided by the hospitals from the funds allotted to them on the above rate.

Patients were denied regular diet

In Chas, Ranchi and Tenughat hospitals, 270 indoor patients during 2001-02, 2400 patients during 2003-06 and 127 patients during 2001-03 respectively were not provided regular diet. In addition, Rs 1.02 lakh, available for diet, was surrendered during 2001-02 in Chas hospital. Reasons for non-supply of regular diet were stated to be non-availability of suppliers.

3.1.9.5 Major surgery performed without anesthetist

No anesthetist was posted in Chaibasa and Gumla hospitals and major surgeries like Caesarean, Appendicitis etc. were performed without anesthetists.

3.1.9.6 Patients left hospitals against medical advice

In the hospitals of Chaibasa, Dhanbad, Garhwa, Gumla, Latehar and Ranchi, during 2001-06, 14 to 76 per cent of indoor patients test checked by audit left the hospital against medical advice (LAMA.). Details are as under:

Sl. No.	Name of unit	Number of patient admitted during 2001-06	Number of bed tickets test checked	Number of LAMA cases	Percentage of LAMA cases
1.	Chaibasa	14832	9473	1329	14
2.	Dhanbad	243472	29050	3947	14
3.	Garhwa	24845	22722	11014	48
4.	Gumla	13944	13944	6287	45
5.	Ranchi	19860	2817	1409	50
6.	Latehar	643	643	487	76
Total		317596	78649	24473	31

Patients left hospitals against medical advice

Reasons for LAMA cases were attributed by hospital authorities to inadequate infrastructure, inadequate distribution of medicine, poor maintenance of hospitals and shortage of para medical staff. Interviews with

patients also indicated that patients were leaving hospitals against medical advice due to poor maintenance of hospitals.

3.1.9.7 Misuse of ambulance services

Ambulance service is vital in the functioning of a hospital. Movement of serious patients is ensured by ambulance. It was noticed that no ambulance was available in Chaibasa and Gumla hospital. In the hospitals of Chas, Hazaribagh, Latehar, Tenughat and Ranchi, ambulances were available but only 3 to 53 *per cent* of total trips made by the ambulances were for carrying patients whereas 47 to 97 *per cent* trips made were for administrative purposes during 2001-06.

3.1.9.8 Poor manpower management

The State Government was not aware of the sanctioned strength and men in position in field units. However, the sanctioned strength and persons-in-position in the test checked hospitals as of June 2006 were as under:

Sl. No.	Category of personnel	Sanctioned strength	Person-in-position	Shortfall	Percentage of shortfall
1.	Deputy Superintendent	9	7	2	22
2.	Medical Officer/ Lady Medical Officer	87	64	23	26
3.	Nursing staff ¹	309	248	61	20
4.	Technicians ²	76	53	23	30
5.	Store Keeper/Clerks	43	39	4	9
6.	Driver	12	10	2	17
7.	Group 'D'	205	157	48	23
Total		741	578	163	22

Shortage of doctors and para-medical staff affected delivery of health services

It is seen from the above that there was shortage of 26 *per cent* in the cadre of Medical Officers and 22 *per cent* in the cadre of Deputy Superintendents while shortage of para-medical staff ranged between 20 and 30 *per cent*.

Expenditure of Rs 11.54 lakh on pay and allowances of irregularly appointed ophthalmic assistants

The State Government appointed 57 Ophthalmic Assistants in October 2004. The pay and allowances of the Ophthalmic Assistants were to be charged against the vacant posts of Lab Technician/X-ray Technician/ Pharmacist, if the posts of Ophthalmic Assistants were not vacant. Seven³ ophthalmic assistants were irregularly posted against the vacant posts of lab technicians and pharmacists though ophthalmic assistants could not perform the work of lab-technician/pharmacists. These irregular postings resulted in wasteful expenditure of Rs 11.54 lakh between October 2004 to June 2006.

¹ 'A' Grade Nurse, ANM, Dresser, Male Ward Attendant, Female Ward Attendant, Jr. / Sr. Tutor Sister, Health Educator, Vaccinator, Camp Co-ordinator, Sp. Cholera Worker.

² Lab Technician, Pharmacist, Sr. Asstt. Scientist, X-ray Technicians, Physiotherapist, Ophthalmist

³ Dhanbad (3), Gumla (2), Hazaribagh (1) and Latehar (1).

Doctors were posted in urban areas in excess of the sanctioned strength

Considering the inadequacy of health services in rural areas, the State Government appointed Medical Officers on contract basis for posting in rural areas (PHC, APHC, HSC etc.). However, 41⁴ of them were irregularly posted by respective Civil Surgeons in urban areas in six hospitals in excess of sanctioned strength. Reasons for irregular posting were not stated to audit.

3.1.10 Disposal of Bio medical waste

Biomedical Waste (Management and Handling) Rules, 1995 envisaged that no hospital should be allowed to function unless either incinerator was installed or other suitable measures for proper disposal of bio-medical waste were devised. It was, however, observed that incinerators were not installed in the test checked hospitals except in Dhanbad and Hazaribagh Sadar hospitals.

3.1.10.1 Incinerator was lying idle

Incinerator was not being used due to lack of fuel and shortage of staff

Incinerator of 50 kg per hour capacity was installed in Sadar hospital, Dhanbad at a cost of Rs 28.49 lakh during 2002-03. Purchase was made without assessment of the quantity of bio-medical waste being generated in the hospital. An annual maintenance charge of Rs 3.01 lakh was paid during 2002-04. It was noticed that the incinerator was used only for 11 hours during 2003-06. The utilisation of the incinerator was thus, abnormally low. In reply it was stated that machine could not be used to its full capacity for want of fund for fuel, shortage of staff and insufficient bio-medical waste.

In Hazaribagh hospital, though the machine was purchased in March 2006, it could not be installed as of June 2006. Further, it was seen that though the lowest rate as per tender was Rs 21.10 lakh, the incinerator was purchased at a cost of Rs 31.98 lakh from the highest bidder leading to extra expenditure of Rs 10.88 lakh. In reply it was stated that the machine was purchased at higher cost due to wide experience of the approved supplier. The reply was not acceptable as tenders were received only from the suppliers having wide experience in the field.

3.1.10.2 Bio-medical waste being dumped in hospital premises

Biomedical waste was being dumped in open pits in hospital premises

As per Ministry of Environment and Forest's notification, the option of deep pit burial is allowed only in towns with population of less than five lakh or in rural areas. Though population of Bokaro, Hazaribagh and Ranchi was more than five lakh, bio-medical waste was being dumped near the wards.

⁴ State RCH Office, Namkum, Ranchi (12) and Chas (6), Chaibasa (8) Gumla (4) Garwah (4) and Ranchi (7) Sadar and Sub-divisional Hospitals.



Biomedical waste dumped just five meters behind the Female ward – (Ranchi Sadar Hospital)

The picture of biomedical waste being dumped behind the ward in Ranchi Sadar hospital is shown above. The violation of statutory provisions was fraught with high risk to the health of the staff, attendants and patients of hospitals and also inhabitants of the cities.

3.1.11 Monitoring and Evaluation

Neither monitoring of hospitals was done nor were hospitals independently evaluated

One of the Health Objectives of the State Government is the establishment of an integrated health surveillance and Health Management Information System (HMIS) by 2005. It was, however, noticed that monitoring of health services provided by Sadar and Sub-divisional Hospitals in the State was not done at any level by the H&FW Department. On-line monitoring system was also not functional. In the absence of any monitoring mechanism, the Government was unable to provide any assurance regarding the adequacy or quality of health services.

3.1.11.1 Sensitivity to error signals

Despite several deficiencies such as shortage of health centers, lack of diagnostic services, lack of infrastructural facilities like building etc., non-availability of essential medicines, drawal of money against pre-receipted bills, lack of monitoring and evaluation mentioned in the Audit Report for the year ended 31 March 2004, no action had been taken by the Department to set right the deficiencies. Besides, the Health Directorate was also not operationalised, though, recommended in the same Audit Report. The State Government did not take adequate steps in terms of financial resources and health delivery instruments to meet the health needs of the people.

3.1.11.2 Lack of Documentation

Basic records like patient history cards, OPD register, OT logbook etc were not maintained

In the field units, the hospitals did not maintain history cards of patients which contain basic information like medicines administered to the patient. The hospitals had no log books to show the utilisation of operation theatre or

the utilisation of medical and diagnostic equipment like X-rays, Ultrasound etc.

3.1.12 Conclusion

The objective of providing quality and adequate health services to the people of the State could not be achieved due to financial mismanagement, shortage of Sadar and Sub-divisional hospitals and inadequate physical infrastructure like beds, machinery and equipment essential for proper functioning of the hospitals. Specialized treatment for cancer, burn cases, mental health, AIDS and infectious diseases was not available in Sadar/Sub-divisional hospitals resulting in denial of health services in respect of these diseases. The quality of health services provided was also poor as essential drugs were not available and medicines available in the hospitals were less than required (except in 2005-06) and were of sub standard quality. There was shortage of essential medical personnel like medical officers, para medical staff, nurses and technicians causing serious repercussions on the quality of services. Biomedical waste was not disposed as per norms raising issues of patient infection and threat to health of patients. There was no proper mechanism for monitoring the functioning of these hospitals and no norm or guidelines were set out to assess the effectiveness of functioning of Sadar and Sub-divisional hospitals. Hence, the objective of the Government of providing quality health services to the people of Jharkhand could not be achieved.

3.1.13 Recommendations

- Adequate number of Sadar and Sub-divisional hospitals should be established and made operational to cover the entire population of the State and facilities for specialized treatment for cancer, AIDS and other diseases should be provided by the Sadar hospitals.
- The hospitals should devise a mechanism to ensure that test reports are received before distribution and administration of medicines.
- Infrastructure should be improved in hospitals with stress on providing beds, essential medicines, equipment and machines which are vital to the functioning of the hospitals.
- Norms regarding disposal of bio medical waste need to be strictly adhered to in order to obviate risks to health.
- A feedback mechanism from patients on quality and adequacy of health services in the hospitals should be instituted, including the follow up action on the same, in a time bound manner.

The above points were reported to the Government (September 2006); reply has been received (November 2006). The Government accepted all the audit observations and recommendations and instructions were issued for taking corrective measures, wherever necessary.

FOOD, CIVIL SUPPLIES AND CONSUMER AFFAIRS DEPARTMENT

3.2 Food Security and Distribution

Highlights

The Government's food management strategy involves the implementation of a well targeted and properly functioning Public Distribution System as an instrument for providing food security for the poor by making available food grains at affordable prices. A performance review on "Food Security and Distribution" revealed that the basic objective of ensuring food security amongst poorest section of the population remained largely unfulfilled due to shortfall in identification of beneficiaries under TPDS, AAY and non-categorization of Primitive Tribal Groups as AAY. The scheme was plagued by short allotments, surrendering of allotted fund, not lifting the allotted quantity of food grains from Food Corporation of India (FCI), shortfalls in issue of new ration cards and no weeding out of bogus cards. Quality of food grains distributed by FPSs was not tested before distribution to ensure that it met the standards of Fair Average Quality. The review also revealed that no action had been taken on the deficiencies reported in previous Audit Reports. The salient points of the review are as under.

Beneficiaries were not identified after 1997. No survey was conducted for identification of urban BPL households. Thus, 5.82 lakh households remained uncovered under the TPDS.

[Paragraph 3.2.6.1]

In the six test checked districts, 37 per cent of families were availing the benefit of BPL Scheme though not enlisted in the BPL register. In four test checked districts, 54 per cent of Primitive Tribal Groups families were not receiving benefit of AAY as they were not categorised as AAY by the State Government despite the directions of the Supreme Court. 48,604 beneficiaries in Ranchi were holding both BPL and AAY cards.

[Paragraphs 3.2.6.2, 3.2.6.3 and 3.2.6.5]

Short lifting of food grains from FCI affected the implementation of the scheme. Of the total allotment by GOI, only 42 to 77 per cent of wheat and 10 to 33 per cent of rice were lifted under BPL, while 35 to 92 per cent of wheat and 35 to 88 per cent of rice were lifted under AAY during 2001-06.

[Paragraph 3.2.7.1]

Undue benefit of Rs 2.46 crore was extended to Bihar State Food & Civil Supplies Corporation due to fixing of excess transportation and handling charges by Rs 1.85 per quintal on wheat during 2001-06.

[Paragraph 3.2.7.3]

Release orders for 3,973 quintals of wheat and 4,188 quintals of rice in excess of requirement valuing Rs 44 lakh under TPDS Scheme were made without the knowledge of district administration. Possibility of diversion of this in open market can not be ruled out.

[Paragraph 3.2.7.4]

Excess subsidy of Rs 2.20 crore was paid to FCI due to non-verification of actual lifting of rice by the Government.

[Paragraph 3.2.7.6]

Ration cards were not issued to 16 per cent of 1,82,313 BPL households in Hazaribagh and 41 per cent of 1,79,529 BPL households in Daltonganj.

[Paragraph 3.2.8]

3.2.1 Introduction

The food management strategy of the Government involves the implementation of Targeted Public Distribution System (TPDS) which is a major instrument for providing food security for the poor by making available food grains at affordable price. In June 1997, the Government streamlined the earlier PDS into TPDS by issuing special cards to the Below Poverty Line (BPL) families and providing food grains to them at specially subsidised prices. The Scheme required identification of the poor and delivery of food grains to them through FPSs in a transparent and accountable manner. TPDS also covered the Above Poverty Line (APL) population, although the Central Issue Prices (CIP) for APL beneficiaries were kept higher than BPL beneficiaries.

The central scheme “Antyodaya Anna Yojana” (AAY) was launched in the State in December 2000 for the poorest of the poor families to provide them food grains at more subsidised rates.

3.2.2 Organisational set-up

The Commissioner cum Secretary, Food, Civil Supplies and Consumer Affairs Department was in overall charge of managing TPDS and AAY in the state. He was assisted by a Special Secretary, two Deputy Secretaries and two Under Secretaries. At the district level, District Supply Officer was the nodal officer for the PDS network. Marketing Officers (MO)/Block Supply Officers (BSO) and Supply Inspectors assisted him. Besides this, there were three special Rationing Officers for Dhanbad, Jamshedpur and Ranchi urban areas. Bihar State Food and Civil Supplies Corporation (BSFC) lifted food grains from the depots of FCI in Jharkhand and transported it to its godown for further distribution to FPSs through its district offices

3.2.3 Audit Objectives

The main objectives of this performance audit were to assess whether:

- the targeted beneficiaries were identified transparently;

- allotment, lifting and distribution arrangements of Government were adequate to ensure that all people had access to food grains and they actually got it when needed;
- ration cards covered the entire population of the State for the purpose of providing food security to all;
- periodic reconciliation of stocks took place by the State Government with BSFC and FPS; and
- monitoring and evaluation mechanism was effective.

3.2.4 Audit criteria

The following audit criteria were adopted for the performance audit review:

- Identification criteria for the categorization of beneficiaries and Census of India 2001.
- Guidelines of the schemes issued by the Government of India (TPDS and AAY) and PDS Control Orders;
- Existence of records relating to issue of ration cards;
- guidelines for the functioning of BSFC and Financial Rules of the Government of Jharkhand; and
- monitoring mechanism in place.

3.2.5 Scope and Methodology of audit

The performance audit on food security and management of food grains during 2001-06 was carried out through test check of records of the Secretary, Food and Civil Supplies, Government of Jharkhand, the Deputy Commissioner (Supply Wing) as well as District Managers, Bihar State Food and Civil Supplies Corporation (BSFC) of the six sampled districts⁵, 18 blocks and 72 fair price shops (FPS) during April to September 2005 and August 2006.

Entry Conference was conducted in April 2005 with the Secretary of the Department where the audit objectives, audit criteria and the methodology being adopted were explained. Under each district, three blocks were selected for audit (Urban: one, Rural: two) by Simple Random Sampling Without Replacement method including four FPS in each selected block. The results of review are brought out in the succeeding paragraphs.

⁵ **Daltonganj**- Daltonganj Sadar, Chainpur, Satbarwa; **Dumka**- Dumka (Sadar), Kathikund, Shikaripara; **Gumla**- Gumla Sadar, Palkot, Sisai; **Hazaribagh**- Hazaribagh Sadar, Ichak, Katkamsandi ; **Ranchi**- Burmu, Kanke, Ranchi Sadar; **West Singhbhum**- West Singhbhum (Sadar), Jhinkpani, Noamundi.

Audit findings

3.2.6 Identification of beneficiaries

3.2.6.1 Beneficiaries data

Accurate, adequate and transparent identification of different categories of beneficiaries is the key to the success of TPDS and AAY. Further, no deserving beneficiary should be left outside the ambit of TPDS/AAY.

Beneficiaries were not identified after 1997. No survey was conducted for identification of urban BPL households. 5.82 lakh households remained uncovered

It was noticed that the department implementing TPDS, *i.e.*, Food and Civil Supplies Department did not conduct any survey to identify BPL/AAY households in the state. Instead, beneficiaries were covered under TPDS based on a survey conducted by the Rural Development Department (RDD) in 1997. According to survey conducted by RDD only in rural areas in 1997, there were 23.94 lakh BPL families in Jharkhand. No survey was conducted in the urban areas to identify BPL/AAY population. A separate survey was to be conducted for identification for urban BPL households, but the same had not yet been conducted, except in Ranchi. Thus, the number of beneficiaries covered under TPDS was underestimated as urban BPL/AAY families had been left uncovered. Also, the survey was conducted by RDD in 1997 and was valid for the period 1997-2002 but no survey has been conducted since then.

It was also noticed that as per Census (2001), 29.76 lakh households in the State were categorized as BPL. However, allotment of food grains from the GOI was received only for 23.94 lakh households. Thus, 5.82 lakh households in the State were not covered.

Thus, the data on which the beneficiaries were identified and categorized was old and, therefore, did not accurately reflect the numbers of BPL and AAY. Due to lack of accurate and current data, major irregularities and deficiencies in selection of beneficiaries resulting in denial of benefit to eligible beneficiaries and undue benefit to other beneficiaries were noticed as mentioned in the succeeding paragraphs.

3.2.6.2 Extension of benefits to BPL families

Out of 160 beneficiaries test checked, 23 per cent did not fulfill the norms for qualifying as BPL

In Ranchi urban area, BPL families were identified on the basis of a survey conducted by Ranchi Municipal Corporation. The list of BPL beneficiaries along with original survey documents disclosed that out of 160 beneficiaries test checked, 23 per cent had average annual income of more than Rs 22,400 which was the cut off income fixed by Planning Commission for categorization as BPL family. Food grains valuing Rs 4.10 lakh were distributed during 2001-06 among ineligible beneficiaries.

37 per cent ineligible households were receiving undue benefit

TPDS covers only BPL families. In the six districts, names of 892 households (37 per cent) out of 2,412 households test checked did not find mention in the BPL register. Food grains worth Rs 98.82 lakh were distributed during 2001-06 among such ineligible beneficiaries. Similarly, in the six sampled districts,

29 per cent of 4,690 families, not falling under the category of AAY families, were receiving benefit of Scheme

29 per cent of 4,690 families test checked, not listed in the BPL register, were receiving benefit under AAY scheme. Food grains worth Rs 69.36 lakh were, thus, distributed during 2001-06 among ineligible beneficiaries.

In Daltonganj, 17,948 ration cards were distributed in excess of APL households in eight blocks⁶. On verification, 8,331 ration cards were cancelled but 9,617 cards remained to be cancelled.

3.2.6.3 Benefit to Primitive Tribal Groups

54 per cent of 4,440 PTG families were not categorised as AAY and were not receiving benefit under the scheme

As per the direction of Supreme Court, the State Government is to ensure that all Primitive Tribal Groups (PTG) are covered under AAY. In Dumka, Daltonganj, Gumla and Hazaribagh, 54 per cent of 4,440 PTG families test checked were not categorized as AAY and were, thus, denied of benefit due to them.

3.2.6.4 Deletion of families from BPL list

3,497 beneficiaries were deleted from original BPL list without the required ratification of Gram Sabha

As per guidelines of Government of India, any deletion from the list of BPL families must be ratified by the respective Gram Sabha. In West Singhbhum, the initial BPL list contained 1,74,537 families. Deputy Commissioner of the district conducted a fresh survey in 2001-02 to weed out ineligible beneficiaries and deleted 3,497 beneficiaries from original BPL list without the ratification of the Gram Sabha concerned.

3.2.6.5 Likelihood of getting benefits under both TPDS and AAY

4,8604 beneficiaries were holding both BPL and AAY cards since February 2002

From the existing BPL card holders in Ranchi district, 99,140 AAY cards were distributed among the eligible beneficiaries. As AAY beneficiaries are selected from the existing BPL list, identical number of BPL cards (99,140) should have decreased. The decrease of BPL cards was only 50,536 (51 per cent). The chances, therefore, of getting benefits under both the schemes to 48,604 families, instead of only one, could not be ruled out. However, this could not be verified, in the absence of list of BPL/AAY beneficiaries and BPL survey register, whether these beneficiaries were getting food grains under both the schemes.

3.2.7 Allotment, lifting and distribution of food grains

Being a food deficit state, no procurement was made by the State Government. Government of India (GOI) allocates and supplies the food grains to FCI and also determines its issue price under different schemes, transportation and handling charges, storage charges, subsidy payable to the FCI, etc. Food grains are lifted from the godowns of FCI by BSFC for their godowns from where it is supplied to FPSs which sells the food grains to card holding households. For BPL category under TPDS, issue price including transportation and handling charges, is realisable from the consumers. Under

⁶ Bishrampur, Daltonganj urban, Daltonganj block, Hariharganj, Hussainabad urban, Hussainabad block, Lesliganj and Satbarwa,

AAY, transportation and handling charges are borne by the State Government. No food and civil supplies corporation has been set up by the State. Therefore, payment for transportation and handling charges for food grains is made to an agency which is not a part of the Jharkhand Government.

3.2.7.1 Short lifting of food grains

On receipt of district wise allotments from the Secretary, Food, Civil Supplies and Consumer Affairs Department, BSFC lifted rice and wheat from FCI through its district offices. During 2001-06, as against the allotment of 16.79 lakh MT of wheat and 20.42 lakh MT of rice under BPL category by GOI, BSFC had lifted and shown distributed 9.88 lakh MT of wheat and 5.08 lakh MT of rice respectively. Similarly, as against the allotment of 4.32 lakh MT of wheat and 4.75 lakh MT of rice under AAY category, BSFC had lifted and shown distributed 3.42 lakh MT of wheat and 3.70 lakh MT of rice respectively during 2001-06. Allotment and distribution of wheat and rice under BPL and AAY categories at State level during 2001-06 is detailed in **Appendix- 3.2.**

Short lifting of wheat ranging from 23 to 58 per cent and rice ranging from 67 to 90 per cent under BPL

There were consistent shortfalls in lifting of both wheat and rice under BPL and AAY. Under BPL, lifting of wheat ranged between 42-77 per cent during 2001-06 whereas lifting of rice ranged between 10-33 per cent during the same period. Lifting of wheat under AAY ranged between 35-92 per cent during 2001-06 whereas for rice was between 35-88 per cent. Non-availability of food grains in FCI godowns and marginal difference in the prices of grains available in the market and in FPSs were the main reasons attributed by the State Government for short lifting of food grains. The reply was not acceptable as the difference in prices in market and FPSs was large, rather than marginal.

In the test checked districts, 2,61,986 MT of wheat and 5,73,996 MT of rice was short lifted against allotment of 7,11,442 MT of wheat and 8,25,735 MT of rice respectively. Similarly, in case of AAY, 37,647 MT of wheat and 45,791 MT of rice was short lifted against allotment of 1,83,479 MT of wheat and 2,03,032 MT of rice respectively. Reasons for such short lifting were attributed by district authorities to irregular supply of food grains by BSFC.

3.2.7.2 Less distribution of food grains

Initially, 10 kgs of food grains per BPL family per month were to be distributed through FPS under TPDS. This was increased to 20 kgs per family per month from April 2000 and again revised to 35 kgs per family per month from April 2002. The State Government launched AAY in August 2001 for distribution of food grains to the poorest among the poor families covered under TPDS. Under AAY, 25 kgs of food grains per family per month was raised to 35 kgs per family per month from April 2002 and wheat and rice were distributed at Rs 2 and Rs 3 per kg respectively.

In 2005-06, the State Government distributed only 17.08 kgs of food grains per BPL family per month against the provision of 35 kgs. Under AAY, only

30.66 kgs of food grains per month per family, as against 35 kgs of food grains per month per family, were distributed. Although there were regular allotments, no lifting of food grains was made under APL category.

3.2.7.3 *Extra burden on BPL families and the State Government and undue benefit to BSFC*

Higher rate included in the issue price of wheat, was paid by BPL families and also resulted in undue benefit to BSFC

Charges on transportation, handling, storage, godown rent and administrative expenses were to be paid by the State Government to BSFC under AAY. State Government fixed the charges for wheat at Rs 29.15 per quintal and for rice at Rs 27.30 per quintal. The reasons of difference in rates for wheat and rice were not on record. As the charges were included in the issue price for BPL, higher rate was paid by the BPL families for the wheat. This resulted in extra burden of Rs 1.83 crore on BPL families for purchasing 9,88,145 MT of wheat during 2001-06. Similarly under AAY, excess burden of Rs 63.18 lakh was borne by the State Government. Thus, undue benefit of Rs 2.46 crore was extended to BSFC due to fixing of excess transportation and handling charges etc. by Rs 1.85 per quintal on wheat during 2001-06.

3.2.7.4 *Excess procurement of Release Orders for food grains*

Excess payment of Rs 63.18 lakh was made to BSFC by the State Government

After food grains are allotted to dealers of FPSs by the Block Supply Officers (BSO), dealers are required to submit drafts equal to the value of the food grains allotted to them. These drafts are to be forwarded by the BSO to District Manager (DM), BSFC. DM, BSFC purchases release orders (ROs) from FCI for food grains against the drafts forwarded by BSO and then issues Stock Issue Orders (SIOs) for lifting of food grains by the dealers of FPSs for TPDS. In Gumla (August 2002), Hazaribagh (April 2004 to July 2004) and Ranchi (April 2004 to November 2004) 291 drafts valuing Rs 44.00 lakh were sent to the DM, BSFC without the forwarding letter of the BSO which meant that these drafts were not deposited by the dealers. This resulted in excess procurement of ROs for 3,973 quintals of wheat and 4,188 quintals of rice worth Rs 44 lakh. Also, SIOs of food grains worth Rs 44 lakh, at BPL rates, were found to have been issued. Since the food grains did not reach the FPSs or the TPDS network, possibility of diversion of the food grain to the open market and misappropriation of the difference in the issue prices of the FPSs and the market prices of wheat and rice can not be ruled out.

3.2.7.5 *Purchase of food grains in excess of requirement under AAY*

210.76 MT wheat and 1318.95 MT rice were purchased in excess of requirement of FPS dealers for AAY scheme

In West Singhbhum (2004-05), Dumka (2001-06) and Gumla (2001-06), the drafts deposited for procurement of wheat and rice under AAY were for 30,941.42 MT of wheat and 18,135.43 MT of rice. Against this, DM, BSFC purchased ROs from FCI for 31,152.18 MT of wheat and 19,454.38 MT of rice. Thus, 210.76 MT of wheat and 1318.95 MT of rice worth Rs 43.78 lakh at AAY issue rate were purchased in excess of requirement of FPSs for AAY. The possibility of diversion of these food grains to the open market was very high.

3.2.7.6 Special scheme introduced by the State Government

Full quota of specially subsidised BPL rice was not lifted and 72 per cent of the allocated fund was surrendered. Excess special subsidy of Rs 2.20 crore was paid and no action initiated to recover it

Just before the elections, the State Government launched a special programme for BPL beneficiaries for providing rice to them at AAY rate (Rs 3 per Kg, compared to Rs 6.15 per Kg) from December 2004 to March 2005. FCI was to be specially subsidized for the difference in issue rates of BPL and AAY. The subsidy was fixed at Rs 315 per quintal payable by the State Government to FCI on the quantity actually lifted. It was noticed that in Daltonganj, Gumla, Hazaribagh and Ranchi districts, against the actual lifting of 42,531.71 quintals of rice, the State Government paid for 1,12,414.95 quintals. Failure on the part of the State Government to verify the actual lifting resulted in excess payment of Rs 2.20 crore. The State Government did not initiate (September 2006) any action to recover the excess payment. The Secretary allotted Rs 25 crore to all the 22 districts to run this special scheme. Audit found that 72 per cent of the allotment was surrendered by the district administration. This resulted in savings while the poor did not derive the due benefit.

3.2.7.7 Diversion of food grains

Food grains are issued free of cost under Annapurna scheme. Secretary, GOJ curtailed the allotment of BPL rice by 17,407.32 MT worth Rs 10.71 crore during 2005-06 and diverted it to Annapurna scheme for meeting the requirement of enhanced number of Annapurna beneficiaries. No reason for such diversion was furnished by the Department.

1980 MT food grains worth Rs 89 lakh, under the TPDS Scheme and 220 MT food grains worth Rs 5.34 lakh under AAY of Dumka district were diverted to Jamtara and Deoghar districts. No proof of receipt in the diverted districts however, existed

During 2001-04, against the allotment of food grains for Dumka, the DM, BSFC diverted 1980 MT food grains worth Rs 89 lakh (BPL rate) and 220 MT food grains worth Rs 5.34 lakh (AAY rate) to Jamtara and Deoghar. The diversion of 220 MT of food grains was in addition to the allotments for Deoghar and Jamtara. Neither Dispatch Report of lifting-in-charge, Dumka nor Arrival Reports of godown-in-charge, Deoghar and Jamtara were found available in the offices concerned. Therefore, actual receipt of food grains in these godowns could not be ascertained in audit. Consequent to this diversion, not only programme implementation suffered in Dumka, misappropriation also could not be ruled out.

AAY suffered due to transfer of food grains to TPDS

Food grains attract higher subsidy under AAY than under BPL. In the districts of Dumka, West Singhbhum, Gumla and Hazaribagh, godown managers issued food grains meant for AAY to BPL as per book transfers in 2004-05. Total food grains diverted from AAY to BPL scheme was worked out to be 1683.4 MT of wheat and 1673 MT of rice. Since this diversion was from food grains attracting higher subsidy (AAY) to lower subsidy (BPL), BSFC unduly earned Rs 80.53 lakh.

Irregular transfer of 567.4 MT of food grains meant for BPL & AAY was made to jails

Separate allotment of food grains to district jails was not made as the allotment of food grains made under APL category could be used for supply to jails. However, in West Singhbhum, Gumla and Hazaribagh, DM, BSFC transferred 567.4 MT of food grains meant for BPL and AAY to jails instead of transferring to the district jails, food grains meant for APL during 2001-05.

BSFC unduly earned Rs 23.47 lakh, as the rate approved by Inspector General (Prison) for the purchase of food grains for supply to jails was even higher than the APL rate.

AAY & TPDS suffered due to diversion of food grains from these schemes to SGRY and Mid-day meal Scheme

In Dumka, godown managers irregularly diverted food grains meant for AAY and BPL to SGRY and Mid Day Meal scheme during 2004-05. The diverted food grains were not recouped and, therefore, the implementation of AAY and BPL scheme suffered. Total un-recouped quantity of food grains was worked out to be 263.8 MT valued at Rs 12.04 lakh.

3.2.7.8 Creation of backlog in distribution of food grains

Beneficiaries were deprived of timely supply of food grains and forced to purchase at higher rates from the open market

In West Singhbhum and Dumka, 44,887 quintals of food grains worth Rs 2.33 crore (at BPL rate) were not issued to FPSs between March and August 2005. Reasons for this backlog were stated to be irregular supply of food grains by FCI. Consequent to this backlog, BPL beneficiaries were not distributed food grains on time and made to take avoidable recourse to purchase from the market at higher prices. Similarly, in respect of AAY beneficiaries, 59,082 quintals of food grains worth Rs 1.42 crore (at AAY rate) were not issued to FPSs between March and August 2005. Thus, AAY beneficiaries were also deprived of timely distribution of food grains and made to take avoidable recourse to purchase from the market at higher prices. Since the AAY beneficiaries do not have the purchasing power to lift the backlog after six months in one go, the possibility of the food grains having been diverted to the market and misappropriation of the difference between the prices of TPDS/AAY and market was very strong.

3.2.8 Distribution of ration cards

Scheme guidelines envisage that distinct ration cards for different categories of households should be issued by the district authorities. Red ration cards were to be issued for BPL categories whereas yellow ration cards were to be issued to AAY households. Benefits under BPL and AAY can be availed of at Fair Price Shops (FPSs) only on production of these ration cards. It was noticed that the distribution of ration cards was not made as per guidelines. Significant points noticed are as under:

- At the state level, no records were available to show the total number of ration cards distributed under different categories. In the absence of centralized figures of distributed ration cards, it could not be ascertained in audit whether each eligible beneficiary was provided a ration card which was essential for availing of food security.
- In West Singhbhum, 35,120 beneficiaries categorized under AAY in August 2001 were issued the yellow coloured cards after a delay of 17 months.

In Hazaribagh district 16 per cent and in Daltonganj district 41 per cent BPL house holds deprived of benefit of the scheme

- In Hazaribagh, total number of BPL households was 1,82,313. Only 84 per cent of the BPL families were issued red ration cards. Thus, 16 per cent did not receive red ration cards, denying them the intended benefit of TPDS.

In Daltonganj, total number of BPL households was 1,79,529. Only 1,06,258 (59 per cent) beneficiaries were issued red or yellow ration cards. Thus, 41 per cent beneficiaries had not been issued either red or yellow ration cards denying them the intended benefit.

3.2.9 Reconciliation of stocks and maintenance of records

3.2.9.1 Reconciliation of accounts of food grains

Stocks allotted were being lifted from FCI godowns by BSFC and transported to FPSs in the different districts of the State. The State Government pays BSFC for handling and storing of food grains received from GOI under AAY scheme.

No reconciliation of food grains received from BSFC by the FPSs in the different districts in Jharkhand was done. In addition, at the secretariat level, the Government is unaware of the payment being made to BSFC for handling and storage of foodgrains under AAY scheme.

Discrepancy of Rs 6.19 crore in accounts of BSFC and MO/BSO was not reconciled

For the districts of Daltonganj, Hazaribagh and Ranchi, BSFC had shown issue of 1,18,016.09 MT of food grains under BPL category of TPDS and AAY to FPSs during 2004-06. The MOs/ BSOs reported total lifting of food grains by the FPSs as 1,05,843.43 MT for the same period. The discrepancy between the two sets of figures has not been reconciled and the possibility of diversion of 12,172.66 MT food grains worth Rs 6.19 crore to open market could not be ruled out (*Appendix- 3.3*). No reason for the discrepancy was furnished by the Department.

3.2.9.2 Improper and non-maintenance of key records

The basic records were not being maintained either in the field units or at the headquarters. In the field units, the list of beneficiaries under different schemes was either incomplete or absent and stock register of cancelled ration cards; central ration card distribution register; draft remittance registers of blocks; consolidated lifting reports; reconciliation statement of lifting etc. were not maintained. At the level of BSFC, the central stock register was not properly maintained. Maintenance of details of stock issue orders was also improper. At the secretariat level, no reports were produced to audit to show that the department monitored the functioning of these schemes. In the absence of these basic records, it was difficult to get an accurate picture of actual functioning of these schemes. It could not be verified if the food grains being shown as distributed were actually distributed to the beneficiaries and were in right quantity, of right quality, on right time and to the right person.

3.2.10 Fair price shops

As per PDS control orders (2001), stock entry at the time of receipt of stock by the FPS is to be made by Marketing Officer. Thereafter, actual distribution of food grains by the dealers of FPS was to be done in the presence of members of local Vigilance Committees (VCs). The VCs were also required to certify the distribution of food grains to the beneficiaries in the stock register.

Absence of requisite records, non-display of required information and also absence of VC casted serious doubts over effective implementation of the scheme

It was noticed that no stock entry was authenticated or certified and food grains were not distributed in the presence of members of local VCs. There was no mechanism to check if food grains shown as distributed were actually distributed to the beneficiaries on time and was of specified quantity and quality, raising possibility of beneficiaries not getting allotted quantity of food grains regularly. VCs at State, district and block levels were found to be defunct thus defeating both the justification behind their constitution and also the objectives of the schemes. It was further noticed that the record of list of beneficiaries was not maintained. Available stocks, prices, timings and the dates of operations were not displayed in FPSs. Important documents like unit register, card distribution register, inspection register were also not available in the FPSs. In all the FPSs test checked, vital records like stock register, sale register, counterfoil of cash memo etc. for the period prior to 2005-06 were not furnished. Besides, important records like list of beneficiaries under AAY and BPL were not displayed and card distribution registers were not maintained.

3.2.10.1 Financial viability of FPS

Norms of financial viability of FPS not prescribed

Average monthly profit margin to each dealer of FPSs for the two schemes (TPDS and AAY) in the State was worked out to be Rs 378 per month. Transportation and handling charges, rent of shops and other contingencies were also to be met out from this Rs 378. This was lower than even the scale of BPL families. Such low margins render the dealers, if this were the only source of their livelihood, vulnerable to malpractices viz. hoarding, black-marketing or under weighing. If the dealer is engaged in another calling also, his or her performance as a dealer of FPS would suffer and which may defeat the objectives of the schemes. The State Government has not worked out any norms for financial viability of the dealers of FPSs.

3.2.10.2 Accuracy of weighing of food grains

Absence of weighbridges made the schemes vulnerable to malpractices

As there were neither any weighbridges at the godowns of the state/BSFC nor any records to show that food grains were weighed at other weighbridges, the quantity of food grains entering the godowns and lifted from the godowns was not verifiable. Even the FPSs did not have weighbridges to weigh the deliveries from the godowns. This arrangement was vulnerable to pilferage.

3.2.10.3 Inspection of Quality of food grains

Quality of food grains distributed among the beneficiaries was not tested/checked

Test of quality of food grains being distributed was never conducted to check their Fair Average Quality. No facility for quality inspection either at BSFC level or at state/district level existed in the state. It was noticed that BSFC never found the need to dispose off stocks for reasons of their being unfit for human consumption or toxicity.

3.2.11 Monitoring and Evaluation

3.2.11.1 Periodical inspection of FPS

Shortfall in inspection of FPS ranged between 97 - 100 per cent

The State Government had drawn up the schedule of inspections of FPSs by different levels of Government officials. It was noticed that there were shortfalls in inspections during entire period of review by Supply Inspectors (98 per cent), BSOs / MOs (97 per cent), Sub Divisional Officers (100 per cent), District Supply Officers (99 per cent) and Deputy Commissioners (100 per cent). No reason for short falls in inspections of FPSs by different levels of functionaries was stated.

3.2.11.2 Visit by Special Area Officers

For regular and effective review and monitoring of PDS in states, the GOI introduced (February 2000) Area Officers Scheme. Under the scheme, 14 senior officers of the Ministry of Food and Consumer Affairs were to be appointed as Area Officers for different states and were required to make four visits annually in their allotted states, with an element of surprise and objectivity, and to make assessments about the functioning of the PDS by visiting FPSs, stock agents and FCI depots, meeting beneficiaries etc. No Area Officer visited Jharkhand during the period covered by audit.

3.2.11.3 Internal Audit

No internal audit system was developed for PDS network in the State

3.2.11.4 Lack of sensitivity to error signals

Reviews on functioning of PDS featured in the Report of the Comptroller & Auditor General of India (Civil) for the year ended 31 March 1995 and 31 March 1999 for the State of undivided Bihar. The report of 1995 was discussed in PAC in August 1999. The reviews, among other deficiencies, had pointed out the following:

- irregularities in the issue of ration cards;
- irregularities in the identification of beneficiaries;
- poor performance of FPSs;
- lack of accurate weighbridges;
- diversion of food grains;
- quality of food grains not checked.

Despite these deficiencies having been pointed out by audit and one of the reviews having been discussed in the Public Accounts Committee, the department did not rectify them. This is indicative of lack of sensitivity to error signals generated externally.

3.2.12 Conclusion

The basic objective of ensuring food security amongst poorest section of the population remained largely unfulfilled as there were consistent short liftings under the schemes. Food grains were diverted from BPL to AAY and from one scheme to another, hampering programme implementation. Purchase of food grains in excess of requirement also took place which raises possibility of diversion to open market. No survey was done for identification of beneficiaries and ineligible families received benefits under the scheme. Distribution of ration cards did not take place as envisaged resulting in denial of benefits as well as unintended benefits under the programme. Monitoring was deficient and evaluation of the scheme was never done. In the absence of any documentation at FPSs, checks to be exercised by Vigilance Committees, officers of the Department and Special Area Officers audit could not ascertain whether quantity and quality of food grains were distributed to eligible persons. The Government did not seem to respond to error signals generated. Thus, the functioning of TPDS in Jharkhand left much to be desired.

3.2.13 Recommendations

- The Government should ensure that all the required and the allotted food grains are lifted promptly and short lifting is avoided.
- The Government should ensure that all cases of diversion of food grains, inadequate or excess off take of food grains and suspect or bogus ration cards are properly investigated.
- The Government should conduct another survey to identify and categorize households in AAY, BPL and APL families and distribute the ration cards accordingly.
- The Government should consider setting up laboratories for testing food grains to ensure fair average quality.
- The Government should critically review the functioning of Fair Price Shops in a time bound programme to facilitate sufficient returns to the shops and to ensure that delinquent ones are closed/ penalized.
- The Government should critically review the existing procedures and instructions for strengthening the monitoring of the distribution of food grains including the Government of India's Area Officers scheme, inspection by District Level Officers and Vigilance Committees.

The matter was reported to the Government (September 2006); their reply has not been received (October 2006).

WELFARE DEPARTMENT

3.3 Educational Development of SCs and STs

Highlights

The main educational objective of Department of Welfare, Government of Jharkhand, is to enable the Scheduled Castes (SCs) & Scheduled Tribes (STs) students studying in schools, colleges and universities to pursue their education through various schemes sponsored by Central and State Governments. A review on the educational development of SCs & STs students disclosed that the benefits could not be delivered for reasons of inadequate budget provisioning, non-payment of scholarship, non-identification of beneficiaries/ students, deficiencies in functioning of Book Bank Scheme and non-construction/non-repair of schools/ hostels etc.

There was a sharp decline in the number of beneficiaries under Pre Matric Scholarship Scheme for children of those engaged in unclean occupations due to lack of efficacious planning and non identification of beneficiaries. Only 55 per cent of the available funds were utilised.

[Paragraphs 3.3.7.1 & 3.3.7.2]

Out of total allotment of Rs 64.71 crore, the Department spent only Rs 49.04 crore (76 per cent) under Post Matric Scholarship Scheme for SC & ST students during 2001-06. The expenditure was not commensurate with the number of beneficiaries.

[Paragraph 3.3.8.1]

Scholarship under Post Matric Scholarship Scheme was not paid during the same academic session. In five test checked districts, 4,738 SC and ST students were deprived of benefit of scholarship amounting to Rs 94.60 lakh during 2002-06.

[Paragraph 3.3.8.2]

Benefits of Book Bank Scheme could not reach the beneficiaries as neither the need for books was assessed nor were these distributed to SCs and STs students.

[Paragraphs 3.3.9 & 3.3.9.1]

The Department spent only 40 per cent and 28 per cent of total allotment of fund for SC and ST hostels. Thus, the construction of hostels remained incomplete and the beneficiaries were denied the intended benefits. Material supplied for vacant and incomplete SC and ST hostels was lying unutilized resulting in unfruitful expenditure of Rs 2.27 crore.

[Paragraphs 3.3.11 & 3.3.11.5]

3.3.1 Introduction

The State has a constitutional responsibility for promoting education and economic interests of the weaker sections of the society and, in particular, of the Scheduled Castes (SC) and Scheduled Tribes (ST). STs and SCs constitute 28 *per cent* and 12 *per cent* of the total population of Jharkhand respectively. Literacy rate of SCs in Jharkhand is 37.56 *per cent* and that of STs is 40.67 *per cent*. Department of Welfare is responsible for the educational, economic and social welfare of SC, ST and Other Backward Classes (OBCs). In order to enable the SC and ST students studying in schools, colleges and universities to pursue their education and learn skills to generate self confidence and self reliance, the department implemented eight schemes* sponsored by the Central and the State Governments. The objectives of these schemes were to increase enrolment and retention of SC & ST students in educational institutions, reduce drop out rate, increase literacy rate, reduce gender gap and increase their representation in higher educational and professional institutions.

3.3.2 Organisational set-up

The Secretary, Welfare Department, Ranchi is the Head of the Department. He is assisted by a Special Secretary, two Joint Secretaries and a Deputy Secretary. Tribal Welfare Commissioner (TWC) acts as the nodal agency at State level for the overall development of SC, ST and OBC students. District Welfare Officer (DWO), Sub-divisional Welfare Officer (SDWO) and Block Welfare Officer (BWO) are responsible for implementation of various educational development schemes at district, sub-divisional and block levels, respectively.

3.3.3 Audit objectives

The objectives of the performance audit were to assess whether:

- planning for various schemes launched for the educational development for SCs and STs was based on reliable and acceptable data;
- allocation, release and utilisation of funds earmarked for various schemes were adequate;
- implementation of various programmes was effective;
- efforts of the State Governments to improve the educational indicators i.e. literacy rate, gross enrolment ratio, gross drop out rate and gender parity index amongst SCs & STs were adequate; and
- monitoring system at various levels was adequate.

* (1) Pre-matric scholarship scheme to children of those engaged in unclean occupations; (2) Post matric scholarship, (3) Book Bank scheme, (4) Coaching and allied scheme, (5) Hostels for SC/ST community, (6) Cycle distribution scheme, (7) Computers to SC/ST residential schools and (8) Uniforms distribution scheme.

3.3.4 Audit criteria

The main criteria to arrive at audit conclusions were:

- Census data and population of SC & ST students and data of eligible children;
- Prescribed eligibility criteria and guidelines for selection of students;
- Prescribed payment procedures and utilisation of funds as per guidelines;
- Increase/decrease in literacy rate, retention rate, drop out rate and gender gap and trends in gross enrolment ratio; and
- monitoring system in place.

3.3.5 Scope and Methodology of Audit

Performance Audit of Educational Development of SCs & STs was conducted during April to August 2006, covering the period from 2001-06. Test check of records was conducted in the offices of the Secretary, Welfare Department; TWC at the state level, eight** out of twenty two districts, five*** out of six Welfare Sub-divisions and 24**** out of 89 blocks of the sampled districts.

Probability Proportional to Size with Replacement (PPSWR) method of sampling was used to select the sample districts to be test checked. Selection of universities, colleges, schools, hostels in the selected districts were done on the basis of Simple Random Sampling without Replacement (SRSWOR) method. Besides examination of records, interviews were conducted in West Singhbhum and Sahebganj districts with eligible beneficiaries left out under Pre-Matric Scholarship Scheme for children of those engaged in unclean occupation. Photographs were also used as evidence for the audit findings. Entry conference was held (June 2006) with the Secretary, Welfare Department and the objectives of audit were discussed. Exit Conference was held with the Secretary to the Government (November 2006) and the observations and recommendations of audit were discussed. The results of the review are brought out in the succeeding paragraphs.

Audit findings

3.3.6 Programme planning

The Department was required to assess and identify the number of SC & ST students in schools/colleges and universities to plan for and implement the various schemes for educational development of SCs and STs. To implement

No data for the number of beneficiaries

** Deoghar, Dhanbad, Dumka, Hazaribagh, Jamtara, Ranchi, Sahebganj and West Singhbhum.

*** Barhi, Chaibasa Sadar, Dumka, Jamtara and Ranchi.

**** Deoghar - Karon, Madhupur, Dhanbad - Jharia, Topchanchi, Dumka - Dumka, Jarmundi, Ramgarh, Hazaribagh - Hazaribagh Sadar, Ichak, Mandu and Ramgarh, Jamtara - Jamtara Sadar, Ranchi - Bero, Kanke, Namkum, Ormanjhi and Ratu, Sahebganj - Mandro, Sahebganj Sadar and Taljhari, West Singhbhum - Chakradharpur, Jagannathpur, Jhikparni and Tantnagar.

the various schemes relating to educational development of SCs and STs, the department at State level, District Welfare Offices (DWO) at district level and Block Welfare Offices (BWO) at block level were required to prepare data of all eligible beneficiaries under the various schemes. The following deficiencies were noticed in the planning of the programme:

- No such data of eligible beneficiaries was prepared or survey for identification of beneficiaries conducted at any level.
- In Ranchi, 195 students were covered under the scheme of Pre-Matric Scholarship for the children who are engaged in unclean occupations but on cross verification (Namkum and Ratu blocks), the number of such students was found to be 384. Hence, the data furnished by the district level and block level was not reliable.
- To maximise enrolment, increase coverage of beneficiaries and to make general public aware, sufficient publicity is needed. It was observed that no publicity for ongoing schemes for generating public awareness at any level was undertaken. No fund was allocated for publicity. Due to lack of awareness among the beneficiaries under Pre-Matric Scholarship Scheme, the response of the beneficiaries was poor as commented in the succeeding paragraphs
- Scholarship Committees at district, subdivision and block levels are to be constituted for selection of beneficiaries, distribution of stipend to selected beneficiaries, to take remedial action on receipt of complaints and for review of scholarship accounts under scholarship schemes. No Committee was formed at any level and therefore, the implementation of the schemes was ineffective.

Implementation of the schemes

3.3.7 Pre-Matric Scholarship Scheme

The scheme provides financial assistance to parents traditionally engaged in unclean occupations to enable their children to pursue education up to matriculation level. There is no income ceiling for award of scholarship under this scheme.

3.3.7.1 Funds available and expenditure:

The expenditure under the scheme is to be shared on 50:50 basis between the Union and State Governments. The details of funds available and expenditure incurred at State level for 2001-06 were as under:

(Rupees in lakh)

Year	Funds available	Actual expenditure	Percentage	No. of beneficiaries
2001-02	16.20	16.20	100	NA
2002-03	60.40	21.52	36	4,784
2003-04	32.35	17.32	54	1,455
2004-05	17.00	10.08	59	1,244
2005-06	13.20	11.65	88	NA
Total	139.15	76.77	55	

Out of total fund of Rs 1.39 crore, the department could spend Rs 0.77 crore (55 per cent) resulting in saving of Rs 0.62 crore during 2001-06.

3.3.7.2 Decline in the number of beneficiaries

During 2002-03, 4,784 beneficiaries were provided financial assistance. This declined sharply to 1,455 (70 per cent) and 1,244 (74 per cent) beneficiaries in 2003-04 and 2004-05 respectively. The reason for decline in the number of beneficiaries was mainly due to lack of publicity, efficacious planning and non-identification of beneficiaries.

3.3.7.3 Payment of scholarship

175 beneficiaries were not provided scholarship from 2002-06

All school going children of those engaged in unclean occupations are eligible for scholarship under this scheme. In West Singhbhum, 175 beneficiaries were provided scholarship in 2001-02. During 2002-06, scholarship was not given to these beneficiaries. In 14 schools of Deoghar, Hazaribagh and Jamtara districts, stipend of Rs 7.09 lakh was not paid during 2001-06 to 1336 deserving students of primary, middle and high schools. In Ranchi district instead of the amount fixed by the State Government, stipend was given on the basis of available funds and only to the known beneficiaries without undertaking any exercise for identification. This resulted in excess payment of Rs 3.44 lakh during 2001-06 (*Appendix-3.4*).

In West Singhbhum and Sahebganj districts, interviews with scavengers showed that 13 and 24 beneficiaries respectively were deprived of financial assistance under the scheme.

3.3.8 Post Matric Scholarship Scheme

The scheme provides financial assistance to the SC & ST students studying at post matriculation levels and is open to all whose parental annual income is less than one lakh per annum. The expenditure under the scheme is to be provided 100 per cent by the Union Government.

3.3.8.1 Funds available and expenditure

The details of funds available and expenditure at state level for 2001-06 were as under:

(Rupees in lakh)

Year	Category	Funds available	Actual expenditure	Percentage utilisation	No. of beneficiaries
2001-02	SC	300.00	300.00	100	NA
	ST	685.00	685.00	100	NA
2002-03	SC	360.00	196.12	54	6,905
	ST	600.00	444.57	74	16,730
2003-04	SC	680.00	258.61	38	4,896
	ST	898.94	760.39	85	40,603
2004-05	SC	358.42	222.93	62	7,815
	ST	1000.00	909.40	91	37,658

2005-06	SC	346.67	255.67	74	9,722
	ST	1242.00	871.07	70	27,144
Total	SC	2045.09	1233.33	60	29,338
	ST	4425.94	3670.43	83	1,22,135
Grand Total		6471.03	4903.76	76	1,51,473

(Source: TWC Ranchi)

Against an allotment of Rs 64.71 crore (2001-06), the State Government spent only Rs 49.04 crore (76 per cent) during 2001-06.

For ST students, the expenditure increased from 7.60 crore in 2003-04 to 9.09 crore in 2004-05 and then went down to 8.71 crore in 2005-06 while the number of beneficiaries decreased from 40,603 in 2003-04 to 37,658 in 2004-05 and to 27,144 in 2005-06. Though the number of beneficiaries declined by 33 per cent for the period 2003-04 to 2005-06, expenditure increased by 12 per cent during the same period. Thus, expenditure was not commensurate with the number of beneficiaries even though the amount of scholarship to be given to a beneficiary is fixed.

3.3.8.2 Payment of scholarship

In order to reduce drop-out rates for reasons of financial hardship, it was envisaged in the GOI guidelines that the stipend at Rs 140 per month per student for intermediate and at Rs 185 per month per student for graduation be paid during the academic session. The criteria for disbursement of scholarships are caste, income, study courses, recognized institutions, qualification, parental lineage, domicile etc. Scrutiny of records showed the following irregularities in payment of Post Matric Scholarship.

Scholarship under PMS scheme was not paid during same academic session

- In Dumka, Deoghar, Hazaribagh and Jamtara districts, stipend/scholarship were not paid during the same academic session and remained unpaid even at close of the financial year (**Appendix-3.5**).
- In 16 colleges of Ranchi and West Singhbhum districts, 14,255 SC and ST students were not paid scholarship/stipend on time. The delay in payment of scholarship ranged from 3 to 24 months due to delay in scrutiny of applications for stipend received from the students through different colleges, delayed sanction of stipend and preparation of advice.

Non-payment of due scholarship of Rs 94.60 lakh to SC & ST students

- In Deoghar, Hazaribagh, Jamtara, Ranchi and West Singhbhum districts, despite availability of fund, scholarship amounting to Rs 94.60 lakh were not paid to 4,738 SC and ST students though they had applied for the scholarship and their applications had been sent to DWOs during 2002-06. The scholarship remained unpaid though students had completed their courses.

Excess payment of Rs 5.51 lakh due to payment of scholarship at higher rate

- In 19 colleges of Deoghar and Jamtara districts, excess payment of scholarship amounting to Rs 5.51 lakh was made to 781 students due to payment at higher rate (**Appendix-3.6**).
- In Ranchi and West Singhbhum, 5 students submitted applications for scholarship to DWOs during 2001-04. On examination of the actual income of parents/guardians, it was found that actual income was

higher than those declared by the students. This resulted in payment of Rs one lakh of scholarship to ineligible beneficiaries.

3.3.8.3 Non reimbursement of various costs

Reimbursement fees not paid to three colleges amounting to Rs 30.87 lakh by DWO, Chaibasa

The DWO, Chaibasa did not reimburse the fees amounting to Rs 30.87 lakh during 1994-95 to 2005-06 (August 2006) to three colleges (*Appendix-3.7*). Scholarship, maintenance allowance, re-imburement of compulsory non-refundable fees, typing/printing charges, study tour charges, book allowance for students pursuing correspondence courses and special provisions in respect of disabled students were to be provided for which Rs 5.92 crore was allotted during 2001-03. In Dhanbad, Sahebganj, West Singhbhum and Ranchi districts, against the allotment of Rs 5.92 crore, only Rs 4.45 crore (75 per cent) was spent during the period. Except scholarship, no other benefits were provided during 2001-03, though sufficient funds were available.

The reimbursement of thesis typing/printing charges, study tour charges, book allowance for students pursuing correspondence courses, compulsory refundable fees, etc. were not made to the SC and ST students in the test checked districts during 2001-06. Thus, avoidable financial burden was imposed on these students and the beneficiaries were deprived of the benefit.

3.3.8.4 Utilisation of funds by IGNOU

IGNOU did not spend central fund of Rs 34.29 lakh even after available eligible students

In 2004-06, Regional Director, Indira Gandhi National Open University (IGNOU) was allotted Rs 39.42 lakh for PMS scheme for SC students. Though, eligible students were available, RD, IGNOU utilised only 5.13 lakh and surrendered Rs 12 lakh to TWC, Ranchi (March 2006). Thus, eligible students were denied the benefit of the programme.

3.3.9 Book Bank Scheme

The scheme provides access to the latest books to students studying medical, engineering, agriculture, veterinary, law, chartered accountancy, business management, and bio-sciences who receive Post Matric Scholarships. Purchase of books under this scheme was to be restricted to prescribed text books only and one set of these books were to be given to group of two students. The expenditure under the scheme is to be shared on 50:50 basis between Union and State Government. The number of beneficiaries covered under this scheme was not maintained at district/State level. The Department received Rs 3.25 crore (2002-03 to 2005-06) and spent Rs 3.06 crore during the same period (Details in *Appendix- 3.8*).

3.3.9.1 Distribution of books

Requirement of books worth Rs 2.61 crore not assessed before purchase

Without ascertaining the requirements, DWOs, Dhanbad and Ranchi, purchased books worth Rs 67.80 lakh and Rs 1.93 crore during 2001-06 respectively. No requirements were obtained by the Government or from the institutes⁷ for which these books were purchased.

⁷ BIT Sindri, PMCH Dhanbad, RIMS Ranchi, BIT, Mesra and University Polytechnics, Ranchi.

In Rajendra Institute of Medical Sciences, Ranchi, Birla Institute of Technology, Mesra and University Polytechnics, Ranchi, the purchased text books were sent to the libraries. There was nothing on record to show whether these books were issued exclusively to SC & ST students. Thus, whether the expenditure of Rs 2.61 crore incurred on purchase of books was used for avowed purpose was not ascertainable.

3.3.9.2 Drawal of fund for books for colleges/institutes not covered under the scheme

Allotment of fund of Rs 31.60 lakh was made without any requirement

In 2005-06, DWO, West Singhbhum was allotted Rs 31.60 lakh (Rs 18.60 lakh for SC students and Rs 13 lakh for ST students) under the scheme without ascertaining whether any of the colleges or institutes eligible under the scheme existed and were operational in the district. The amount was drawn and lying unutilised with DWO, Singhbhum.

3.3.10 Coaching and allied schemes for weaker sections

The scheme provides pre-examination coaching to SC and ST students for improving their representation and standard of performance in the competitive examinations for various posts. The expenditure under the scheme is to be shared on 50:50 basis between the Union and State Government. Details of allotment and expenditure are given in *Appendix- 3.9*.

Out of total allotment of Rs 2.08 crore during 2001-06, the Department spent Rs 66.29 lakh (*32 per cent*) only. Although the available funds increased from Rs 22.48 lakh to Rs 64.33 lakh from 2002-03 to 2005-06, the utilisation declined from *68 per cent* to *22 per cent*. The reason for under utilisation of funds was due to poor performance in achievement of targets.

Under this scheme, enrollment of ST girl students was *30 per cent* during 2002-05 but the percentage of successful ST girl students in 2003-04 was *19 per cent*. No activity was undertaken in the years 2001-02 and 2005-06. In other schemes, coverage of female beneficiaries was not maintained in the Department at any level.

3.3.11 Hostels for SC and ST community students

To pursue studies, the Union Government has formulated schemes for providing hostel facilities to SC and ST students. The expenditure under the scheme is to be shared on 50:50 basis between the Union and State Government. Allotment and expenditure statement at state level was as under:

(Rupees in lakh)

Year		Funds available	Actual expenditure	Percentage utilisation
2001-02	SC	491.60	-	-
	ST	394.74	-	-
2002-03	SC	222.90	222.90	100
	ST	423.12	186.13	44
2003-04	SC	140.98	121.50	86
	ST	817.87	105.00	13
2004-05	SC	206.95	67.96	33
	ST	208.98	161.33	77
2005-06	SC	141.45	75.07	53
	ST	670.42	262.03	39
Total	SC	1203.88	487.43	40
	ST	2515.13	714.49	28

(Source: TWC, Ranchi)

The department spent only 40 per cent for SCs and 28 per cent for STs of the total allotment on the scheme during 2001-06.

3.3.11.1 Hostels remained incomplete

Of the total sanctioned hostel, the department could complete only 59 per cent for SC and 63 per cent for ST students

The State Government sanctioned (2001-06) construction of 184 hostels (78 for SCs and 106 for STs) for 9,450 (SC 4,300 and ST 5,150) boys' and girls' students at an estimated cost of Rs 72.29 crore which were to be completed within four months from the date of work order. Of these, 71 hostels (SC- 32 and ST- 39) remained incomplete (August 2006), even after expenditure of Rs 12.18 crore (SC hostel- Rs 4.10 crore and ST hostel- Rs 8.08 crore). The department did not monitor the construction of hostels; as a result 5,300 SC and ST Students (SC-1,800 and ST-3,500) were deprived of hostel facilities.

Construction of hostels and repair work remained incomplete

In Dhanbad, Ranchi, West Singhbhum and Sahebganj districts, the construction/ repair of 24 SC and ST hostels for boys and girls were taken up during 2001-06. Of this Rs 2.73 crore (75 per cent) was spent but the construction/repair works of these hostels remained incomplete (August 2006).

Construction of Ekata boys' hostel for 50 students in the campus of Tata College, West Singhbhum was taken up in 2002-03 at an estimated cost of Rs 24.55 lakh, and accordingly, Rs 23.36 lakh was released during 2003-05. The work was incomplete even after 20 months and the walls in the rooms had developed cracks as prescribed specifications were not adhered to.

3.3.11.2 Site selection for hostels was not need based

Unfruitful expenditure of Rs 2.22 crore was incurred due to non-achievement of objective of the scheme

In Dumka, Deoghar and Jamtara districts, nine hostels for 600 students, were constructed at Rs 2.22 crore during 2002-05. All the nine hostels were lying vacant due to non-allotment and lack /non-receipt of applications from SC & ST students indicating that the requirement for construction of hostels was not assessed. Two hostels were lying vacant (One from November 2002 and the other from May 2003) due to lack of electricity, water and sanitary facilities

and were not handed over to hostel superintendent. The entire expenditure of Rs 2.22 crore was rendered unfruitful.

In West Singhbhum, one hostel for 50 SC girl students within the premises of Tata College, Chaibasa was constructed (June 2004) at Rs 24.55 lakh but not allotted to them (July 2006) due to wrong selection of site, resulting in denial of intended benefits for more than two years after the construction of the hostel. The entire expenditure of Rs 24.55 lakh was rendered unfruitful.

Government of Jharkhand allotted (October 2001) Rs 60.77 lakh under special assistance to Micro Economic Social Organisation (MESO) Project Officer, Ranchi, for the construction of Scheduled Tribe girls' hostel. Scrutiny (May 2006) showed that the hostel was constructed and handed over to District Welfare Officer (DWO), Ranchi, in June 2005. The hostel was later handed over to the Principal, Marwari Women's College, Ranchi (May 2006), without any basic facilities like electricity, drinking water supply, bed etc. and manpower to run it. No posts were sanctioned for running the hostel despite reminders issued (July 2006) by the Principal of the college and the hostel is still not functioning even after five years of allotment of funds. Neither have steps been taken to identify the beneficiaries nor has the process been initiated to appoint a warden. The entire expenditure of Rs 60.77 lakh was rendered unfruitful.

3.3.11.3 Overcrowding in hostels

In West Singhbhum, three hostels of Women's College, Chaibasa for 300 girl students were damaged (July 2003). One new hostel for 100 girl students constructed in 2002-03 in the premises of Women's College, Chaibasa and the girls of the three damaged hostels were shifted into the newly constructed hostel. Consequently, 344 girl students resided in the new hostel against its accommodation capacity of 100, resulting in overcrowding and avoidable hardships.

On physical verification, it was observed that in S.C. Boys' Residential High School, Govindpur, Dhanbad, 18 students were residing in a room (against the capacity of four students). Out of seven residential schools (of Dumka and Hazaribagh districts), two schools of Dumka had no buildings of their own. The school (ST Residential Middle School, Upper Murgathali, Dumka) runs in the rooms of hostel buildings and the 88 students were accommodated in one room (18 ft x 20 ft approximately) and a small verandah.

In Jama ST Residential Middle School, 88 students were residing in three rooms; while ST Residential Middle School, Assanpaharee, Dumka had no separate hostel building and 88 ST students were residing in four rooms of the school building. In other four hostels of residential schools, 8-10 and 30-32 students were residing in one room.



Against capacity of 100, 344 girls residing in Late Radhe Sambhui Women Adivasi Hostel, Chaibasa



Against capacity of 4, 18 students residing in SC Boys Residential School, Govindpur, Dhanbad.

Funds meant for girls hostel diverted to boys hostel

3.3.11.4 Funds meant for Girls hostel diverted into Boys hostels

In Dhanbad, construction of SC girls' hostel in the premises of Chhotki Devi Girls' High School, Chirkunda was sanctioned (January 2003) at an estimated cost of Rs 24.55 lakh which was not taken up. Instead, construction of a boys' hostel was taken up at B.S.K. Boys' College, Maithan defeating the intended benefits to girl students. Reasons for conversion of a girls' hostel into a boys' hostel and shifting of its location were not on record.

Materials worth Rs 2.27 crore supplied for vacant and incomplete hostels lying unutilised

3.3.11.5 Materials supplied for incomplete and vacant hostels

The department centrally purchased (between August 2004 and July 2005) materials like furniture, mattress, pillows, cots, mosquito nets etc at a cost of Rs 2.27 crore. These materials were supplied and issued to 18 hostels (SC-9 and ST-9 hostels) which were found vacant and to 35 incomplete hostels (13 for SC and 22 for STs) (expenditure incurred on these vacant and incomplete hostels were Rs 15.79 crore). As a result, these materials were lying unutilised and dumped in stores at several places. No physical verification of stores was conducted as of August 2006.

Safe drinking water facilities were not available in 13 residential schools/hostel

3.3.11.6 Lack of infrastructure

Out of 17 residential schools in six districts (Dhanbad, Dumka, Hazaribagh, Ranchi, Sahebganj and West Singhbhum), five hostels had no medical and sanitary facilities, electricity, kitchen etc. Safe drinking water facilities were not available in 13 residential hostels. Neither tap water nor hand pump was provided to ST Residential Girls High School, Kundi, Ranchi.

3.3.11.7 Unauthorised occupation of SC and ST boys' hostels

In three districts, Dhanbad, Dumka and Ranchi, five hostels for 450 students were constructed between 2001-02 and July 2004 at cost of Rs 2.71 crore for SC and ST boys and girls. Hostels were occupied by outsiders, lady constables, police picket and by Jharkhand State Tribal Co-operative Development Corporation. Thus, the intended beneficiaries were deprived of

hostel facilities defeating the objective of the scheme as detailed in **Appendix- 3.10.**

3.3.12 Bicycle distribution scheme

Department of Welfare introduced (2002-03) a scheme to distribute free bicycles to SC and ST girl students. The scheme was extended (2003-04) to OBC girl students also. Department purchased 49,840 bicycles at Rs 7.71 crore.

In four districts⁸, bicycles were purchased without ascertaining or obtaining the number of beneficiaries from DWOs. It was observed in audit that 2,577 bicycles procured for Rs 39.86 lakh during 2003-04 to 2005-06 were lying idle and dumped. Utilisation Certificates, regarding distribution of bicycles by the DWOs were also not made available.

3.3.13 Unfruitful expenditure on purchase of computers

Computer and its accessories purchased for Rs 76.18 lakh were lying unutilised

To provide computer education to SC and ST students of residential schools, the State Government formulated a scheme under State Plan to provide five computers, one printer, one UPS and software to all the SC and ST residential schools. The department purchased 130 computers, 26 printers and 26 UPSs including software at Rs 76.18 lakh during 2001-06. These were provided to 26 residential schools for SC and ST students of 13 districts⁹.

Test check of 11 SC and ST residential schools in five sampled districts (Dhanbad, Dumka, Ranchi, Sahebganj and West Singhbhum) disclosed that 40 HCL computers, eight UPSs and eight printers valuing Rs 23.44 lakh, provided to eight residential schools, were lying unutilised (from August 2003 to May 2006) due to non-availability of computer room or electricity or computer teacher or due to supply of unserviceable computers. All five computers in ST Residential Girls' High School, Chaibasa and four computers in SC Residential Boys' High School, Govindpur, Dhanbad were defective. In five schools, 25 computers were kept dumped in a room. In ST Residential Girls' High School, Kundi, Ranchi, the computers were found kept packed in box. Thus, the objective of the scheme was defeated and the expenditure incurred by the Department amounting to Rs 23.44 lakh was rendered unfruitful.



Photograph showing dumped computers and bicycles

⁸ Dhanbad, Ranchi, Sahebganj and West Singhbhum.

⁹ Dhanbad, Dumka, East Singhbhum, Giridih, Gumla, Hazaribagh, Jamtara, Latehar, Lohardaga, Ranchi, Sahebganj, Saraikela- Kharsawan, and West Singhbhum.

3.3.14 Effectiveness of the schemes

3.3.14.1 Poor results of SC and ST students

Scrutiny of the records of five schools of three districts (Deoghar, Dumka and Jamtara) showed that the results of SC and ST students getting scholarship were poor during 2001-06. In RL Saraf High School, Deoghar, out of 131 students getting scholarship, only 55 students (average) succeeded in Class X during 2001-06 and only 18 *per cent* during 2003-04. In ST Residential High School, Karharbit, Dumka, no SC and ST student (out of 16, who appeared) succeeded in secondary examination during 2001-02. Only three out of 33 SC and ST students and four out of 25 SC and ST students succeeded during 2002-03 and 2003-04 respectively. Similarly, in 10+2 Government Girls' High School, Dumka, only two out of nine SC and ST students succeeded in secondary examination during 2001-02, while out of seven and 27 SC and ST students respectively, who appeared in examination in 2003-04 and 2004-05, none succeeded.

3.3.14.2 Pre-examination training/coaching centres

Pre-examination training centre (PETC) imparts coaching to the students belonging to SC & ST candidates for appearing in various competitive examinations/selection tests conducted by the Union Public Service Commission (UPSC), State Public Service Commission (SPSC), Staff Selection Commission (SSC), Recruitment Board, Public Sector Undertakings and other Central Government agencies.

In pre-examination training centres at Jharkhand Tribal Welfare Research Institute (JTRI) Ranchi, 19 *per cent* of enrolled students qualified for State Civil Services Examination during 2002-03 to 2004-05, 9.8 *per cent* qualified for clerk examinations and two *per cent* qualified for computer courses during the same period as detailed in **Appendix 3.11**. Thus, the scheme was a failure although an expenditure of Rs 66.29 lakh was incurred on these centres during 2001-05. No students were enrolled in 2005-06 for any of the courses by the centre.

3.3.15 Monitoring and Evaluation

For effective implementation of various schemes, various levels of officers of the Department were required to conduct field inspections. A schedule of inspections prescribing the minimum number of field visits for each supervisory level was to be drawn. Scrutiny revealed that the schedule of inspections was not drawn at any level of the department. It was also observed that the hostel superintendent did not submit the required periodical reports to DWOs or to the Welfare Department during 2001-06. Even the list of students admitted in each hostel was never submitted for which no action was taken.

The documentation of various records in the Department was very poor. The data/records available with the State Government were incomplete, unreliable, and highly selective. In absence of relevant records, it was not possible to measure the most significant performance parameters viz. increase/decrease in gross enrollment ratio, drop out rate, gender parity and literacy rate of SCs and STs etc. Therefore, the achievement of the objectives set out under the various schemes for educational development of SC and ST could not be established.

To ensure effective and efficient implementation, evaluation of the schemes is desirable, either by the Government itself or by an independent agency. Though the department released Rs 6.71 lakh for evaluation of cycle distribution scheme (Rs 2.48 lakh), scholarship schemes (Rs 2.25 lakh) and scheme for residential schools (Rs 1.98 lakh) to the Director, Jharkhand Tribal Welfare Research Institute (JTRI), Ranchi during 2003-04 and 2005-06, the time frame for completion of the evaluation was not fixed. No Report has been submitted so far. The entire amount of Rs 6.71 lakh drawn by the Director, JTRI remained irregularly with him till August 2006.

3.3.16 Conclusion

Implementation of various schemes for educational development of SC and ST students was far from satisfactory. Survey to assess the actual number of eligible beneficiaries was not conducted as a result of which actual number of eligible beneficiaries was not known. The data maintained by the department was inadequate and unreliable. Selection criteria were violated and students not meeting the prescribed criteria availed of benefit under the schemes. Scholarship under Post Matric Scholarship Scheme was not paid to the beneficiaries during the same academic session. Books were not provided to students under the Book Bank Scheme. Construction of hostels was taken up by the department without any need assessment and planning which led to many hostels remaining unoccupied. Huge expenditure incurred on bicycles, uniforms and computers to promote educational development of SC and ST students remained largely unfruitful. Lack of documentation and proper evidencing came in the way of commenting on increase/decrease of enrollment ratio, drop out rate, gender parity and literacy rate of SCs and STs. Thus, the department's endeavour to implement the schemes during 2001-06 left too much to be desired.

3.3.17 Recommendations

- Plan should be drawn up by the department before implementation of the scheme;
- Identification of beneficiaries should be done by conducting surveys in blocks, districts and the State;
- Scholarship Committees at block, subdivision and district levels should be formed;

- Books should be provided to students instead of being supplied to libraries;
- Existing hostels should be completed within stipulated time and steps taken to ensure that no illegal occupation takes place. New hostels to be taken only after making all the existing hostels functional;
- Monitoring and evaluation of the schemes should be done to ensure effective implementation and records should be maintained and documented effectively.

The matter was reported to the Government (October 2006); their reply had not been received (October 2006).

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT
3.4 Implementation of Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan
Highlights

The Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA) programme, aimed at Universal Elementary Education, was launched in 2001-02 to provide useful and relevant education for all children in the age group of 6 to 14 by 2010. The implementation of SSA in the State suffered due to under utilisation of fund particularly in the first two years, poor infrastructure facilities in schools and inadequate monitoring of activities. The Pupil Teacher Ratio was 51:1 in 2004-05 against the norms of 40:1. The 'drop out rate' in the State was as high as 68.39 per cent (September 2005) reflecting unsatisfactory implementation of the scheme. There were huge shortfalls in the training of teachers and community leaders. The objective of having all children in a school or in an alternative schooling facility by 2005 was, thus, not achieved. With the present pace of implementation, the objective of ensuring universal retention by 2010 is a distant possibility.

The funds under SSA were not at all utilised in the year 2001-02. In the next four years i.e. during 2002-06, the utilisation of funds was between 18.88 and 60.16 per cent. Financial management was, thus, ineffective.

[Paragraph 3.4.6.2]

Even after five years' of implementation of SSA, the number of 'out of school' children was 3.66 lakh (March, 2006) and drop-out rate in the State was 68.39 per cent (September 2005)

[Paragraphs 3.4.8.1 and 3.4.8.2]

There was shortage of 4,996 teachers in primary and upper primary schools. Pupil Teacher Ratio (PTR) was 51:1 in 2004-05 as against the norms of 40:1. Further, there was urban bias in posting of teachers. There were shortfalls in the training of untrained teachers (86 per cent) and community leaders (73 per cent). Quality of education suffered due to deployment of under qualified para teachers and untrained teachers.

[Paragraphs 3.4.8.3, 3.4.9.2 and 3.4.9.11]

Only 11,802 out of 24,111 civil works relating to construction of class rooms, toilets and provision of drinking water facilities, etc. had been completed as of March 2005. 1,020 schools had no buildings, 17,523 schools had no toilets, 19,359 schools had no girls' toilets, 20,965 schools were without electricity and 3,562 schools lacked drinking water facilities.

[Paragraphs 3.4.9.6 and 3.4.9.7]

Rs 1.80 crore for computerisation remained unutilised in four districts due to non-preparation of module and curriculum; 60 computers were lying idle for want of electricity in two districts.

[Paragraph 3.4.9.5]

In Giridih, books valued at Rs 1.77 crore, purchased during 2003-05 for focus group, were lying in the godowns. In Dhanbad, Pakur and Ranchi books valued at Rs 1.80 crore were purchased without proper assessment of requirement.

[Paragraph 3.4.9.9]

3.4.1 Introduction

Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA) aims at providing useful and relevant elementary education to all children in the age group of 6 to 14 years by 2010. This is to be done by providing schooling for eight years with the active participation of the community, School Education Committees (SEC) and other grass root level structures to bridge social, regional and gender gaps. Several existing schemes in the elementary education sector like Operation Black Board, Janshala, District Primary Education Programme (DPEP), etc. were integrated with the SSA.

The objectives of SSA are:

- to have all children in a School or in an Education Guarantee Scheme (EGS) or in an Alternative Schooling facility and 'Back to school' camp by 2005;
- to ensure that all children complete five years of primary schooling by 2007;
- to ensure that all children complete eight years of elementary schooling by 2010;
- to focus on elementary education of satisfactory quality with emphasis on education for life;
- to bridge all gender and social category gaps at primary stage by 2007 and at elementary education level by 2010; and
- to achieve universal retention by 2010.

3.4.2 Organisational set-up

The Principal Secretary, Department of Human Resource Development is the nodal officer for implementation of the scheme. A State Level Implementation Society, namely, Jharkhand Education Project Council (JEPC), headed by the State Project Director (SPD) oversees the execution at the State level. The agency is guided by the General Council* and the Executive Committee.** The General Council is responsible for overall guidance with regard to policy matters and Executive Committee looks after the management and administration of the JEPC. The execution is overseen by the Deputy

* General Council: Chief Minister- Chairman, Education Minister-Vice Chairman and representatives of educationists, Social Workers, Woman activists, NGOs and teachers.

** Executive Committee is headed by Chief Secretary and has Development Commissioner, Education Secretary, representatives of Departments of Finance, Planning and Rural Development, representatives of NGOs, Social activists, and University teachers etc. as its members.

Commissioner (DC) at the district-level, who is assisted by the District Programme Officer (DPO) and Block Education Extension Officers (BEEO). District Education Officer (DEO) or District Superintendent of Education (DSE) acts as the District Programme Officer. At the village level, Village Education Committee (VEC) comprising of Headmaster of School as Secretary and 15 to 21 members from the villagers, assist in securing the co-operation and participation of local community.

3.4.3 Audit objectives

The objectives of the review were to examine and assess whether:

- the funds were utilised efficiently and effectively;
- the planning for implementation of various components of the programme was efficacious;
- the objective of all children in a school or in an EGS centre or in an Alternative Schooling facility and 'back to school' camp, have been achieved; and
- major interventions were carried out as per norms fixed and the efforts of the Government to improve the quality of educational standards have been effective and economical.

3.4.4 Audit criteria

The audit criteria used for the performance audit covered following aspects of the scheme:

- receipt and utilisation of funds as per approved annual work plan;
- the guidelines issued by GOI in regard to preparation of district level plans;
- the different programmes and policies designed to meet the educational needs of children of the age group of 6-14 years; and
- the guidelines issued by GOI in regard to implementation of the scheme.

3.4.5 Scope of Audit and Methodology

A review of the implementation of the programme was conducted (June - September 2005) by test check of the records of JEPC, Ranchi, six[@] selected DPOs, 18[§] Block Resource Centers (BRCs), 36 Middle Schools and 36 Education Guarantee Scheme (EGS) covering the period 2001-05. The selection of sample was through Random Sampling. All districts (22) were divided into two strata. Capital district (Ranchi) was selected in stratum I and five out of the remaining 21 districts were selected in stratum II. Under each

[@] Bokaro, Dhanbad, Giridih, Gumla, Pakur and Ranchi.

[§] (Bokaro) Chas, Petarwar, Kasmar, (Dhanbad) Jharia, Govindpur-II, Baliapur, (Giridih) Giridih, Dhanwar, Dumri, (Gumla) Gumla, Raidih, Kamdara, (Pakur) Pakur, Littipara, Pakuria, (Ranchi) Ranchi, Ratu and Bundu.

test checked district, three BRCs, six Middle Schools and six EGS centres were selected for test check through Random Sampling.

The Social and Rural Research Institute (SRI), a specialist unit of IMRB International, was engaged by the Comptroller and Auditor General of India to conduct a survey on the impact of SSA. SRI carried out survey between December 2005 and February 2006. The summary of the findings of SRI are given in *Appendix-3.12*.

Entry conference was held in March 2005 with SPD of JEPC and objectives of the review along with criteria were discussed. After completion of review, exit conference was held in November 2006 with Principal Secretary, HRD and the findings along with the recommendations were discussed. The audit findings are brought out in the succeeding paragraphs.

Audit findings

3.4.6 Financial Management

Guidelines envisaged preparation of perspective plan for 2001-10 for each district on the basis of data collected through household survey, micro planning exercise etc. The budgets, proposed under SSA, are prepared in the form of Annual Work Plan and Budget (AWP&B), covering all the interventions specified in the SSA and are based on the progress of each intervention of the previous year. AWP&B proposals are envisaged in two parts, the plan for the current financial year and spill over activities of the previous years proposed to be carried over to the current year.

3.4.6.1 Financing pattern and flow of funds

The sharing arrangement for assistance under SSA between GOI and the State Government was to be 85:15 during 2001-02 (Ninth Plan), 75:25 during 2002-07 (Tenth Plan) and 50:50 thereafter. GOI would release funds directly to the JEPC in two installments (April and September) every year. The State Government was to transfer its due share to the JEPC within 30 days of receipt of GOI grant. Appraisal and approval of plans should be completed in time for the first installment to meet the proposed expenditure of the first six months to be released by 15 April. Further installments would be released only after the State Government transfers its matching share to the JEPC and expenditure of at least 50 *per cent* of the funds transferred (by both Centre and State) had been incurred.

3.4.6.2 Budget and expenditure

The year-wise details of the proposed AWP&B, along with the amount received by the JEPC and the amount spent during 2001-06 were as under:

(Rupees in crore)

Year	Amount proposed in Annual Work Plan and Budget	Amount received by JEPC from		Total	Expenditure (percentage)	Unspent balance (percentage)
		GOI	State Government			
2001-02	10.76	0.38	Nil	0.38	Nil (0)	0.38 (100)
2002-03	101.65	39.17	24.29	63.84#	12.05 (18.88)	51.79 (81.12)
2003-04	321.25	113.89	37.19	202.87#	70.96 (34.98)	131.91(65.02)
2004-05	416.20	155.00	76.53	363.44#	139.96(38.51)	223.48(61.49)
2005-06	567.11	269.29	103.16	595.93#	358.50 (60.16)	237.43 (39.84)
Total	1416.97	577.73	241.17		581.47 (71)	

(includes closing balance of the previous year) (Source: figures provided by JEPC)

Poor release of funds both by GOI and State Government against PAB sanction

It was seen from the above that the funds were not at all utilised in the first year *i.e.* during 2001-02. During 2002-06, the utilisation of fund was between 18.88 *per cent* and 60.16 *per cent*. Even after five years of implementation of the scheme, heavy unspent balances of Rs 237.43 crore (39.84 *per cent*) reflected poor preparation/estimation of AWP&B and the execution of various components of the scheme under SSA. The reasons for under utilisation were delay ranging between two and eight months in approval of the annual plan by the PAB, delay in release of funds, both by the GOI and the State Government, and poor progress in execution of works under different interventions of SSA.

During 2001-06, against the provision of Rs 1,416.97 crore, as proposed in AWP&B, the GOI and the State Government was to contribute Rs 1,063.81 crore and Rs 353.16 crore respectively. The GOI, however, released only Rs 577.73 crore (54 *per cent*) and State Government released Rs 241.17 crore (68 *per cent*). No reason was provided by the Department for the short release of fund by GOI and the State Government.

3.4.6.3 Delay in release of fund

Abnormal delays were noticed in release of funds

As per the guidelines of the scheme, GOI was to release the grants to meet the proposed expenditure of the first six months by 15 April. It was, however, seen that there were delays ranging from 112 to 180 days in release of funds by GOI. The State Government was to transfer its share to the JEPC within thirty days of the receipt of GOI grant. The release of State's share was, however, delayed from 36 to 178 days, reasons for which were not on record.

3.4.6.4 Outstanding utilisation certificates

JEPC was required to furnish Utilisation Certificates (UCs) to GOI based on the certified annual statements of Chartered Accountants from the DPOs of the district. The UCs were required to be submitted by the implementing agencies within a month after the close of the financial year (in case of civil works within three months of the completion of works). It was, however, observed that out of Rs 581.47 crore released by the JEPC, UCs for Rs 415.83 crore only pertaining to 2002-06 were submitted to the GOI till November 2006. No UC in respect of the balance amount of Rs 65.64 crore was furnished to GOI as of November 2006.

3.4.7 Planning for implementation of the programme

3.4.7.1 Annual working plans and District plans

District Plans prepared were not need-based, addressing the contextual problems and requirements. These were mostly norm-driven, setting out targets on various components of the scheme and in most cases, appeared identical without taking into account area specific needs. This fact was also brought out in the Appraisal Report of 2004-05 of the Annual Working Plan and Budget of the State. No specific discussions either on the plan for the improvement of the quality of education or on enhancing the learning achievement in particular, were held. It was also seen that the suggestions made in the earlier Appraisal Reports of the scheme were not incorporated in the subsequent plans.

In spite of direction from PAB no plan for meeting specific educational and developmental needs of the minorities was prepared

Considering that the State had 15 major tribes and some pockets of educationally backward tribes, the Project Approval Board (PAB) directed (May 2005) the State Government to design suitable programmes to meet the educational and developmental needs of the children of such tribes. No such programme was, however, prepared by the State as of September 2005.

It was further seen that the Annual Plans of the State were approved very late. Against the scheduled date of 1 April of the year, the Annual Plan for 2002-03 was approved in December 2002, in August 2003 for 2003-04, in June 2004 for 2004-05 and in May 2005 for 2005-06. No reason for delay in approval was furnished by JEPC.

3.4.8 Quality of Education

3.4.8.1 'Out of school' children

The number of 'out of school' children was 3.66 lakh in the State

The programmed object of the SSA was to have all children either in a School, or in an Education Guarantee Centre, or in an Alternative Schooling facility or in 'Back to School' camp by 2005. As of March 2006, the number of 'out of school' children stood at 3.66 lakh as against 13.88 lakh in April 2001, after five years of implementation of the programme and expenditure of Rs 581.47 crore. Thus, the objective of SSA to have all children enrolled by 2005 was not achieved, even by March 2006.

3.4.8.2 Drop out rate

Drop out rate in the State was 68.39 per cent

The 'drop out rate' of children of class I to V in the state as a whole was 44.76 per cent while it was 47.59 per cent for SC, 46.10 per cent for ST and 46 per cent for Girl children. The 'drop out rate' of children of Class I to VIII in the State as a whole was 68.39 per cent as on September 2005, it was 72.91 per cent for SC, 73.53 per cent for ST and 68.73 per cent for girl children. The drop out rate of test checked districts as on September 2005 was as given below:

Class I-V (in per cent)

District	As a whole	Girls	SC	ST
Bokaro	54.66	58.07	58.93	68.44
Dhanbad	52.37	53.56	59.18	56.28
Giridih	20.30	17.32	23.63	28.50
Gumla	53.90	53.33	56.15	55.55
Pakur	53.49	55.84	43.38	57.53
Ranchi	51.38	51.57	48.61	56.12

Class I – VIII (in per cent)

District	As a whole	Girls	SC	ST
Bokaro	81.48	82.71	84.21	88.36
Dhanbad	66.26	68.80	70.27	75.87
Giridih	20.72	20.94	39.55	43.38
Gumla	79.18	79.44	77.59	83.92
Pakur	76.36	77.55	70.39	80.45
Ranchi	81.64	82.39	81.70	86.79

Table showed that except in Giridih district, 'Drop out ratio' was very high in both primary and upper primary sections of test checked districts. 'Drop out rate' of primary school children in primary sections ranged between 51.38 per cent and 54.66 per cent, while it varied between 66.26 per cent and 81.64 per cent in case of upper primary sections.

3.4.8.3 Pupil Teacher Ratio (PTR)

PTR of the State was 57:1 in 2003-04 as against 40:1

As per the norms of SSA, the Pupil Teacher Ratio (PTR) should be 40:1. Against this, the PTR of the State was 52:1 in 2002-03, 57:1 in 2003-04 and 51:1 in 2004-05 as per the report of District Information System for Education (DISE).

1778 primary and upper primary schools were running with a single teacher

The guidelines provide that there should be minimum of two teachers for each primary school and one teacher in each class in upper primary school. It was, however, noticed that 1,778 primary and upper primary schools in the State were functioning with a single teacher. The highest number of such single teacher schools was in Giridih (324).

Pupil Teacher Ratio in rural blocks was much higher in comparison of the Headquarters' block

As regards rationalisation in the deployment of teachers in urban & rural blocks, it was observed that the PTR in the rural blocks was much higher than the Headquarters' blocks (urban) during 2003-05 as shown below:

Year	District							
	Giridih		Ranchi		Pakur		Dhanbad	
	Urban	Rural	Urban	Rural	Urban	Rural	Urban	Rural
2003-04	57:1	72:1	56:1	58:1	49:1	51:1	49:1	61:1
2004-05	59:1	74:1	49:1	51:1	35:1	58:1	50:1	58:1

3.4.8.4 Utilisation of School and TLM Grant

School Grants and Teacher Learning Material Grants were utilised for Mid-day meal Scheme in violation of SSA guidelines

School Grant at the rate of Rs 2000 per school per year and Rs 500 per teacher per year as Teaching Learning Material (TLM) Grant were to be paid to the primary/upper primary schools for replacement of school equipment and

purchase of learning material respectively. The school grants and TLM grants were utilised for the purchase of utensils, gas connection and cylinders for centrally sponsored 'Mid Day Meal' scheme by the DPOs, Bokaro, Pakur, Dhanbad and Ranchi Districts under the orders of Principal Secretary, Human Resources Development Department during 2004-05 in violation of the guidelines of SSA.

Scrutiny showed that 19,085 (23.8 per cent) schools out of 80,175 had been denied school grants and 1,13,667 (43.71 per cent) teachers out of 2,60,026 were deprived of teachers grant during 2001-06 though Rs 59.42 lakh, in violation of SSA guidelines, was released as school grants to 2,971 EGS Centres in five districts (Bokaro, Dhanbad, Giridih, Pakur and Ranchi) during the same period (2003-05).

3.4.9 Interventions under SSA

3.4.9.1 Intervention for 'out of school' children scheme

Intervention for 'out of school' children consist of several components such as EGS, Alternative School, NGO run EGS, etc. EGS centre was one of the major components of such intervention for 'out of school', where no school existed. During 2001-05, as against the physical target of 6.23 lakh, only 0.29 lakh (less than 5 per cent) children were enrolled under the above components in the test-checked districts and as against the target of Rs 82.93 crore, only Rs 15.57 crore was spent during the same period. Thus, the performance of the scheme was not satisfactory.

3.4.9.2 Shortfalls in Teachers' Training and shortage of teachers

There was shortage of 4,996 (7.82 per cent) teachers (58,905 teachers against sanctioned strength of 63,901) in Primary and Upper Primary Schools in 2004-05. Besides, 15,657 para-teachers were also working. Out of the total target of imparting training to 46,691 in service teachers, only 6,531 teachers (14 per cent) were trained. Out of 37,000 untrained teachers only 10,000 were covered under the Distance Learning Programme of IGNOU. The shortfall was attributed to the non-establishment of District Institute of Education and Training (DIET), non-strengthening of Primary Teachers Training Institute (PTTI) and engagement of teachers in non-academic activities such as revision of electoral rolls, elections, economic survey, etc.

Against the target of imparting training to 46691 in- service teachers only 6531 teachers were trained

3.4.9.3 Short falls in appointment of women para-teachers

The norms of SSA provide that 50 per cent of the para-teachers should be women. In the test checked districts, it was noticed that only 30 per cent (2,979 out of 9,778) of para-teachers appointed were women.

3.4.9.4 Shortfall in Coverage of children with special needs (CWSN)

SSA envisages that every child with special needs, irrespective of the kind, category and degree of disability, is to be provided meaningful and quality

education and support services. Accordingly, the SSA adopts a ‘zero rejection policy’ of education for Children with Special Needs (CWSN) so that no child is left out of the education system.

Scrutiny showed that out of 39,797 CWSN identified, 25,642 (64 *per cent*) were not enrolled. While preparing the budget for CWSN activity, the Government, without ensuring preparation of detailed list of activities for different types of disability and enforcing budgetary commitment, released Rs 2.36 crore in the test check districts during 2002-05. Thus, intervention required for the CWSN was not undertaken in 64 *per cent* cases.

3.4.9.5 Poor performance under innovative activity

The PAB had sanctioned Rs 2.40 crore for Early Childhood Care Education (ECCE), Rs 2.10 crore for Girl Education and Rs 1.80 crore for SC & ST Education in the State under the Innovative Fund. But the release of this fund was contingent upon the preparation and submission of details of activities to be undertaken by June 2005 to the PAB. However, activity-wise details were still to be prepared and submitted to the PAB (August 2005). Thus, no activity of education for girls, SC & ST education, ECCE activity was organized in any of these test checked districts for want of detailed plan.

Out of Rs nine crore for Innovative Activities, Rs 8.47 crore was not utilised

Under ‘Innovative Activity’, Rs nine crore was earmarked for the test checked districts during 2001-05 for Education of Girls, SC/ST Education, Early Childhood Care Education (ECCE) and Computer Education. Out of this, Rs 8.32 crore (94 *per cent*) was not utilised by the test checked districts. The funds could not be utilised for want of preparation of activity-wise plan.

54 computers purchased for Rs 20.94 lakh was not issued to school for want of electricity supply

In Gumla district, funds for computerisation amounting to Rs 29.02 lakh were expended during 2003-05 for purchase and installation of a computer each in 20 schools. Out of these, six schools did not have electric connection. Similarly, in Ranchi District, 54 computers had been purchased during 2004-05 centrally for Rs 20.94 lakh for 54 schools, which were not issued for want of electric supply in those schools.

Rs 1.80 crore provided for computerisation of schools could not be utilised for want of module and curriculum

In Bokaro, Dhanbad, Giridih and Pakur Districts, funds for computerisation of schools amounting to Rs 1.80 crore (Rs 45 lakh to each district) provided during 2002-05 were lying idle with the DPOs or VECs as of September 2005. It was stated (September 2005) by DPO that the funds for computerisation could not be utilised as the module and curriculum for computer education was not prepared by the SPD.

3.4.9.6 Slow progress of Civil Works

Under SSA, various works such as construction of school buildings, additional class rooms, toilets, drinking water facilities, boundary walls, etc. were to be undertaken under ‘civil works’ components. Programme funds on civil works were not to exceed the ceiling of 33 *per cent* of the approved project cost. However, in a particular year’s annual work plan, provision for civil works could be considered up to 40 *per cent* of the annual plan expenditure

depending on the priority assigned to various components of the programme in that year.

Criteria for prioritization of the civil works was not evolved

Against the maximum limit of 33 *per cent* of Annual Grants to be incurred on civil works, in Pakur District, the total expenditure on civil works was Rs 9.54 crore (53 *per cent*) out of Rs 18 crore during 2002-05. Further, utilisation certificate for Rs 4.73 crore (80 *per cent*) were not furnished by the executing agencies to the DPOs as of September 2005. It was also seen that the State did not evolve any criteria for prioritization of the civil works.

Civil works were executed by the VECs in the State. During 2001-02 no physical targets and budget allotments for civil works were assigned. During 2002-05, Rs.266.36 crore was provided for various civil works. The physical progress of works against the targets was:

Works	2002-03			2003-04			2004-05			Work not taken up
	T	C	I	T	C	I	T	C	I	
Block resource Centre	33	NIL	NIL	49	NIL	25	NIL	25	47	10
Cluster Resource Centre	57	NIL	NIL	73	NIL	150	58	152	35	1
School Building	100	NIL	10	254	NIL	150	NIL	194	82	78
Addl. Class room (ACR)	584	NIL	210	3708	34	4110	9303	4451	8881	229
Toilets	635	5	375	1138	12	1620	3844	4040	1016	544
Drinking Water	513	NIL	NIL	1089	69	1510	2673	2820	642	744
	1922	5	595	6311	115	7565	15878	11682	10703	1606

Target–T, Completed–C, In progress–I

It is seen from the above that:

There was very poor progress of work in 2002-03 and 2003-04. As of March 2005, only 11,802 works (48.94 *per cent*) were completed against the total target of 24,111 works while 1,606 works were not taken up at all as of March 2005.

Rs 54.60 lakh for construction of special cluster schools for girls was not utilised

In Giridih District, despite allocation of funds for construction of 179 Additional Class Rooms during 2003-05, the works could not start due to lack of land and land disputes. Further, Rs 54.60 lakh earmarked for the construction of Special Cluster Centers for girls remained unutilised.

Rs 17.04 lakh was given for civil works to Government aided schools

As per the guidelines, funds for civil works under SSA could only be allotted to Government owned schools and not to the Government aided schools. However, in Gumla District it was found that Rs 17.04 lakh was given by DPO Gumla to 59 Government aided schools for civil works during 2003-05.

3.4.9.7 Inadequate School infrastructure

Physical infrastructure for education was inadequate in the State

It was noticed that 1,020 schools had no buildings, 17,523 schools had no toilets, 19,359 schools had no girls' toilets, 20,965 schools had no electricity connections, 3,562 schools had no drinking water facilities and 20,580 schools had no provision of ramps for disabled children despite availability of adequate funds. Thus, the envisaged physical infrastructure in the State to fulfill the objectives of SSA was inadequate.

3.4.9.8 *Block Resource Centres (BRCs) and Cluster Resource Centres (CRCs)*

Poor utilisation of fund for strengthening the BRCs/CRCs

Scrutiny of records of test checked districts showed that out of Rs 1.86 crore released towards strengthening of BRCs during 2002-05 only Rs 26 lakh (14 *per cent*) had been utilised as of March, 2005. Similarly, only Rs 49 lakh (27 *per cent*) was utilised by the test checked districts out of Rs 1.83 crore released towards strengthening of CRCs during 2002-05. No reason for the under utilisation of funds was furnished to Audit. It was also seen that as the construction of BRCs/CRCs was not completed, funds allotted for items like furniture could not be utilised.

3.4.9.9 *Text books*

The Appraisal Team as well as PAB in their reports had suggested that the State should develop its own text books, taking into account the local socio-cultural and ecological conditions which were accepted by the Government. However, the State was using the books developed by NCERT.

Several irregularities in the distribution of the text books provided by NCERT were noticed in the test checked districts as mentioned below:

Books worth Rs 1.77 crore purchased for children of focus groups could not be transported to BRC /CRC for distribution

➤ In Giridih, books valued at Rs 1.77 crore, purchased during 2003-05 from NCERT for children of focus groups, were lying in the godowns and not distributed to children. Thus, the children of focus groups were deprived of the benefit of free text books during the period 2003-05.

Books worth Rs 1.80 crore was purchased for children of focus group in excess of requirement

➤ In Dhanbad, Pakur and Ranchi districts during 2003-05, books in excess of requirement worth Rs 1.80 crore were purchased for the children of focus groups without proper assessment of requirement. Moreover, contrary to the guidelines of SSA, these books were distributed among children outside the focus group.

85 *per cent* of focus group children were not provided the full sets of books

➤ In 18 test checked schools in Dhanbad, Pakur and Ranchi Districts, 10,794 children (85 *per cent*) out of 12,700 focus group children, were not provided full sets of books. No reason for non-supply of full sets of books was furnished by the DPOs.

3.4.9.10 *Involvement of Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs)*

SSA envisages a vibrant partnership with NGOs in the area of capacity building, both in community and in resource institutions. Several activities such as NGO run EGS, Alternative and Innovative Education (AIE), Bridge Course and mainstreaming of 'Out of School' children are proposed to be done in partnership with NGOs under SSA. As of March 2005, 78 NGOs (Out of School Sector-76 and Integrated Education of Disabled Children Sector-2) were involved in implementation of SSA at the state and district levels. No NGO had been selected in the State to assist in ECCE, Quality improvement, Community Mobilization, Capacity Building and Retention Sector.

In Giridih, a sum of Rs 92,000 was pending for adjustment against 33 NGOs since 2003. In reply, it was stated (September 2005) by DPO, Giridih that action would be taken against these NGOs. Similarly, Rs 14.92 lakh was allotted to an NGO during 2003-05 for 100 EGS. However, no account had been submitted by the NGO as of September 2005. Rs 12.03 lakh and Rs 20.35 lakh for establishment of 60 EGS and 67 EGS respectively were sanctioned in 2004-05 to two NGOs. The funds were not released as of September 2005.

NGO spent Rs 11.82 lakh on inadmissible items under training head

During 2003-04, an NGO was provided Rs 49.64 lakh by DPO, Ranchi, for training for State Resource Centre. However, the said NGO spent Rs 11.82 lakh on inadmissible items like purchase of Computer hardware/ software, Laser printers, UPS, Photocopier, Furniture, a Bolero Car, a Motor cycle, Communication equipments, etc. as of March 2004. Thus, SSA fund was misutilised for which no action was initiated against the NGO.

3.4.9.11 Community Mobilization

Out of Rs 93.84 lakh for community mobilization, only 35.02 lakh was utilised due to lack of guideline/ work plan

Community leaders (four persons per village and two teachers per school in the village) were to be trained for two days. It was observed that Village Education Committees (VECs) had been constituted in the State. However, in the test checked districts it was seen that out of 98,023 VECs, only 26,971 VECs (27 per cent) had been trained. Out of the total allotted fund of Rs 93.84 lakh during 2002-05, only Rs 35.02 lakh (37 per cent) had been utilised upto 2004-05 for training of VECs. In reply, it was stated that due to lack of guidance and work plan, training could not be imparted. The Appraisal Team in its report also noted that there was no detailed plan for community mobilization in the State and District Plans.

3.4.9.12 Research, Evaluation, Monitoring and Supervision (REMS)

As per guidelines of SSA, research and evaluation activities are to be undertaken by the Department within the specified period and the research findings disseminated to facilitate quality improvement in teacher learning.

Out of Rs 2.23 crore for REMS, only 28.95 lakh could be spent

The Appraisal Team recommended in 2005-06 that a detailed plan under REMS be prepared by the State. However, no such plan was prepared. In the test checked districts, it was seen that Rs 2.23 crore was provided to 20,935 schools for REMS activities. Of this, only Rs 28.95 lakh (13 per cent) was spent by 709 schools. In reply, it was stated (September 2005) by the DPOs that due to lack of efficient manpower REMS activities could not be undertaken.

3.4.9.13 State Institute of Educational Management and Training (SIEMAT)

State Institute of Education Management and Training not established in spite of an assistance of Rs 3 crore

Out of Rs 3 crore proposed for 2003-06, Rs 2.60 crore was recommended during 2003-04 by the PAB for construction of State Institute of Educational Management and Training (SIEMAT). The Institute was to develop professional competence of the functionaries of school education department in the area of educational planning and management. The SIEMAT could not,

however, be established in the State as of September 2005. In reply it was stated (September 2005) by the SPD that SIEMAT was not established as the State Government had decided to establish State Council of Educational Research and Training (SCERT), which will have SIEMAT as one of its units. However, the SCERT was also not set up as of March, 2006.

3.4.9.14 Project Management

There was a large scale shortage of staff in the project during 2004-05 (details in *Appendix -3.13 & 3.14*). Against the sanctioned strength of 73 posts at the JEPC in different cadres, 41 posts (56 per cent) remained vacant. Out of 423 posts sanctioned in 22 districts, 250 posts (59 per cent) were vacant in different cadres. In DPO Dhanbad, against 11 sanctioned posts, 19 personnel were posted. Both the PAB and the Appraisal Team took a very serious note of the paucity of staff and stated (May 2005) that considering the increase in allocations likely to be made for the scheme in future by the GOI, the SSA activities were likely to suffer a great deal due to shortage of manpower. PAB directed (May 2005) that suitable persons be appointed on contract basis by the State. It also directed the State Government to fill up the vacancies of accounts staff on a priority basis, yet it was not done (September 2005).

Acute shortage of
functionaries of
SSA

Other points

3.4.10 Internal Audit

Internal Audit is one of the important controls that functions by examining and evaluating the adequacy and effectiveness of other controls throughout the organisation. It was, however, observed that no internal audit mechanism was put in place by the SPD. Thus, there was no check of possible misutilisation, including misappropriation and also for rectification of irregularities, if any.

3.4.11 Impact Evaluation

Xavier's Labour Research Institute (XLRI), Jamshedpur was selected as an external monitoring agency for monitoring activities under SSA. The evaluation work commenced in August –September 2004 for 2003-04. The Institute covered only three districts (Gumla, Dhanbad and Bokaro) for evaluation. The report disclosed that 14 Schools in Dhanbad did not have buildings of their own and 339 schools in Gumla did not have drinking water facilities. As regards CWSN for 765 disabled children, nothing had been done in Gumla and both enrollment as well as absence from school was high, which is a matter of great concern. Hence concerted efforts were required for retaining children in schools.

SPD did not conduct any evaluation to ascertain the impact of the scheme during the last four years.

Audit also observed non fulfillment of basic criteria for implementation of the scheme like shortage of teachers, schools without having buildings of their own and shortage of books.

3.4.12 Conclusion

The implementation of the programme suffered due to inadequate planning and under utilisation of funds particularly in the first two years of its implementation. The objective to have all children either in a school or in an alternative schooling facility by 2005 had not been achieved as of March 2006 and with the present pace of implementation, the achievement of the objective to ensure that all children complete five years of primary schooling by 2007, eight years of elementary schooling and universal retention by 2010 appears to be impossible. The total number of 'out of school' children was 3.66 lakh as of March 2006. The Pupil Teacher Ratio in the State was very high. The 'drop out rate' in the State was very high, reflecting unsatisfactory implementation of the scheme. In Non-Formal Education scheme, enrollment was very poor.

Provision of infrastructure such as school buildings, classrooms, toilets, drinking water facilities, compound walls, libraries, electric connections etc. was inadequate. About 50 *per cent* of civil works relating to construction of school buildings, classrooms, toilets, and provisions for drinking water facilities, etc. remained incomplete. There was shortage of trained community leaders. The training of teachers was also highly inadequate.

The internal audit mechanism, though envisaged under SSA, had not yet been put in place by the SPD. The monitoring mechanism was also inadequate.

3.4.13 Recommendations

- Adequate steps should be taken to avoid delay in approval of the annual plan by the PAB and release of funds.
- Government should expedite steps for mainstreaming of all 'out of school' children with special focus on girls and SC and ST children.
- Access to schools should be provided for all urban and rural blocks.
- Training to all in-service teachers, etc. should be provided as envisaged in SSA guidelines. The working of teachers also needs to be thoroughly monitored. Appointments and deployment of teachers/para teachers should be made adequately and rationally for improving the pupil teacher ratio.
- Adequate infrastructure facilities should be provided in all the schools and monitoring at all levels should be ensured for timely completion of civil works.
- NGOs engaged with the scheme should be closely supervised and monitored.
- SIEMAT should be established in the State immediately.

The matter was reported to the Government (September 2005); their reply had not been received (November 2006).

FOREST AND ENVIRONMENT DEPARTMENT

3.5 'Conservation of Tiger and Eco-Development'

Highlights

Project Tiger, a wildlife conservation project, was launched in 1973 as a Centrally Sponsored Scheme to ensure maintenance of a viable population of tigers. India Eco-Development Project (IEDP) was launched in October 1997 with World Bank assistance with the objective to conserve biodiversity through eco-development and improved protected area management. There was little evidence of protection measures having been undertaken in Jharkhand. The tiger census conducted every year is not very scientific and, therefore, unreliable. No action has been taken for checking encroachment or for the relocation of people from the Tiger Reserve.

Palamu Tiger Reserve (PTR) lost the benefit of central assistance of Rs 69.03 lakh due to inadequate utilisation of fund which impacted the implementation of programme.

[Paragraph 3.5.5.1]

Tiger census was unscientific and unsystematic. Measures to protect tigers and other wildlife from poaching in the PTR were inadequate.

[Paragraph 3.5.7.1]

Non-relocation of villages outside the core area and non-consolidation of boundaries of PTR left PTR open to interference from outside and made PTR vulnerable to encroachment and posed a grave risk of human and cattle population on PTR. This defeated the objective of conservation of endangered flora and fauna in PTR.

[Paragraphs 3.5.7.4 & 3.5.7.5]

Though PTR had a great potential for tourism, tourism management plan was not formulated. Number of tourists declined drastically.

[Paragraph 3.5.9.1]

Sixty five microplans and 30 SHGs were drawn up and formed against 199 mandated, which hampered programme implementation. The involvement of the local communities in the protection and conservation of the forest and wildlife was much less than the extent envisaged.

[Paragraph 3.5.10.2]

There was shortage in key functionaries of field level officials and the Department had not initiated any action to fill up the vacancies.

[Paragraph 3.5.11.1]

3.5.1 Introduction

The tiger has become, in a way, a symbol of the whole wildlife and nature conservation movement in India. For a viable tiger population, a habitat should possess a good prey base which in turn will depend on an undisturbed forest vegetation. Thus, 'Project Tiger' is the conservation of the entire ecosystem. Palamu Tiger Reserve (PTR) was constituted in 1974 having an area of 1,026 sq kms with a wide range of biodiversity and wildlife species. The State Government, in exercise of the powers conferred by Section 18 of the Wildlife (Protection) Act, 1972 (Central Act), had declared (July 1979) the PTR covering an area of 979.97 sq km as Palamu Wildlife Sanctuary. GOI approved inclusion of tiger sanctuary under the centrally sponsored scheme of 'Project Tiger'.

The objectives of the Project Tiger are to ensure the maintenance of viable population of tiger, preserve for all times, areas of such biological importance and as a national heritage for the benefit, education and enjoyment of the people. The stress was on conservation of endangered flora & fauna with specific stress on saving the tiger with its prey base and habitat.

3.5.2 Organisational set-up

Secretary is the Head of the Forest & Environment Department with responsibility for planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the Project Tiger and IEDP. Principal Chief Conservator of Forests (PCCF), Biodiversity, Conservation cum Chief Wildlife Warden, is the Head of the Wildlife wing at State level. He is assisted by Chief Conservator of Forest (CCF), Wildlife Biodiversity at Headquarter level and three Conservator of Forest (CF), (Project Tiger Circle, Core Area and Buffer Area), two Assistant Conservators of Forest, eight Range Officers, 24 Beats and 132 Sub-beats at field level (including one Mahuadanr range with three Beats outside PTR).

3.5.3 Audit Objectives

The main objectives of this performance audit review were to assess whether:

- release of funds and utilisation thereof was in accordance with management plan / annual plan of operation (APO);
- the implementation of the programme was done effectively;
- effective protection measures for sustainable management of the reserve were taken up;
- promotional activities were undertaken in the Tiger Reserve;
- man power was adequate and deployed effectively;
- monitoring and evaluation mechanisms were in place.

3.5.4 Scope and Methodology of audit

Implementation of 'Conservation of Tiger and Eco-Development' was reviewed in audit during December 2005 to February 2006 by test check of records of the Department of Forest and Environment, offices of the PCCF, Biodiversity, Conservation cum Chief Wildlife Warden, Jharkhand, CCF, Wildlife Biodiversity Jharkhand, CF, Project Tiger Circle, CF Buffer Area and CF Core Area, Daltonganj for the period from 2001-06.

An entry conference was held (February 2006) with the Chief Conservator of Forest where the objectives of audit were discussed. Exit conference was also held with the PCCF (November 2006) where the findings of the review was discussed. The results of the review are presented in the succeeding paragraphs.

Audit findings

3.5.5 Financial Management

GOI provides 100 *per cent* assistance for non-recurring expenditure and 50 *per cent* for recurring expenditure, while the remaining 50 *per cent* of the recurring expenditure is borne by the State Government under Project Tiger; whereas International Development Association, Global Environment Facility and Government of India jointly finance the IEDP.

As per Project Tiger guidelines, budgetary assumptions are to be prepared based on requirements/utilisation of earlier releases. Utilisation certificates of funds released to various agencies should be obtained timely and before the release of the next installment of funds. In addition, funds earmarked for specific activities in the APO should not be diverted to other activities.

3.5.5.1 Utilisation of fund in Project Tiger

The details of sanction and the expenditure incurred on the scheme during 2001-2006 were as follows:

(Rupees in lakh)

Year	Sanctioned APOs				Expenditure			Savings		
	Central Share		State Share (Recurring)	Total	Non - Recurring	Recurring	Total	Non-Recurring	Recurring	Total
	Non - Recurring	Recurring								
2001-02	15.95	65.50	63.63	145.08	15.77	120.14	135.91	(-) 0.18	(-) 8.99	(-) 9.17
2002-03	64.24	18.12	18.00	100.36	59.24	35.50	94.74	(-) 5.00	(-) 0.62	(-) 5.62
2003-04	19.50	16.73	16.73	52.96	19.50	28.70	48.20	NIL	(-) 4.76	(-) 4.76
2004-05	33.50	41.14	41.08	115.72	31.58	78.46	110.04	(-) 1.92	(-) 3.76	(-) 5.68
2005-06	141.94	59.87	59.87	261.68	93.87	112.20	206.07	(-) 48.07	(-) 7.54	(-) 55.61
Total	275.13	201.36	199.31	675.80	219.96	375.00	594.96	(-) 55.17	(-) 25.67	(-) 80.84

Non-utilisation of Central assistance

It may be seen from the table that there was saving of Rs 80.84 lakh during 2001-02 to 2005-06. Of this, savings of Rs 69.03 lakh pertain Central assistance and PTR, thus, lost the benefit of central assistance to that extent, which impacted programme implementation. The reason for under utilisation

during 2005-06 under non-recurring head was due to non-finalisation of the proposal for creation of task force.

3.5.5.2 Fund utilisation in IEDP

Since inception of the project, the State Government received Rs 16.10 crore (from 1997-98 to 2004-05) from the World Bank, of which Rs 2.92 crore was incurred upto 2000-01. The details of sanction and expenditure under the scheme during 2001-05 were as follows:

(Rupees in lakh)

Year	Fund approved in APO	Sanctioned by GOI	Opening Balance	Released by GOI	Total	Expenditure	Closing balance
2001-02	560.00	360.00	209.02	325.67	534.69	262.12	272.57
2002-03	525.00	525.00	272.57	252.39	524.96	412.59	112.37
2003-04	308.24	308.24	112.37	195.84	308.21	259.91	48.30
2004-05	48.33	0	48.30	0	48.30	33.70	14.60
Total	1441.57	1193.24		773.90		968.32	

The project was closed in July 2004. It is seen from the above table that funds could not be utilised due to non-release of fund by GOI. The reasons for non-release of fund by GOI were not on record. Rs 9.68 crore could be utilised during the period 2001-05 against the sanction of Rs 11.93 crore by GOI and Rs 14.60 lakh was refunded in March 2005. The central assistance to the extent of Rs 4.19 crore could not be released, which adversely affected the implementation of the project as mentioned in Para 3.5.10.

It was further noticed that delayed release of funds ranging from 2-10 months by State Government to field formations hindered smooth implementation of the programme and under utilisation of fund. Since PTR was unable to spend the funds allotted to it in the previous years, the amount of fund made available to it in the succeeding years was reduced.

3.5.5.3 Excess expenditure due to non-adherence of orders

A scrutiny of records relating to soil conservation work done for 128 hectares (2002-03) under Improved Protected Area management and for 1074 hectares (2002-04) under discretionary fund disclosed that contour trenches (2970 cft earth work per hectare) were made in 1202 hectares utilising 90150 mandays instead of 41999 mandays at Rs 64.61 per manday as per orders issued by PCCF, Jharkhand (February 2003). This resulted in an excess expenditure of Rs 31.11 lakh due to non-adherence of orders of the PCCF, which was avoidable.

CCF stated (November 2006) that 75 mandays was provided for 2970 cft earth work including demarcation, bush cutting and alignments of contour sites. The reply is not acceptable as no such works were mentioned in the said order. Further, PCCF had fixed (February 2003) the quantity of earth work to be done per manday while digging contour trenches.

3.5.5.4 *Misappropriation of Government money*

Misappropriation of Government money

Fuel saving devices were to be distributed among the villagers to reduce the pressure on extraction of fuel wood from the forest. Accordingly, an advance of Rs 10.16 lakh was given in two installments (Rs 9.67 lakh- 1 March 2004 and Rs 0.49 lakh-31 March 2004) to an agency, the only authorised LPG dealer at Daltonganj for supply of 713 gas connections with chulhas. It was seen from the records that only 133 connections valued at Rs 1.89 lakh were supplied against 713 connections. The second payment to supplier was made without obtaining supply of equipment against the first payment. The remaining 580 connections were not supplied and Rs 8.27 lakh was lying with the gas agency as of March 2006. The gas agency was finally closed (July 2004) and the amount remained un-recovered. This resulted in misappropriation of Government money to the tune of Rs 8.27 lakh. FIR was lodged against the proprietor and Area Manager. Action for institution of money suit/certificate case against the agency was under process.

3.5.5.5 *Creation of development fund*

Non-Creation of Development Fund

National Wildlife Action Plan (NWAP) required creation of Local Trust Fund (Development Fund) operated by Joint Committee, headed by Protected Area Manager with the tourism receipts and penalties collected in the Park. Out of the total revenue, 70 *per cent* was to be utilised for community benefit programme and 30 *per cent* for Park management and development. PCCF/CCF Wildlife, however, did not issue any instruction for creation of such fund as of November 2006. As such, revenue generated during the period 2001-06 amounting to Rs 14.32 lakh, was remitted to the treasury under forest receipt head.

3.5.6 Planning

Management plan is an instrument which ensures policy based action for managing resources within the Tiger Reserve. The management plan needs also periodic evaluation and revision as per the guidelines issued by GOI. The management plan contains detail of programmes and APOs should be prepared on the basis of such plan. It was, however, observed that there was no linkage between the management plan and APO. The management plan was also not revised and evaluated as of November 2006.

3.5.7 Programme Management

The management of PTR was to issue final notification for declaration of PTR as sanctuary, to divide the park into various zones according to potential use and relocate people living in the core area of the PTR to areas outside the park. As per GOI directions, PTR management had to prepare maps of various aspects of the Tiger Reserve and update them regularly.

Anomalies in Tiger census

3.5.7.1 Anomalies in Tiger census

The main emphasis laid down for census, for both tigers and leopards, is collection of field information from the forest blocks by tracing pug marks and assessing population. It is based on the assumption that each tiger has unique pugmarks by which it can be identified. The ‘pug mark’ counting method is prone to human error as it relies on the “integrity of the primary data collectors, data compilers and their supervisors”.

Experts from reputed institutes were to be involved in the estimation process. The guidelines were to be scrupulously followed for estimation of tigers and other prey species. Test check, however, showed that annual tiger estimation was being conducted in PTR by untrained frontline staff without involving experts in the field on the basis of pug marks which was not a very scientific method for census. It was against the guidelines issued by MOEF from time to time for tiger estimation which provides for day to day compilation of data by Range offices involving experts at beat guard level to facilitate generation of spatial maps and development of reliable indices of tiger densities. No census was conducted in 2005. However, it was estimated by the department that number of tigers were 36-38 in PTR. Tiger distribution and spatial distribution maps were generated in 2004-05, but neither age analysis of tigers was done nor was prey-predator ratio, which had a bearing on food chain availability for tigers, assessed.

The details of wildlife population was as under-

	1992	2000	2002	2003	2004
Tiger	55	37-38	38-40	36-38	38
Leopard	60	53-55	59-60	62	62
Cheetal	15688	12969	14375	12586	13147
Sambhar	2580	2389	2429	2218	2257
Bison	727	322	246	249	260
Wild Boar	8269	9227	11378	13391	14414
Elephant	115	175	181-199	205-215	260
Wild Dog	495	363	389	469	647
Hyena	66	125	218	264	264

The reasons for decrease in the number of tigers in PTR was not analysed by the department.

CCF stated (November 2006) that the frontline staff were trained before every census operation and the estimation of tiger population and monitoring was done continuously and reported to GOI monthly. The reply was not acceptable as no such records regarding the training of frontline staff and monthly reports were available / shown to Audit.

3.5.7.2 Issuance of notification

As against the present area of 1026 sq kms, 979.97 sq kms was declared in July 1979 as Palamu Wildlife Sanctuary. The remaining area of 46 sq kms out

of 1026 sq kms was still lying unprotected as the same was not notified till date.

3.5.7.3 Creation of Zones in Tiger Reserve

Non-zonation of PTR

Management Plan stipulates classification of the area of a park/ sanctuary in four zones—Core Zone, Habitat Management Zone, Buffer Zone and Tourism Zone. It was noticed that the project guidelines prescribed for maintaining minimum of 300 sq km Core area in the Tiger Reserve. No action was, however, taken to extend the core zone area. Hence, preservation of the rich bio diversity in its natural state would not be easy.

3.5.7.4 Consolidation of boundaries

Demarcation of boundaries by fixing pillars, boundary walls etc after proper survey in the notified parks or sanctuaries was essential under Wildlife Protection Act, 1972.

The work of Survey and Demarcation of boundaries was done only in 239.5 km as against 6166 km (external and internal boundary) proposed in Management Plan up to 2005-06. This left PTR open to interference from outside and made PTR vulnerable to encroachment thereby, posing a grave risk to the flora and fauna of the park.

3.5.7.5 Relocation of villages

Non-relocation of villages

According to WII guidelines, there is a need in each Tiger Reserve to have an area free from human interference and other activities that serves as a core for breeding tigers. To keep biotic pressure at a minimum, the State Government was required to prepare and implement a time-bound programme to assist voluntary relocation and rehabilitation of people living in Tiger Reserve. However, three tribal villages, Ramandag, Lato and Kujrum with a population of 630 were located in the core area of PTR. Also, there were 161 villages in the buffer zone of the Reserve and 35 around it within a radius of five kms. The total human population in these villages had been projected at over 1.05 lakh with a cattle population of 87,000. The State Government had not yet prepared any relocation plan, even for villages inside the core zone. No strategy was outlined for relocation in the Management Plan causing human and cattle pressure on PTR.

3.5.7.6 Non-updation of required maps

Baseline maps were prepared and included in Management Plan. These maps are not updated. Field Director stated (February 2006) that map on spatial distribution of Tigers and map showing Tiger movement zones were prepared. However, these were not produced to audit.

3.5.8 Protection measures

As per National Wildlife Action Plan, PTR management has to put in place measures for the control of poaching, taxidermy and illegal trade of wild animals and plant species. In addition, full proof measures such as communication network should be well developed to counter the threat of poaching. The forest guards should be provided with arms and ammunition to check poaching. Fire protection should be undertaken to ensure the safety of the endangered animals and plants.

3.5.8.1 Measures for the Control of Poaching

There should be a formal mechanism between forest department and other law enforcement agencies to share intelligence to check poaching. The State Government had stationed a contingent of armed police for patrolling (June 2004) in the forest. Forestry/ wildlife personnel were not provided status at par with police in use of weapons. Funds for creation of Strike Force were provided only in 2005-06. Only PTR staff were posted at exit points. No training in prosecution matters relating to wildlife offences was given to frontline staff. Regional Wildlife Forensic labs were not set up as mandated. As per PTR reports, no tiger mortality had occurred since 1996.

In reply CCF stated (November 2006) that effort was being made to check poaching.

3.5.8.2 Wireless Network

Wireless networks are an effective means of communication for protection against biotic interference. Means of communication in PTR are inadequate; all beat guards, sub-beat guards, fire watch towers and patrolling camps were not equipped with wireless. Only four wireless sets were provided to 14 entry points of the PTR out of 19 Foresters, wireless sets were provided only to 12 officers. Thus, a major portion of the reserve was left without adequate wireless network. The wireless networks in the reserve were not sufficient for better communication to stop the risk from poachers.

In reply CCF stated (November 2006) that wireless network could not be extended due to poor law & order situation.

3.5.8.3 Arms and Ammunition

Only seven DBBL Guns and seven Rifles were available in PTR. The actual requirement was not assessed. Arms were withdrawn from field staff due to fear of looting by Naxals. No formal training was given in use of arms. Protection at night was inadequate as forest guards used sticks for patrolling. Besides, the frontline staff of the reserve were not empowered to use arms and ammunition at par with police.

In reply CCF stated (November 2006) that use of weapons by the park staff was not being done due to poor law and order situation.

3.5.8.4 Fire protection

Every year, huge areas were burnt in wild fire. It was noticed that as against the target of 1768.50 km fire line to be constructed as per management plan, only 1356 km fire line was constructed during 2001-06. Shortfall (412.50 km) in fire protection indicates inadequate fire protection measures were taken by the authority.

3.5.9 Promotional activities in tiger reserve

3.5.9.1 Tourism Management Plan (TMP)

Non-formulation of Tourism Management Plan

PTR has a great potential for tourism. It is essential to develop/increase infrastructure facilities like better accommodation, good catering, regular electricity supply, good transport system, marketing facilities, check posts and barriers, children corners etc. to develop tourism. The TMP, which was to be completed by 2004 has not yet been finalised (September 2006). CF, Project Tiger Circle stated that there were adequate infrastructure facilities and there was no negative impact on tourism due to non-formulation of TMP. However, it was observed that the number of tourists was constantly declining since 1995 and it has declined from 52,410 during 1993 to 13,805 in 2005.

CF stated that the reason for decreasing number of tourists was law and order problem.

3.5.9.2 Research and Development

Research is a tool for better understanding of nature of Project Tiger, its functions and to enable optimum utilisation of resources. But neither research and monitoring unit nor laboratory were established by PTR management which could have facilitated collection of basic data, census, eco analysis, documentation and its use in planning and monitoring. Tiger Task Force recommended audit by an independent body for reputational advantage. It was also suggested to improve criteria and indicators for rating which may be used for management decisions and create public opinion about working of individual reserves and inform Parliament about the progress in tiger conservation and challenges ahead. Although eight short term studies on different topics were conducted by PTR, the findings of these studies had not been incorporated in the Management Plan.

3.5.10 India Eco Development Project (IEDP)

IEDP was implemented as a Pilot Project in seven Protected Areas including PTR (Jharkhand) since 1997-98. It was implemented in three phases viz. Phase-I (October 1998–September 2002), Phase-II (October 2002–June 2003) and Phase-III (July 2003–June 2004).

The required activities envisaged in all the three phases were- Village Development activities inclusive of awareness programme, creation of Eco Development Committees, Village Development Fund (VDF), SHGs,

protection of forest and wildlife, help in anti poaching activities, protection from fire, assistance in controlling illicit felling, grazing, conducting joint patrolling to provide information on illegal felling and illicit trade.

3.5.10.1 Achievement of objectives under IEDP

Project cost of IEDP reduced

Total project cost of IEDP in Palamu was kept initially at Rs 38 crore (118 Villages) by World Bank. This was reduced to Rs 16.1 crore after Mid-Term Review (2000) by the World Bank due to non-finalisation of consultancy for micro-planning of village eco-development, delayed release of funds by the State Government, inadequate field staff, lack of training for eco-development activities, lack of periodical monitoring etc. Hence, PTR lost out on funding of Rs 21.9 crore which could have been used to implement IEDP activities for reducing man- animal conflict and reducing biotic pressure on the Tiger Reserve. Of Rs 16.1 crore of funds approved by the World Bank, PTR was able to spend only Rs 12.6 crore, even after extension of project for two years. This indicated that no planning was done to utilise the funds being made available by World Bank. The Department conducted neither any preliminary study for implementation of IEDP nor Feasibility Study and Detailed Project Report for IEDP. Hence, the whole project design and implementation was faulty which led to non achievement of stated objectives. The reasons for shortfall were not furnished by the department. Some of the interesting points noticed are given below:

3.5.10.2 Preparation of microplans and Self Help Groups (SHGs)

To reduce the dependency of indigenous stakeholder communities dwelling on Tiger reserves and ensuring their socio-economic welfare through eco-development to elicit support for conservation, eco-development programmes were to be implemented in all the villages which lie in the buffer zone of the Tiger Reserve. Accordingly, microplans had to be drawn up for each of the villages in the buffer zone which would be a blueprint for implementation of IEDP programmes in that particular village. Only 65 microplans were, however, drawn up and implemented against 199 villages.

Similarly 30 SHGs were formed instead of 199. Thus, the idea behind IEDP to involve the local communities in the protection and conservation of the forest and its wildlife was defeated.

3.5.10.3 Creation of Eco-Development Committees (EDCs)

Community participation, to reduce pressure on protected area, was to be ensured through creation of EDCs in all villages around the PTR. Only 65 EDCs were created instead of 199 which indicated lack of proper planning and monitoring in implementing activities under IEDP.

However, CCF stated (November 2006) that 170 EDCs had been created. But no document / evidence was furnished in support.

3.5.10.4 Reciprocal commitments not met

Reciprocal commitments were not being met as evidenced by the frequency of protected area patrolling by villagers with forest staff which was organized only on 24 occasions in 2003 and 2004. EDC in Kechki in 2003 assisted forest department in two seizures of illegally felled timber. Apart from this, no records were produced to audit *viz.* patrolling registers which could reflect the reciprocal commitments by villagers.

3.5.11 Manpower management

3.5.11.1 Vacancies in key posts

Field level officials *i.e.* rangers, foresters and forest guards are responsible for protection and conservation of wildlife. They should be suitably deployed and adequately trained to carry out their assigned activities effectively. The NWAP required the Government to strengthen existing mechanism for recruitment, training and development of personnel to achieve the objectives of wildlife conservations.

There was a shortage of 46 *per cent* of forest guards in the PTR. The department had not initiated any action to fill up the vacancies of the key functionaries, which were absolutely crucial for the effective functioning of PTR. According to WII, the age of a forest guard and forester should range between 18-35 years but the average age of a forester and a guard in PTR was 51 years and 53 years respectively. The department had not initiated any action to tackle the issue of aging staff.

3.5.11.2 Training of field functionaries

To achieve the objectives of wildlife management, proper training was to be imparted in wildlife management involving arms training, habitat improvement, behavioral pattern of animals, migrating pattern, food and breeding habits, census methods etc. The frontline staff were not provided any training on wildlife management. This affected the management of PTR.

3.5.12 Monitoring & Evaluation

The Department and the PCCF office did not have any effective MIS system and for any information, it had to be collected from the field formation. It was also seen that all the report and returns prescribed for monitoring were being sent as and when called for, without prescribing any periodicity.

3.5.13 Conclusion

The main objective of Project Tiger and IEDP was to ensure a viable population of tiger in India to preserve for all time, areas of biological importance as a natural heritage for the benefit, education and enjoyment of the people. There were delays in the release of funds and funds were not

utilised properly. The whole area of the PTR was not notified under Section 18 of the Wildlife Act. Non-computation of zoning of the Park and non-consolidation of boundaries led to the PTR being vulnerable to encroachment. Villagers were not relocated from the core areas. Methods of estimation of tigers were suspect defeating the very objective of these schemes. Staff were not properly trained. There was shortage of frontline staff and there was no plan to replace the ageing frontline staff. Protection measures for control of poaching were not yet done. Non-achievement of targets in the implementation of IEDP was also noticed due to which funding was reduced. Microplans were not prepared for all the villages in the buffer zone resulting in the PTR being vulnerable to human and cattle pressure. Creation of SHGs and EDCs were inadequate.

3.5.14 Recommendations

- Government should ensure timely release of fund to the executing agency for development in a systematic manner.
- The remaining area of PTR should be notified immediately under Section 18 of the Wildlife Act.
- For the census of tigers, in addition to pug marks, a “peer-reviewed, scientific” method under which counting involves several stages, use of cameras, testing of DNA samples and mapping tiger density using Geographic Information Systems (GIS) as suggested by the MOEF for the 2006 All India Census should be adopted.
- Consolidation of the PTR should be given utmost priority and effective steps taken to relocate the villages that exist within the sanctuary.
- Frontline staff should be trained more effectively in wildlife issues and effective measures should be taken to equip the frontline staff with the required arms and ammunition with operational training.
- Monitoring and implementation of Project Tiger should be strengthened both at FDPT and PCCF (Wildlife) level.

The above points were reported to the Government (May 2006); their reply had not been received (November 2006).