

**Office of the Principal Accountant General (Audit-I), Madhya Pradesh  
Audit Bhawan, Jhansi Road, Gwalior-474002**

**Minutes of the meeting of Madhya Pradesh State Audit Advisory Board  
held on 16/07/2021 at 2:30 PM**

Meeting of newly constituted Madhya Pradesh State Audit Advisory Board (SAAB) was held online (MS Teams) under the Chairmanship of Shri D. Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I), Madhya Pradesh, Gwalior. The external and internal members present in the meeting is detailed in **Annexure-A**.

At the outset Dr. Mohd. Suhail Fazal, Dy. Accountant General (AMG-I and III) and Member Secretary-Cum-Convener greeted each of the members on the Board. All the external members and ex-officio members introduced themselves to the Board. Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) and Chairperson inaugurated the SAAB meeting and welcomed all the members of the Board.

Shri D.Sahu, Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) and Chairperson informed the members that there is change of audit approach in the last few years. Earlier audit of various units of a department were undertaken independently where several activities of the unit was examined and audit observations made. In this approach, neither the department nor the audit was able to get a comprehensive view of any particular issue or activity of the department. Therefore, in the last few years the department has initiated a different approach wherein a particular scheme, issue or activity is selected based on various risk assessment and examined across the units. This approach has yielded better audit outcome and at the same time department is able to take timely decisions. He quoted several such instances where because of FABAs, better audit outcomes were noticed and request for audit is coming from various departments. Earlier the departments were shy of audit but with this changed approach they are coming forward for getting audited.

He requested the external members to give suggestions/inputs on the topics proposed in the Annual Audit Plans 2021-22 and may also suggest some other topics of their choice based on their knowledge and experience for future audit plans.

Shri Bijit Kumar Mukherjee, Accountant General (Audit-II), MP, Bhopal and Ex-Officio Member also greeted all the members of the Board and also stated that this is a forum to discuss the critical issues which are utmost important for the state, wherein we take feedback on the current topics and also for audits in future.

After the welcome speech, Dr.Md. Suhail Fazal DAG (AMG-I and III) of O/o Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) and Member Secretary-cum-Convener made the Power-Point Presentation before the members of Board on the brief audit profile of the office, on the topics of All India PA/PA/FABA included in the Audit Plan 2020-21 and 2021-22 (enclosed as **Annexure-B**).

After the presentation of Gwalior office, Shri Ajay V Yeshwant presented the PPT of O/o Accountant General (Audit-I) Bhopal office for the topics of Audit Plan 2020-21 and 2021-22. The details of the topics are enclosed as **Annexure-C**.

Suggestions of External Members:

1. Shri S.K. Rao, VC, RVSKV suggested the following:

- On the warehousing scheme, he suggested that the gaps in accessibility to the warehouses and availability of warehouses in rural areas should be addressed and expenditure incurred under drip irrigation schemes should be examined appropriately.
- Even after incurring huge expenditure on the Tribal-sub plan scheme significant improvement in the livelihoods of the tribal are not seen, this issue is to be addressed in audit.
- On PA e-PDS, he suggested that the food grains may be procured and distributed locally so that the cost of distribution could be reduced.
- On Mission on Integrated Development of Horticulture, he suggested that the time span for productivity of infrastructure should be reduced drastically.
- On Guest faculty he suggested that instead of deployment of lecturers for one year, it should be extended for three to four years, till the permanent appointment.
- On huge funds incurred on major irrigation projects, he emphasized that the Performance Audit/FABA should be carried out in such a way that would provide guidance to the State Government to utilize the funds effectively and also suggest ways to plug the loopholes in the projects.

2. Prof. Rajendra Sahu, Director, ABV-IIITM suggested that citizen's feedback and their views should be taken so that the performance of the schemes is enhanced and it is effectively implemented along with involving the experts in development of the scorecards for the Performance Audits so the outcome is more productive.

3. Ms, Nishi Mishra, Principal SKV suggested to take up Performance Audits on how well the internet and television network has been utilized and what kind of learning gaps occurred on account of this pandemic and she also suggested that audit should recommend extra spending by government to provide digital devices to those students who can not afford to procure on their own so that the digital divide is reduced.

4. Ms. Bhakti Sharma, Sarpanch, Barkhedhi Abdulla Gram Panchayat, drew attention on the topics of Performance Audit on e-PDS, and 73<sup>rd</sup> Amendment Act in Panchayati Raj Institutions, Deployment of Guest faculty and Take Home

Ration and intimated that she would forward her suggestions by mail to the office.

5. Rahul Noronha, Associate Editor, India Today suggested the following:

- He stated that the topics 'e-PDS' and 'warehousing facilities' are both interconnected. The farm laws which are going to be implemented might have some impact on the ware housing and e-PDS both, which should be analyzed during the Audit.
- On drip irrigation, he stated measures should be taken for water conservation and on irrigation schemes he suggested that the user fee imposed on the farmers are nominal which should be revised.
- He expressed his concern on the revenue collection of the state government. That is due to very high taxation by the State Government on petrol, diesel and liquor, most of people are going to the bordering/neighboring states for this products, thereby losing revenue. He recommended that audit can examine the extent revenue loss on account of this.

6. Dr.Parshuram Tiwari, Consultant suggested that feedback from the public is to be obtained for the schemes being implemented. He also suggested for taking feedback from the beneficiaries in schemes related to health, SBM, schemes of WCD, Education, SRLM, e-PDS where public is directly involved. He also suggested to look into the issues such as investment, quality and performance of the schemes.

7. Shri Yogesh Kumar, Executive Director, Samarthan, NGO suggested to take up topics such as, Ladli Laxmi Yojana, 'Jan Abhiyan' and 'Jal Jeevan Mission' as huge expenditure is incurred on these schemes.

- On 'Collection and Utilization of the Building and Other Construction Workers Welfare Cess' he suggested that the issue of funds lying underutilized is to be analyzed during the audit.
- He suggested that field visits, survey and interviews should be carried out during the process of audit in such a manner that it should be report oriented. He also suggested on independent surveys and developing reports cards so that the performance of the schemes and services are improved.
- He highlighted that Social Audit is a very important tool and their reports should also be referred during the process of audit. Further on the issue of fund, function and functionaries, he stated that the control is still in the hands of the administration due to which panchayats are not empowered, which should be analyzed in audit.

8. Shri Rajeev Dubey, CA suggested on the following issues:

- He suggested that panchayats should focus on self-generated income by imposing taxes to reduce dependency on the state. Further he requested O/o the PAG Audit to develop mechanism to check revenue leakages in Panchayats.

- He suggested that physical verification of all the stores of National Health Mission should be carried out.

- On Prasuti Sahayata Yojana, he suggested that during audit it is to be checked whether the payment is being done with proper verification and only the eligible beneficiaries are benefitted.

- He expressed that in ULB accounting is a major problem, taxes are collected and not accounted for, which should be scrutinized during audit.

9. Smt. Nirasha Devi, President Saraswati Devi SHG suggested that survey of schemes like Take Home Ration, Pradhan Mantri Sadak Yojana, and other schemes of PRI should be carried out to identify whether the benefits has reached to the actual beneficiary.

10. Smt. Vaishali Chowdhary, President Prerna Shakti, SHG suggested that all the audits whether it is financial, internal or social, should be carried out in a transparent manner.

At the end Shri D.Sahu, Chairperson (PAG) expressed his gratitude to all the members for sparing their valuable time for the meeting and for their suggestions and valuable inputs, which would be helpful in strengthening the audit process. He stated that if any further suggestions and topics to be taken-up are given through email, telephone or video conference the same would be appreciated.

Meeting ended with Dr. Md. Suhail Fazal DAG (AMG-I and III) of O/o PAG (Audit-I) and Member Secretary-cum-Convener giving the vote of thanks to all the external and internal members.

**Dy. Accountant General/AMG-I and III  
& Member Secretary-cum-Convener (SAAB)**

**Copy forwarded to-**

**No.AMG-III/APDAC/SAAB-Minutes/**

**Dated:**

1. Secretary to Principal Accountant General (Audit-I), M.P, Gwalior
2. Secretary to Accountant General (Audit-II) M.P, Bhopal.
3. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-V and Admin.)
4. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-II)
5. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-I)
6. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-VI)
7. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-I and Admin) O/o the AG (Audit-I), MP, Bhopal.
8. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-IV) O/o the AG (Audit-I), MP, Bhopal.
9. Prof. S. Koteswar Rao, Vice-Chancellor of Rajmata Vijayaraje Scindia Krishi Vishwavidyalaya (RVSKVV), Gwalior.
10. Prof. Rajendra Sahu, Director of ABV-IIITM, Gwalior.
11. Ms. Nishi Misra, Principal, Scindia Kanya Vidhyalaya, Gwalior.
12. Shri Rajeev Kumar Dubey, Chartered Accountant, Indore
13. Ms. Bhakti Sharma, National Convener, Sarpanch, Barkhedi Abdulla Gram Panchayat.
13. Shri Rahul Noronha, Associate Editor, India Today
14. Dr. Parashuram Tiwari, Social Expert, Atal Bihari Vajpayee Institute of Good Governance and Policy Analysis
15. Shri Yogesh Kumar, Executive Director, Samarthan NGO
16. Ms. Nirasha Devi, President, Saraswati Devi, SHG
17. Ms. Vaishali Chowdhary, President Prerna Shakti, SHG

**Dy. Accountant General/AMG-I and III  
& Member Secretary-cum-Convener (SAAB)**

**Annexure-A**

**List of members present in the State Audit Advisory Board meeting held on 16.07.2021**

<b>Honorary External Members (S/Shri)</b>			<b>Internal Members (S/Shri)</b>		
1	Prof. S. Koteswar Rao,	Vice-Chancellor of Rajmata Vijayaraje Scindia Krishi Vishwavidyalaya (RVSKVV)	1	D. Sahu	Chairperson and Principal Accountant General (Audit-I), MP, Gwalior.
2	Prof. Rajendra Sahu,	Director of ABV-IITM	2	Bijit Kumar Mukherjee	Ex-Officio Member and Accountant General (Audit-II), MP, Bhopal
3	Ms. Nishi Misra	Principal, Scindia Kanya Vidhyalaya, Gwalior	3	Dr. Mohammad Fazal Suhail	Member Secretary and Convener and Dy. Accountant General/AMG-I and III, O/o PAG (Audit-I), MP, Gwalior
4	Rajeev Kumar Dubey	Chartered Accountant, Indore	4	Anubhav Kumar Singh	Ex-Officio Member and Dy. Accountant General/AMG-I and Admn, O/o AG (Audit-II), Bhopal
5	Ms. Bhakti Sharma,	Sarpanch, Barkhedi Abdulla Gram Panchayat	5	Jitendra Tiwari	Ex-Officio Member and Dy. Accountant General/AMG-II, IV, V) O/o PAG (Audit-I), MP, Gwalior
6	Shri Rahul Noronha,	Associate Editor, India Today	6	Ajay V Yeshwant	Ex-Officio Member and Dy. Accountant General/AMG-IV O/o AG (Audit-II), Bhopal
7	Dr. Parashuram Tiwari,	Social Expert, Atal Bihari Vajpayee Institute of Good Governance and Policy Analysis			
8	Shri Yogesh Kumar,	Executive Director Samarthan NGO			
9	Ms. Nirasha Devi,	President, Saraswati Devi, SHG			
10	Ms. Vaishali Chowdhary,	President Perna Shakti, SHG			

**Annexure-B**

<b>Sl. No.</b>	<b>List of Pas/FABAs</b>	<b>Name of the Department</b>
<b>AAP 2020-21 Performance Audits</b>		
1	Dial 100 - Emergency Response System in Madhya Pradesh	Home Department
2	PA on Direct Benefit Transfer (DBT) in PM Awas Yojana (Gramin)	Science and Technology Department; Panchayat and Rural Development Department
3	Availability of drugs, medicines and equipment in Government Medical Institutions with a focus on efficacy of centralized procurement, distribution and storage by leveraging technology	Public Health and Family Welfare Department
<b>AAP 2020-21 FABA topics</b>		
1	Implementation of Post Matric Scholarship Scheme	Tribal Affairs, SC Welfare and Backward Classes and Minorities Welfare Department.
2	Management of Financial Assistance under Swachh Bharat Mission (Rural)	Panchayat and Rural Development Department
3	Infrastructure works done at the choice of representative of Zila Panchayat and Janpad Panchayat	Panchayat and Rural Development Department
4	Construction works under Mukhyamantri Gram Sadak Yojana	Panchayat and Rural Development Department
5	Audit on Land Acquisition and Utilization of the Acquired Land	Revenue Department
6	Implementation of Per Drop More Agriculture, Crop under Pradhan Mantri Krishi Sinchayee Yojana.	Farmer Welfare and Agriculture Development and Horticulture and Food Processing Department
7	Audit of Optimization of storage capacity in MP Warehousing and Logistics Corporation	Food and Civil Supplies and Consumer Protection Department
8	Implementation of Basti Vikas evam Vidhyutikaran Yojana under Tribal Affairs and Scheduled Caste welfare Department.	Tribal Affairs Department
<b>AAP 2021-22 - All India PAs</b>		
1	All India PA on PM KISAN Samman Nidhi Yojana	Agriculture, Food and Allied Industries
2	Ayushman Bharat - PMJAY (Pradhan Mantri Jan Aarogya Yojna)	Public Health and Family Welfare Department

3	All India PA-Outcome Audit of ESI Hospitals	Labour Department
<b>AAP 2021-22 - Performance Audits</b>		
1	73 <sup>rd</sup> Amendment in PRI	Panchayat and Rural Development Department
2	PA on e- Procurement and Distribution of food grains under Public Distribution System	Food, Civil Supplies and Consumer Protection Department
3	PA on Covid-19 Pandemic Management in Madhya Pradesh	Revenue Department
4	PA-District Hospitals (with outcome audit)	Public Health and Family Welfare Department
5.	PA on Adequacy of Working Women's Hostel, Orphanages	Women and Child Development Department
<b>AAP 2021-22 - FABA topics</b>		
1	Audit of deployment of "Contractual teachers in government colleges"	Higher Education Department
2	Collection and Utilization of the Building and Other Construction Workers Welfare Cess.	Labour Department
3	Extension, Renovation and Modernization of Major Irrigation Projects	Water Resources Department
4	Upgradation of roads under Pradhan Mantri Gramin Sadak Yojana (MRRDA)	Panchayat and Rural Development Department
5	FABA on Tribal Sub Plan - Special Central Assistance Tribal Sub Plan (SCATSP) - Article 275(1) - Particularly vulnerable Tribal Group	Tribal Affairs
6	FABA on Mission for Integrated Development of Horticulture	Horticulture and Food Processing Department
7.	FABA-Take Home Ration	Women and Child Development Department



**Annexure-C**

<b>Sl. No.</b>	<b>List of PAs/FABAs for 2020-21 and 2021-22</b>
1	Compliance Audit on Diversion of Forest Land and Management of Compensatory Afforestation Funds in Madhya Pradesh.
2	All India Performance Audit on Implementation of the 74th Constitutional Amendment Act
3	Compliance Audit on Construction of buildings and development of plots by MPHIDB.
4	Compliance Audit on Leasing out of new/existing properties of the M.P. State Tourism Development Corporation Limited/M.P. Tourism Board
5	Performance Audit on Integrated Financial Management Information System (IFMIS)
6	Compliance Audit on Revenue Losses in Regular and Deemed Assessed Cases (Commercial Tax & GST)
7	Compliance Audit on Assessment and Implementation of Market Value Guidelines in Madhya Pradesh.
8	Compliance Audit on Creation of Industrial Infrastructure by Madhya Pradesh Industrial Development Corporation Limited, Bhopal
9	Compliance Audit on Mining Operations in accordance with Mining Plan and Environmental Norms.
10	Performance Audit on Performance of DISCOMs pre and post UDAY
11	All India Performance Audit on Deen Dayal Upadhyay Gram Jyoti Yojana (DDUGJY) and Pradhan Mantri Sahaj Bijli Har Ghar Yojana (SAUBHAGYA) as part of 24*7 Electricity for All
12	Assurance Based Compliance Audit on Construction of National Highways by MPPWD
13	Assurance Based Compliance Audit on Construction of Roads through Central Road Fund in PWD
14	Allotment of Retail Liquor shops and procedural lapses in issue of liquor.
15	CA on management of forest offences in M.P.
16	PA on Degradation/ Pollution in Kshipra River.
17	PA on management of heritage sites, archieve and Museum.
18	CA on Water supply management in urban Local Bodies.
19	CA on receipts in Urban Local Bodies (Property Tax & Rent)
20	CA on Smart cities in M.P.
21	CA on Management of interstate bus terminals and Bus stand.
22	CA on Assessment Levy and collection of stamp duty & registration fees.
23	CA on Assessment under section 20 of MPVAT act 2002
24	CA on Assessment Levy and collection of state excise duty.
25	CA on administration & utilization of funds of the District Mineral Foundation.

26	CA on receipt from Minor Minerals in M.P.
27	CA on implementation of phase –I of Delhi Mumbai Industrial Corridor project by Vikram Udyogpuri Limited.
28	CA on Implementation of Chief Ministries Self-employment schemes.
29	CA on Implementation of Mukhyamantri Yuva Udyami Yojana.
30	CA on Construction & operation & maintenance of Power House –II of Shri Singhaji Thermal power station Khandwa of M.P. power company Limited.
31	Compliance Audit on Deen Dayal Upadhy Gram Jyoti Yojana (DDUGJY) & Pradhan Mantri Sahaj Bijli Har Ghar Yojana (SAUBHGYA).
32	PA on Construction of Major Bridges in M.P
33	Compliance Audit on Construction of Schools & Hostel Buildings for tribal Development by PWD (PIU)
34	Compliance Audit on Fund Management Construction / Upgradation of Major District Roads through NDB loan in MP by PWD
35	Compliance Audit of Implementation of National / State Rural Drinking water Programme in MP by PHED