

2/2

**Office of the Principal Accountant General (Audit-I), Madhya Pradesh
Audit Bhawan, Jhansi Road, Gwalior-474002**

**Minutes of the meeting of Madhya Pradesh State Audit Advisory Board
held on 21.03.2022**

Second meeting of 6th State Audit Advisory Board (SAAB) of Madhya Pradesh was held under the Chairmanship of Shri D. Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I), Madhya Pradesh, Gwalior. The members present in the meeting is detailed in **Annexure-A**.

At the outset Dr. Mohd. Suhail Fazal, Dy. Accountant General (AMG-I/III) and Member Secretary-Cum-Convener greeted each of the members on the Board. All the external members and ex-officio members introduced themselves to the Board. Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) and Chairperson inaugurated the SAAB meeting and welcomed all the members of the Board.

Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) and Chairperson in his inaugural remarks stressed upon theme based compliance audits, the consultative process at every level and the district visits which resulted in the departments requesting for audit of specific/comprehensive areas for audit. He also stated that we are trying to take up topics which are relevant, qualitative and to ensure good governance which are directly related to all sections of society are being taken up..

He also touched upon the recently tabled Dial-100 Report and stated that the Report has been well received by Government of Madhya Pradesh. He also stated that the topic of Dial-100 was never taken-up and was the first time this office has taken-up the topic. The press and media have reported widely about Dial-100. He further stated that efforts are made to choose public centric audit and cited the report on Water Supply Management, wherein he stated that the regularity of water supply, sufficiency and quality of water supply were some of the indicators and also informed about the Food Safety Act, wherein food sample were taken from Mahakaal Temple, Ujjain and Maihar, Satna to check the quality of the 'prasada'.

He further requested the external members to give suggestions/inputs on the topics proposed in the Annual Audit Plans 2022-23 and may also suggest some other topics of their choice based on their knowledge and experience for future audit plans.

After the welcome speech, Shri Jitendra Tiwari, Dy. Accountant General/AMG-V/Admn, of O/o Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) started the Power-Point Presentation before the members of Board on the brief audit profile of the office and on the topics included in the Annual Audit Plan 2022-23 (enclosed as **Annexure-B**).

Thereafter Dr. Mohd. Suhail Fazal, Dy. Accountant General (AMG-I/III) and Member Secretary-Cum-Convener gave the presentation on the topics,

2/15

followed by the presentation of Shri Sanjay Sahu, Dy. Accountant General (AMG-II/IV).

After the presentation of Gwalior office, Shri B.B.Bhirud, Dy. Accountant General/AMG-III presented the PPT of O/o Accountant General (Audit-II) Bhopal office on the topics of Annual Audit Plan 2022-23. The details of the topics are enclosed as **Annexure-C**.

During the presentation on the topics of the AAP 2022-23 of both the offices, suggestions/inputs of the Members were given on the following topics:

1. On the topic '**Audit of Traffic Management System in major cities of Madhya Pradesh**', Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) and Chairperson informed the Board about the presentation given by the Addl. Director General of Police (Traffic), Madhya Pradesh wherein he informed that Madhya Pradesh stands at No.1 position in road accidents and the death rates were also too high when compared to the population of Madhya Pradesh which is about 7 crore vs. Uttar Pradesh where population is around 24 crore. He further stated that 50 *per cent* of accidents are of two-wheeler users. Every year vehicular traffic is increasing at rapid pace. He further added that except in 'Fiji', Audit on Traffic Management has not been known to have been done.

- He further informed that after the betterment of the roads, accidents were on the rise, because the traffic sense among the public has not changed probably. IEC activities in this regard were almost negligible.

- He also stated that as per the National Highway Rules, the trucks should ride on the left most lane, whereas they always ride on the right most lane. During interaction with some truck drivers, they stated that the villagers, cyclists and other people travel on the left side, which causes more accidents. He also stressed upon the issue of cattle on the roads due to which number of accidents occur.

- He also stated that a separate land for two wheelers should be considered, so that the accident comes down drastically.

i. Shri Manoj Kumar Shrivastava, Retd. IAS suggested/gave inputs on the above topic as detailed below:

- He stated that Supreme Court has ordered to remove the liquor shops from the highways, as it causes accidents and has set up a committee in this regard. Hence we should make an impact assessment of the instructions/recommendations whether accidents actually came down because of removal of liquor shops from highways affects the revenue of the State Government.

- The vehicular traffic should be clearly defined and there should be a limit on the vehicular capacity in respect of each city accordingly as is done by some of the developed countries.

- Conscious planning should be done and issues of encroachments made on the roads should also be looked into during the course of audit and whether the traffic management committees were formed at appropriate levels or not should be seen. He also stressed on the assessment of impact of Bus Rapid Transit System (BRTS) of traffic management as the same may not be very suitable to Indian road condition.

- He stressed upon the need for strengthening Traffic Management Committees whether the State, Divisional, District and Sub-Divisional committees were formed. The issue of periphery control of roads should also be looked during the course of audit. He also stated to look in to the use of fund for Road Safety.

ii. Shri Rahul Noronha, Associate Editor, India Today suggested/gave inputs on the above topic as detailed below:

- The issue of licensing process should be examined as a large number of people get licenses without actually being tested by Regional Transport Office (RTO), which cause road accidents.

- He also stated that emphasis on the traffic bearing capacity of the roads should be taken into consideration while conducting the audit of the above topic and not only traffic capacity of a city.

- He stressed on the importance of sufficient space for parking of vehicles at important public utility spaces and whether pedestrians and disabled friendly has been considered while designing roads.

- He further suggested that land use and adequate permission for construction of roads should be explored including adequate arrangement of space on the roads for the pedestrians.

iii. Shri Parshuram Tiwari, Social Expert, suggested to examine the financial assistance provided to NGOs by the Ministry of Road Transport and Highways (MoRTH), GoI, as significant funds are allotted for the projects by the Transport Department to these NGOs for awareness purpose.

iv) Shri Yogesh Kumar, Executive Director, Samarthan, suggested/gave inputs on the above topic as detailed below:

- He emphasized to conduct a survey of cyclists and sensitize about the traffic rules and create awareness to avoid accidents. He also stated that there should be an inbuilt mechanism for the people to follow the traffic rules and the users' perspective should also be taken into account.

- For survey he suggested to devise participatory tools or reports cards with specific indicators with regard to traffic management.

- He also stated that manpower management during the peak traffic hours should be looked into and it should be ensured that sufficient manpower is deployed for the traffic management.

- He also emphasized on strict monitoring system, as there was a lackluster attitude of the police personnel in checking of license and other issues. People normally bribe them and defy the traffic rules.

v. Ms. Vaishali Chowdhary, President, SHG stated that the audit should come-up with some specific recommendation so that the traffic rules are followed strictly. She also stated that the traffic police overlooks the riders riding against the sanctioned capacity and also the trucks and tractors normally run overloaded defying the traffic rules.

vi. Shri Jitendra Tiwari, DAG-AMG-V and Admin, emphasized on the issue of non-compliance for the number of challans issued for not obeying the traffic rules. He informed the Board that there was huge pendency as the amount of challan is piling up gradually. He also cited about a audit paragraph floated by audit in this regard in Indore which was about ₹ 4 crore.

vii. During final discussion on the topic Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) and Chairperson stated that as per the data available which is to be further authenticated, there is 50 per cent vacancy in traffic department, and out of the available 50 per cent, 30 per cent are mostly on VIP duty. He also informed the Board that in Madhya Pradesh if a female rider does not wear a helmet, then it is not a offence, as there is no provision in the Act. He also took up the issue of permission given to open/construct hospitals at the main crossing of the cities, as this causes more traffic and should be avoided by all means.

2. On the topic '**Audit of Management and Distribution of Fertilizers in Madhya Pradesh**', the members suggested/gave inputs on the topic as detailed below:

i. Shri Manoj Kumar Shrivastava, suggested/gave inputs on the above topic as detailed below:

- Adequate and effective planning should be done. He stated that targets are normally fixed at the top-level by 10 per cent addition to the previous targets. Therefore it should be fixed at district level. He also stated that achievement of targets should not be the only criteria, first it should be need based and beneficial to the farmers. Hence need assessment should be done first and these issues are to be checked during the course of audit.

- He stated that the use of bio-fertilizers should be encouraged and enhanced significantly to avoid the indiscriminate use of fertilizers. Excessive use of chemical fertilizers should be checked at appropriate levels. Further he also stated that the steps taken by the Department to reduce the use of chemical fertilizers should be seen in terms of whether the 'neem' coated urea has yielded the desired result.

- He stated that all the subsidy support is provided on chemical fertilizers and no support/subsidy is provided on bio-fertilizers. Hence farmers are less inclined towards it due to its costs and the labour involved in it.

209

Therefore farmers should be apprised of the benefits of bio-fertilizers through IEC activities and create maximum awareness.

- He also emphasized on farm level planning/bottom-up planning, where the inputs could be taken from the farmers based on the Khasra, which fertilizer they need and at what time they need. He further stated that in view of PM's goal to double the farmers income, he stated that first we should assess the input cost of the farmers. He also stated to see whether the demand of the farmers have been fulfilled or not.

- He further stated that the Self Help Groups should be promoted for the impact assessment on the use of fertilizers.

ii. Shri Rahul Noronha, Associate Editor, India Today suggested/gave inputs on the above topic as detailed below:

- Audit should look into the reasons for the short supply and delayed supply of fertilizers and stated that the chemical fertilizer is mainly controlled by the Government of India.

- He also stated that the decision taken by the GoI to give subsidy on fertilizers has to be explored. Further functioning of soil testing laboratories should also be taken into account.

- He further stated that the Government's plan is to increase and encourage the use of organic farming; hence the policy of the Government to provide subsidy to bio-fertilizers is also to be looked into and ensure that suitable funds are earmarked for this.

iii. Ms.Bhakti Sharma, Sarpanch Barkhedi stated that the soil testing laboratories do not have adequate scientists, hence these institutes should also be audited. She also stated that farmers are not well educated to read the results and instructions, hence it should be ensured that adequate awareness is created in this regard and IEC activities are enhanced suitably.

iv. Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) assured that all the issues would be looked into including the soil testing laboratories, also the issue of 'Nitrate' level in the soil would be tested during the course of audit and reasons for shortfall and other issues would be suitably highlighted in the draft report.

v) Shri Yogesh Kumar, Executive Director, Samarthan, suggested/gave inputs on the above topic as detailed below:

- He stated that the issue of benefit of subsidy which is being taken by small and large farmers has to be seen. Further he stated that there should be subsidy on the organic fertilizers.

- He stated that bottom-up demand generation should be there and the Gram Panchayat Development Plan (GPDP) should be in consonance with the annual plans of Agriculture Department. He also stated that priorities needs to

202

be changed and ultimate beneficiary should be the farmer, hence the steps taken in this regard is also to be explored.

vi. Ms. Vaishali Chowdhary, President, SHG stated that emphasis on organic farming should be enhanced. Extensive use of 'Vermicompost' or 'Kenchuwa Khad', 'Gobar Khad' should be encouraged and focus on providing subsidy through National Livelihood Mission on these should be explored.

- She stated that Agriculture Research Center needs more focus and attention. Kisan Vikas Kendras (KVK) models should also be given more focus at the research level.

- She further stated that positive changes and effective monitoring could be seen by increasing digitization at community level.

vii. Shri D. Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) added to the discussion that the waste generated should be converted at generation point itself and a mechanism should be developed wherein the Government should purchase and distribute it at appropriate levels.

3. On the topic '**Audit of Land Management**', the members suggested/gave inputs on the topic as detailed below:

i. Shri Manoj Kumar Shrivastava, suggested/gave inputs on the above topic as detailed below:

- He stated that the targets fixed by the department for Land Revenue is not logical, hence audit should take a note of the same and should explore the process of fixing targets by the department. He also stated that the process of Lagaan fixing should also be seen during the course of audit.

- He further stated that Khasra is for 05 years. In the 6th year there is variation in the entries of Khasra especially in land use when compared to that of the 5th year of Khasra. In view of diversion of Land Revenue he stated that data sets of MPEB, Nagar Nigam (from Property Tax data) should also be compared as there are many variations.

- He stated that B-7 is not updated for years and Section 248-250-Land Encroachment have to be explored in the audit.

ii. Shri Rahul Noronha, Associate Editor, India Today stated that a huge number of land dispute cases are pending for several years, hence a mechanism should be development by the department to clear these disputes and audit should explore this issue.

iii. Shri Yogesh Kumar, Executive Director, Samarthan, stated that the role of Panchayati Raj Institutes (PRIs) in Land Revenue is to be seen. He also further stated that whether the authority given to PRIs in Land Revenue are being exercised efficiently or the same has been withdrawn should also be explored in audit.

4. On the topic Audit on **“Financial Assistance under Natural Calamities**, the members suggested/gave inputs on the topic as detailed below:

i. Shri Manoj Kumar Shrivastava, stated that the real problem of Financial Assistance for the nature calamities is populist pressures, which should be represented sensitively.

ii. Shri Rajeev Dubey, CA, stated the criteria for providing financial assistance needs to be clear and should be published. Hence there should be significant increase in the IEC activities and make the public aware of the criteria fixed by the Government/Department. This issues may be explored during the course of audit.

5 On the topic Audit on **Major Irrigation Projects-Mohanpura and Kundaliya**, the members suggested/gave inputs on the topic as detailed below:

i. Initially Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) and Chairperson intimated that he had personally visited this project wherein a presentation was given to him. He intimated that 15 similar projects are going on presently and intimated that evaporation loss does not arise in this project due to the piped water supply and the need of land acquisition also does not arise. He also assured that the audit will examine the impact analysis, which would also be carried out with reference to crop diversification.

- Audit would also see the issue of desired outcome was met or not, as only 60-70 *per cent* irrigation has been covered, reasons in this regard would also be analysed as to why the remaining 30 *per cent* could not be irrigated. He also intimated that due to this project migration from Rajgarh district to Rajasthan as substantially decreased which is one of the positive outcome of the project.

ii. Shri Manoj Kumar Shrivastava, stated that whether the cost benefit ratio was designed to justify the project should be explored and also whether the intended benefits have reached the ultimate farmers has to be seen and suitably brought out in the report. He also stated to look into the issues of cost and time escalation in the project.

iii. Shri Yogesh Kumar, Executive Director, Samarthan suggested to explore whether the project has delivered the return on investment and the issues of cost escalation may be covered during the course of audit.

6 On the topic Audit on **Assets Creation in Panchayat Raj Institutions under MGNREGA and Central Finance Commission**, the members suggested/gave inputs as detailed below:

i. Shri Manoj Kumar Shrivastava, suggested/gave inputs on the following on the above topic:

- He stated that MGNREGA is an employment generation scheme and there are 163 permissible activities under Asset creation as per the manual under MGNREGA which can be categorized as Assets. If any asset is to be created apart from the permissible item, then sanction of GoI is necessary.
 - He also stated that Rural Health Infrastructure should also be included in the list of permissible works under MGNREGA so as to ensure efficient rural health care which could be included as the part of Asset creation.
 - Further he stated that focus should be more on the Social Audit, whether the asset created are utilized for the purpose for which they have been created, whether the social objectives have been fulfilled. He also informed that in Madhya Pradesh, focus was more on labourers rather than on the machines. He also emphasized that the fund flow under the scheme should be un-interrupted. The issues of wage rate should also be explored as wage rate is different in MP when compared to neighbouring States.
 - He informed the Board that if MNREGA scheme did not exist, then the effect of 'Corona' could have been disastrous both on the economic and hunger front.
 - In view of watershed scheme he stated to see whether the water level has increased or not, whether the ridge to valley treatment has been done in watershed works should be seen.
- ii. Shri Rajeev Dubey, CA suggested that MGNREGA and CFC can only be taken up together when the fund flow under both the schemes is uninterrupted.
- iii. Shri Yogesh Kumar, Executive Director, Samarthan stated that the ratio of 60:40 under MGNREGA should not be tempered with and this aspect should be seen in the audit. He further stated that the institutional mechanism should be strengthened, Panchayats should be empowered and the District Planning Committee should also be involved.
- iv. On the above Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) and Chairperson stated that recently we have conducted Audit on 73rd Amendment Act regarding the funds, functions and functionaries and the report is being finalized.
- v. Ms.Bhakti Sharma, Sarpanch, Barkhedi stated that audit should see into the aspect of planning as proper planning should exist before creation of any assets. She also stated that the issue of the septic tanks should be taken into account as this may get filled over a period of time and asset creation should look the issue before a big problem is created.
- vi. Shri Parshuram Tiwari, Social Expert suggested that audit should see the systematic process and its compliance has been ensured in implementation of the scheme.

vii. Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) informed that CAG has desired to see the outcome at village level, whether the change has in fact occurred or not. He further intimated about the opening of the Audit offices at District/Divisional level for audit of PRIs. This would facilitate simultaneous audit-cum-training of DLFA officials with the officials of O/o Pr.A.G.(Audit-I).

- He also informed the Board that there was delay in preparing the wage-list, generation of Fund Transfer Orders (FTO), signing of FTOs and delay in crediting of wages to the labourers ranging from 1-435 days, to this Shri M.K. Shrivastava also informed that even the payment is delayed by six to eight months.

- He further took up the issue of discussion of reports at appropriate levels, to this Shri Manoj Kumar Shrivastava, intimated that this should be discussed at Zila Panchayat level as it also a constitutional body.

- Further Shri Manoj Kumar Shrivastava, informed on the issue of recovery at Panchayat level that, if recovery was not possible, provision are there in the Panchayat Act that the Tehsildars would recover the money on their behalf by way of land revenue.

- Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) stated to add this issue in the topic that Government officials could be engaged in recovery of land revenue.

7. On the topic **Audit on CM Rise scheme in schools of Madhya Pradesh**, the members suggested/gave inputs as follows:

i. Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) brief about the scheme that a model school would be created and transportation facility would be provided to the students and all small and nearby schools would be merged with this school.

ii. Further looking into the negligible expenditure and recently introduced scheme all the SAAB members unanimously stated that this topic may be postponed from the current AAP 2022-23 and may be taken up in the next audit cycle and some other topic may be taken up. An alternate topic (CM Jan Kalyan Sambal Yojana) was suggested by Pr.AG office and was readily agreed.

8. On the topic **Audit on Implementation of CM Jan Kalyan Sambal Yojana**, the members suggested/gave inputs as follows:

i. Shri Yogesh Kumar, Executive Director, Samarthan suggested that audit should identify the bottlenecks for the reasons of low registration and should see into issues like how many of them applied, how many were rejected, the reasons in this regard should be analyzed.

ii. Further all the members stated that this was a very useful scheme and should be taken up for audit.

iii. Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) informed the Board that the Department is willing to conduct audit on this scheme. The Principal Secretary has informed that Local Fund Audit, internal audit nor has social audit been conducted for this scheme. Hence this is a request audit.

9 On the topic **Audit on Adequacy of Working Women's Hostel, Orphanages**, Shri Sanjay Sahu, Dy. Accountant General/ AMG-II/IV informed that Kolkata office was the lead office for this topic and guidelines are under preparation. As soon as the guidelines are received, this topic would be taken-up.

10 On the topic **Audit on Public Health Infrastructure and Management of Health Services**, Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) informed the Board that after preparation of guidelines the same has already been sent to Headquarters office. He further stated that Shri Mohd. Suleiman, PS, Health has intimated to conduct a comprehensive audit. Currently field audit work is going on.

11. On the topic **Audit on Establishment of New Medical Colleges** Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) stated that audit would look into the aspect of whether the man, machine, equipment and consumables were adequate or not. He further stated that issues such as equipment lying idle, consumables not available, electricity connection not available to run the machines would also be seen during audit.

i. Shri Manoj Kumar Shrivastava, stated that there is always that man-machine mismatch. Hence the issue of rational deployment of available manpower is to be seen in detail.

12. On the topic **Audit on Select Lift Irrigation Projects**, various lift irrigation projects which were completed and incomplete were discussed. The members suggested to take-up a couple of incomplete projects and one completed project. Hence three projects were selected during discussion i.e. i. 'Narmada Jhabua-Petlawad-Thandla-Sardarpur Micro Life Irrigation Project (60 per cent complete), ii. Narmada Malwa-Ghambir Link Project (100 per cent complete) and iii. Indira Sagar Project (ISP)-Kalisindh Link Project (Phase-I) which is 59 per cent complete has been selected.

In the second half, the PPT of O/o Accountant General (Audit-II) Bhopal office on the topics of Annual Audit Plan 2022-23 was given and the following suggestions/inputs were given by the members:

1. On the topic **Audit on Implementation of Deendayal Upadhyaya Gram Jyoti Yojana (DDUGJY) and Pradhan Mantri Sahaj Bijli Har Ghar Yojana (Saubhagya) in Madhya Pradesh** by electricity distribution companies (DISCOMs) of the State all the members agreed on the relevance of the topic and desired to conduct a robust audit.

2. On the topic **Audit on Solid Waste Management by Urban Local Bodies**, Shri Manoj Kumar Shrivastava, stated that the aspect of self-sustainability of the project is to be seen during the course of audit.

3. On the topic **Audit on Implementation of Integrated Financial Management and Information System (IFMIS)**, the members suggested/gave inputs as follows:

i. Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) stated that several schemes of the State Government which both the offices audit are being implemented through IFMIS. Hence the sanctity of the sanction has to be seen carefully. A sanction order is being used by multiple persons in multiple districts, which is a big flaw of the IT module and that of the data validation.

ii. Shri Manoj Kumar Shrivastava, stated that the entire system should be restructured and all the modules should be seen thoroughly. He further stated that audit should check whether regular updation has been done or not during the course of audit.

iii. Shri Rajeev Dubey, CA stated that data integration in view of various modules should be looked into and he also stated that Data Integration audit should also be conducted.

4. On the topic **Audit on Water Supply Management in Urban Local Bodies** the members suggested/gave inputs as follows:

i. Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) stated that after the restructuring of the State Audit offices, the Urban Local Bodies has been transferred to Bhopal office. He further added that the ULBs have reported to the Central Government that they are providing six hours of water supply in the Urban Areas, however when this office scrutinized the records of ULBs it was found that the water supply was made only for half an hour a day. He reiterated that this topic is very important because it is a deficit function in view of drinking water. Hence all this aspect should also be seen during the course of audit.

ii. Shri Rahul Naronha, Associate Editor, India Today suggested that the water supply should be made 24x7 by all the ULBs.

iii. Shri Manoj Kumar Shrivastava, stated that audit should look into the aspect of Atal Mission for Rejuvenation and Urban Transformation (AMRUT) Mission as to how much it has enhanced the current status of water supply in ULBs.

iv. Dr. Mohd. Suhail Fazal, Dy. Accountant General (AMG-I/III) further enlightened on the issue and stated the following:

- The Ministry of Urban Development has developed a Service Level Benchmark consisting of nine parameters. As per the achievements published through Gazette by the Commissioners of ULB, the water loss was 'Zero per cent' which was false, as there was three per cent of loss of water only by vaporization.

- He stated that during audit we calculated the water loss at 40 per cent, while in some incidences; loss was ranging from 60 to 62 per cent. However

he stated that in the exit conference, the department eventually confirmed the losses.

- He also stated that as AMRUT mission was started in 2015, however allocation was made during 2017-18. In AMRUT, chunks of pipelines were replaced without replacing the whole pipelines, no pressure system was installed. SCADA (Supervisory Control and Data Acquisition) a device used for ensuring uninterrupted water supply, was an expensive device, which was kept non-functional.

- The ULBs did not have a profile design of water supply system, due to which, to find the leakage they would dig all around the place to find the pipeline laid which resulted in an expensive job and also time taking activity.

5. On the topic **Audit on Assessment, Levy and Collection of State Excise Duty** the members suggested/gave inputs as follows:

i. Shri Manoj Kumar Shrivastava, suggested/gave inputs on the following on the above topic:

- He stated that the main purpose of levying excise duty was to reduce consumption and socially undesirable items should not be promoted by the Government. He further added that excise is being levied as an economic punishment so that the consumption may be reduced although the revenue generation is just a byproduct.

- He also stated that the density of excise shops in Madhya Pradesh is lowest in the country. People are under the notion that less number of shops is a case of low sales of the product, but this was not the issue. This would lead to promotion of illegal liquor which can cause even death. This may be reduced by opening of the licensed liquor shops adequately.

- He further stated in MP distillery opening is an industry and the competition has to be created by giving license to new players in this field and eliminate the monopoly. Competition increases the quality and benefits the consumers.

ii. Shri Rahul Naronha Associate Editor, India Today stated that the excise rates in neighboring States should be compared with reference to less receipt of excise from such neighbouring districts. Due to high rates, the liquor was being smuggled from the neighboring states.

6. On the topic **Audit on Sanction, Recovery of loans and Management of Non Performing Assets by MP State Financial Corporation**, the members suggested/gave inputs as follows:

i. Shri M.K. Shrivastava, stated that earlier there were huge difference in sanctioned and disbursed amounts which resulted in huge scams. However the statistics presented now in the PPT shows a healthy picture.

ii. Shri Rajeev Dubey, CA stated that the collaterals must be seen in the cases of recovery and also in the cases of defaults. He further stated that in some cases same land was being used as collateral at multiple points, as no entry was made in the Khasra. He also stated to see the position of collateral in

cases of NPA accounts, whether the charge is created or not, if created whether entries are made in Khasra or not

7. On the topic Audit on Operation and Maintenance of Power Houses of MP Power Generating Company Limited;

Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) stated that this an interesting topic to be taken up for audit. He further stated that during the course of audit it should be seen whether the equipment are purchased from the Original Equipment Manufacturer (OEM) or not. He also cited the Audit Report of Jharkhand on this issue and stated that this report may be referred.

8. On the topic Audit on Construction of EHT lines and Sub-stations by MP Power Transmission Company Limited (MPPTCL); Shri Manoj Kumar Shrivastava, stated to look into the aspect of outcome analysis in terms of line loss and transmission loss after incurring huge expenditure on this.

Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) added to the above stating that in many instances there was no power transmission even through the high tension lines were constructed, this may also be looked into during the audit.

Shri Bijit Kumar Mukherjee, AG (Audit-II), Bhopal and Ex-Officio Member expressed his acknowledgements to all the members and also appreciated for the valuable inputs given by the Members.

At the end Shri D.Sahu, Chairperson (PAG) stated that after the pandemic this was a welcome change to hold meeting in person and also expressed his gratitude to all the members for sparing their valuable time for the meeting and for their suggestions and valuable inputs, which would be helpful in strengthening the audit process. He stated that if any further suggestions and topics to be taken-up are given through email, telephone or video conference the same would be appreciated.

Further a brief discussion was also held on the proposal by the external members to open a State Level Academy of Audit and Accounts, to which Shri D.Sahu, Chairperson (PAG) assured that this issue would be looked into.

Meeting ended with Dr. Md. Suhail Fazal DAG (AMG-I and III) of O/o PAG (Audit-I) and Member Secretary-cum-Convener giving the vote of thanks to all the external and internal members.

All the external members appreciated the topics chosen for Annual Audit Plans as they are relevant and people centric.


**Dy. Accountant General/AMG-I/III
and Member Secretary-cum-Convener (SAAB)**


Copy forwarded to-

No. AMG-III/APDAC/SAAB-Minutes/204-33

Dated: 01/04/22

1. Secretary to Principal Accountant General (Audit-I), M.P, Gwalior
2. Secretary to Accountant General (Audit-II) M.P, Bhopal.
3. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-V and Admin.)
4. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-II)
5. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-I)
6. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-VI)
7. Sr.Dy. Accountant General (AMG-I and Admin) O/o the AG (Audit-II), MP, Bhopal.
8. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-IV) O/o the AG (Audit-II), MP, Bhopal.
9. Sr.Dy. Accountant General (AMG-II) O/o the AG (Audit-II), MP, Bhopal.
10. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-III) O/o the AG (Audit-II), MP, Bhopal.
11. Shri Manoj Shrivastava, Retd. IAS
12. Prof. S. Koteswar Rao, Vice-Chancellor of Rajmata Vijayaraje Scindia Krishi Vishwavidyalaya (RVSKVV), Gwalior.
13. Prof. Rajendra Sahu, Director of ABV-IIITM, Gwalior.
14. Ms. Nishi Misra, Principal, Scindia Kanya Vidhyalaya, Gwalior.
15. Shri Rajeev Kumar Dubey, Chartered Accountant, Indore
16. Ms. Bhakti Sharma, National Convener, Sarpan
17. ch, Barkhedi
Gram Panchayat.
13. Shri Rahul Noronha, Associate Editor, India Today
14. Dr. Parashuram Tiwari, Social Expert, Atal Bihari Vajpayee Institute of Good Governance and Policy Analysis
15. Shri Yogesh Kumar, Executive Director, Samarthan NGO
16. Ms. Nirasha Devi, President, Saraswati Devi, SHG
17. Ms. Vaishali Chowdhary, President Prerna Shakti, SHG
18. Sr.Audit Officer/Report-I and II

Abdulla


**Dy. Accountant General/AMG-I/III
& Member Secretary-cum-Convener (SAAB)**

Annexure-A

List of members present in the State Audit Advisory Board meeting held on 21.03.2022

Honorary External Members (S/Shri)			Internal Members (S/Shri)		
1	Manoj Shrivastava	Retd. IAS	1	D. Sahu	Chairperson and Principal Accountant General (Audit-I), MP, Gwalior.
2	Rajeev Kumar Dubey	Chartered Accountant, Indore	2	Bijit Kumar Mukherjee	Ex-Officio Member and Accountant General (Audit-II), MP, Bhopal (Online through MS Teams)
3	Ms. Bhakti Sharma,	Sarpanch, Barkhedhi Abdulla Gram Panchayat	3	Dr. Mohammad Fazal Suhail	Member Secretary and Convener and Dy. Accountant General/AMG-I and III, O/o PAG (Audit-I), MP, Gwalior
4	Shri Rahul Noronha,	Associate Editor, India Today	4	Jitendra Tiwari	Ex-Officio Member and Dy. Accountant General/AMG-V and Admn.) O/o PAG (Audit-I), MP, Gwalior
5	Dr. Parashuram Tiwari,	Social Expert, Atal Bihari Vajpayee Institute of Good Governance and Policy Analysis	5	Sanjay Sahu	Ex-Officio Member and Dy. Accountant General/AMG-II and IV) O/o PAG (Audit-I), MP, Gwalior
6	Shri Yogesh Kumar,	Executive Director Samarthan NGO	6	B.B.Bhirud	Dy. Accountant General/AMG-III O/o AG (Audit-II), Bhopal
7	Ms. Vaishali Chowdhary,	President Prerna Shakti, SHG	7	Mehul Grover	Sr.Dy. Accountant General/AMG-II O/o AG (Audit-II), Bhopal (Online through MS Teams)
8	Ms. Nishi Misra	Principal, Scindia Kanya Vidhyalaya, Gwalior (Online through MS Teams)			
9	Ms. Nirasha Devi,	President, Saraswati Devi, SHG (Online through MS Teams)			


Sr.Audit Officer/APDAC

Annexure-B**List of topics of O/o Pr.A.G.(Audit-I), M.P., Gwalior**

Sl.No.	Particulars of topics
1	Audit on Traffic Management in Major Cities of Madhya Pradesh
2	Audit on Management and Distribution of Fertilizers in Madhya Pradesh
3	Audit on Land Management
4	Audit on Financial Assistance under Natural Calamities
5	Audit on Major Irrigation Projects-Mohanpura and Kundaliya
6	Audit on Assets Creation in Panchayati Raj Institutions under MGNREGA and Central Finance Commission
7	Audit on Implementation of CM Rise Scheme in Schools of MP'
8	Audit on Mukhyamantri Jankalyan (Sambal) Yojana
9	Audit on Working of Madhya Pradesh State Agro Industries Development Corporation
10	Audit on on Public Health Infrastructure and Management of Health Sector
11	Audit on Adequacy of Working Women's Hostel, Orphanages
12	Audit on Pre and Post Matric Scholarship Schemes & NSAP
13	Audit on Establishment of New Medical Colleges
14	Audit on Select Lift Irrigation Projects - Narmada-Jhabua-Petlawad-Thandla-Sadarpur Lift Irrigation Scheme
15	Audit on Loan Waiver Scheme undertaken by GoMP


 Sr.Audit Officer/APDAC

Annexure-CList of topics of O/o A.G.(Audit-II), M.P., Bhopal

Sl. No.	Particulars of the topics
1	Audit on 'Implementation of Deendayal Upadhyaya Gram Jyoti Yojana (DDUGJY) and Pradhan Mantri Sahaj Bijli Har Ghar Yojana (Saubhagya) in Madhya Pradesh' by electricity distribution companies (DISCOMs) of the State
2	Audit on Solid Waste Management by Urban Local Bodies
3	Audit on Implementation of IFMIS
4	Audit on Management of Forest Receipts in Madhya Pradesh
5	Audit on Water Supply Management in Urban Local Bodies
6	Audit on Assessment, Levy and Collection of State Excise Duty.
7	Audit on Sanction and recovery of loans and management of non-performing assets by MP State Financial Corporation
8	Audit on Implementation of MSME Protsahan Yojna
9	Audit on SSCA on GST Registration
10	Audit on SSCA on Department's Oversight on GST Payments and Returns Filing
11	Audit on "Operation & Maintenance of Power Houses of Madhya Pradesh Power Generating Company Limited"
12	Audit on "Construction of EHT lines and Sub-stations by MP Power Transmission Company Limited (MPPTCL)"
13	Audit on Construction of Education Buildings (Public Education, Higher Education and Technical Education
14	Audit on Construction of Roads by Madhya Pradesh Road Development Corporation under Asian Development Bank Funding


 Sr.Audit Officer/APDAC