

**Office of the Principal Accountant General (Audit-I), Madhya Pradesh
Audit Bhawan, Jhansi Road, Gwalior-474002**

**Minutes of the meeting of Madhya Pradesh State Audit Advisory Board held on
20.12.2023 at Bhopal.**

The first meeting of the 7th State Audit Advisory Board (SAAB) of Madhya Pradesh was held at Bhopal with the Chairperson as Ms Priya Parikh, Accountant General (Audit), Madhya Pradesh. The members present in the meeting are detailed in **Annexure A**.

At the outset, Shri Harjinder Kumar Dy. Accountant General (AMG-III) and Member Secretary-Cum-Convener greeted each of the members of the Board and introduced the external members of the Board. Thereafter, all the ex-officio members of the Board introduced themselves. Ms Priya Parikh, Accountant General (Audit) and Chairperson, inaugurated the SAAB meeting and welcomed all the members of the Board present physically and virtually. The AG stated that the members' experience & expertise will benefit Audit Offices in finalising the Annual Audit Plan (AAP) for 2024-25. She further requested the external members to give their suggestions/inputs on the topics proposed in the AAP 2024-25.

Before starting with the office wise presentations, a short film about the CAG's mandate and organizational activities was shown to the members.

O/o the Pr. Accountant General (Audit-I) MP Gwalior

The presentation on AAP 2024-25 was initiated by Shri Harjinder Kumar DAG/AMG-III. It was informed that two Performance Audits (PA) and four Compliance Audits (CA) are being proposed for the AAP 2024-25.

One of the External members, Shri Yogesh Kumar, Executive Director, Samarthan NGO, inquired about the status of commencement of the PA and CA topics of AAP 2023-24. AG informed that all the PA and CA (AAP 2023-24) are under way and at various stages of finalisation.

Thereafter, Shri Harjinder Kumar DAG/AMG-III and Shri Tarak Nath DAG/AMG-IV briefed about all the proposed audit topics with reasons for selection and issues to be seen in Audit.

The suggestions/inputs given by the Members of the Board on the topics selected for Audit are as under:

1. PA on **“Free Distribution of Textbooks, Laptops Uniforms and Cycles in Schools”**

- i) Shri Parshuram Tiwari, Social Expert, suggested that the Audit should check the purchase and utilization of bicycles by students.
- ii) Dr. Gunjan Shrivastav, MS Oncologist, asked about the eligibility criteria and also suggested to check that all eligible students get free bicycles, laptops, and uniforms followed by checking users feedback during Audit.

iii) Shri Yogesh Kumar suggested that repair and maintenance of laptops & cycle and post-delivery analysis of all the Schemes should also be done.

- He also stated that PA should have input indicators such as if cycle becomes useless after six months what was done for sustainability for which it was assured that these suggestions would be verified during the Audit.

2. CA on “Establishment and Functioning of Anganwadi in Women and Child Development Department

i) Shri Rahul Noronha, Associate Editor, India Today, stated that criteria for the distribution of food grain and the economic condition of the family should be checked.

- He further stated that in the case of construction of kitchen, it should be checked whether it was as per norms.

3. CA on “Shyama Prasad Mukherji Urban Mission”

Shri Manoj Shrivastava, Retired IAS, suggested to check the timely release of fund to executing agency from GOI and State Government.

4. CA on “Pradhan Mantri Awas Yojana-Urban (PMAY-U)”

i) Shri Manoj Shrivastava suggested the fixation of the target under the Scheme should be verified and whether these targets are based on some criteria. It should be seen whether there is encroachment on the forest land or ponds.

ii) Shri Parshuram Tiwari, stated whether land was allotted after proper survey and cases of conflict, if any should be underlined.

iii) Shri P.K. Sharma, Retired MP Finance Service Officer, inquired about the availability of land and said that it should be checked in the Audit whether the beneficiaries were selling/renting the house. During the Audit of the Scheme, other Departments or implementing agencies should also be considered for Audit.

- He also suggested that Audit should be done keeping the urban homeless in mind. during the audit it should checked whether the developers were skipping the construction of EWS and taking advantage.
- the design of the house, with basic amenities should also be checked,

iv) Shri Yogesh Kumar suggested that the Audit should check that is it a way to encroach Government land.

v) Shri Rahul Noronha stated that it is evident in a number of cases where the government land (slums) was grabbed and urban poor were dislodged and other people benefited.

5. CA on “Rashtriya Bal Swasthya Karyakrama (RBSK)”

Dr. Gunjan Shrivastav suggested that the New vaccine for Cervical Cancer should be introduced in MP also.

DAG stated that we would verify the implementation of the same during the Audit.

6. CA on “MP Police Housing and Infrastructure Development Corporation, Bhopal”

- i) Shri Rahul Noronha suggested that the Audit should check whether expertise is available and execution was done as per norms.
- ii) Shri Manoj Shrivastava stated that the Audit should check whether the recoveries of advance were done properly and in case of delay it should be seen that penalties were imposed as per the rule.

For specific audits, AG agreed that experts can be engaged to check the outcomes of the scheme. It was further assured that Audit will conduct beneficiary survey wherever it is necessary.

Presentation by O/o the Accountant General (Audit-II) MP Bhopal

The Accountant General briefed about the working of Audit-II Office at Bhopal and its work distribution among the Audit Management Groups (AMGs). She also briefed about the status of PA/CA being conducted under Annual Audit Plan 2023-24.

During the presentation on the topics of the AAP 2024-25, Shri Sunil Kumar Sharma, Sr. Dy. Accountant General (Admin. & AMG-1), Shri Kevin Toms Skaria, Dy. Accountant General (AMG-II) and Shri Ajay Yeshwanth V, Dy. Accountant General (AMG -IV) briefed the topics of their respective Groups along with the reason for the selection of the topics and issues to be seen in the Audit.

The suggestions/inputs given by the Members of the Board on the topics selected for Audit are as under:

1. PA on “Diversion of Forest land under Forest Right Act, 2006 in Madhya Pradesh”

i) Shri Yogesh Kumar inquired about the Forest Right Act and stated that it was made to undo the historical injustice done to the tribals. As per the Community Right Act, they should be given *NISTAR* rights. Audit should verify the community forest rights of the Tribal community.

ii) Shri Manoj Shrivastava added that the Audit should verify whether the diversion was recorded and added to the revenue record, with proper demarcation and GIS records were updated.

iii) Shri Rahul Noronha suggested that the Audit should check the purpose of diversion and also check whether it is used for the same purpose. It may also be seen whether the diversion was used just for grabbing forest land.

- Apart from this Act, how much land diversion has been done under FRA should also be checked.

2. CA on “Development and Implementation of Working Plan in Forest Department”

i) Shri Manoj Shrivastava suggested that keeping in mind land history it should be seen and re-generation should be applied in case of deforestation instead of plantation.

- He further suggested that gaps in the working plan should also be checked. There should be clear demarcation of forest land.

ii) Shri Yogesh Kumar stated that Audit should see the procedure of making working plan, whether it is prepared by the department with community participation.

iii) Shri Rahul Noronha said that the Audit should verify the procedure of checking the violation of the working plan and whether corrective measures were taken by the department.

3. CA on “National Food Security Mission (NFSM)”

- i) Shri Yogesh Kumar stated that the Audit should verify what are the incentives given for indigenous food and it should be linked with the doubling of income.
- ii) Shri Rahul Noronha said the Audit should see if we promote millets, whether it will impact the production of wheat and rice and lead to shortage of food (wheat and rice). He further suggested that maize and other local foods should be included in PDS.
- iii) Dr. Gunjan Shrivastav suggested that the Audit should verify the policy of the government on the protection of crops and comment where policies are not being followed.
- iv) Shri Yogesh Kumar stated that the Audit should check whether new machineries are available to small farmers.

4. CA on **“Functioning of Madhya Pradesh Warehousing & Logistics Corporation”** the members suggested/gave inputs as detailed below:

- i) Shri P.K. Sharma suggested that the construction of the godown should be linked with the production to verify whether the government had sufficient storage capacity or not.
 - He further suggested that the Audit should also check whether crops are stored in own godowns, or depend upon the hired godowns, if sufficient own capacity is available then hiring of godown should be commented.
 - He also added that crop losses should also be linked with godown, so that protection of crop in the warehouse would be verified.
- ii) Shri Rahul Noronha suggested that the godown can be used for other purpose such as FMCG etc. So Audit should see if excess storage capacity is available that would be utilized properly.

5. CA on **“Administration of Tax, Fee and Other Revenue of Transport Department of Madhya Pradesh”**

- i) Shri P.K. Sharma suggested the following:
 - Registration of vehicles was done based on horsepower but trailers were not included so the Audit should check whether registration of vehicles were done as per rules.
 - Fitness of the vehicle was done by taking Photos only whereas rules prescribed that physical verification should be done so we should ensure compliance with the same during the Audit.
 - The penalty for overloading should be verified and the updating of the Price list in software should also be examined.
 - During the Audit it should also be ensured that vendor agreements are reviewed regularly and training to officials is also given.

6. PA on **“Construction of micro irrigation project under Water Resources department of Madhya Pradesh”**.

- i) Shri P.K. Sharma suggested that New Command Area with other DPR should be compared, duplicity should also be checked.

- He also said that the Audit should see whether the new project area was linked with old command area and overlap should also be checked.

ii) Shri Manoj Shrivastava suggested that integrated set of data may be checked.

iii) Shri Yogesh Kumar stated that geo-tagging should also be seen for all irrigation projects. He further stated that the Audit can suggest that tagging can be done through NIC by geo-tagging all the irrigation projects. He also said that cost-benefit analysis should also be done.

7. CA on “Utilisation of Narmada Water as per NWDT Award”

i) Shri Manoj Shrivastava stated that concerning NWDT, the use of water with other states is to be checked.

- He also suggested that Ecological damage should be checked, and compulsory plantation should be done keeping in view the plants that were lost.
- He further stated to check whether the intended benefits have reached the ultimate farmers. He also stated to look into the issues of cost and time escalation in the project.

8. PA on “Operation and financial management in DISCOMS of Madhya Pradesh”

i) Shri P.K. Sharma suggested that Power Purchase Agreement had the burden on Discoms due to which their financial position has deteriorated day by day. The Audit should check the factors responsible for the same.

- He told that instead of focusing on High Tension consumer billing, the Audit should stress on analysis of feeder wise losses and comment on the non-segregation of feeders.
- He also told that in billing software, consumer code and replacement of meters should be checked.
- He suggested that the load factor of consumers should be checked especially consumers having load of one kva.
- He stressed that in case of NRE grant, the work of Urja Vikas Nigam along with Wind energy and Management consultancy agreement should be checked.

ii) Shri Yogesh Kumar stated that updation may be checked in case of Household consumers.

- He told that when old meter was replaced with new meter, the cost of old meter was not refunded to consumer. Audit should check the reasons of the same and recommendation should be made for refund of cost of old meters to the consumers.
- He also told that Solar energy policy to be checked and how the excess energy adjusted in consumer bill which was generated through solar power system.

9. CA on “Operation and management of Hydel Power Plant MPCGL Madhya Pradesh Power Generating Company Limited (MPPGCL)”

Shri P.K. Sharma suggested that Audit should see whether in the agreement, breach of contract and Penal charges are defined.

10 CA on **“Quality control measures in construction and upgradation of roads”**- All the members agreed on the relevance of the topic and desired to conduct a robust Audit.

11 CA on **“Construction of Building for Tribal Affairs Department by PWD Department (PIU)”**- All the members agreed on the relevance of the topic and desired to conduct a robust Audit.

12 CA on **“Construction and Up-gradation of roads in MP through NDB assisted project by MPRDC”**- All the members agreed on the relevance of the topic and desired to conduct a robust Audit.

At the end, Ms Priya Parikh, Accountant General & Chairperson of the Board expressed her gratitude to all the members for sparing their valuable time for the meeting and for their suggestions and valuable inputs, which would strengthen the Audit process. She further stated that when the next meeting is conducted, the audit topics will be crystalized and then we would appreciate further inputs from SAAB Members regarding areas to be seen therein.

The meeting ended with vote of thanks to all the external and internal members by Shri Harjinder Kumar, DAG (AMG-III), O/o PAG (Audit-I) M.P., Gwalior and Member Secretary-cum-Convener. He also stated that the next Board meeting will be planned in the month of March/April 2024.

All the external members appreciated the topics chosen for the Annual Audit Plan as they were relevant and people centric.

**Dy. Accountant General/AMG-III
& Member Secretary-cum-Convener (SAAB)**

Copy forwarded to-

No./APDAC/SAAB-Minutes/

Dated:

1. Secretary to Accountant General (Audit-I), M.P, Gwalior
2. Secretary to Accountant General (Audit-II) M.P, Bhopal.
3. Sr. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-V and Admin.)
4. Sr. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-I and Admin) O/o the AG (Audit-I), MP, Bhopal
5. Sr. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-II) O/o the AG (Audit-II), MP, Bhopal
6. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-I)
7. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-II)
8. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-III)
9. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-IV)
10. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-IV) O/o the AG (Audit-II), MP, Bhopal.
11. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-III) O/o the AG (Audit-II), MP, Bhopal.
12. Shri Manoj Shrivastava, Retd. IAS
13. Prof. Arvind Kumar Shukla, Vice-Chancellor of Rajmata Vijayaraje Scindia Krishi Vishwavidyalaya (RVSKVV), Gwalior.
14. Prof. Sri Niwas Singh, Director of ABV-IIITM, Gwalior.
15. Dr. Gunjan Shrivastava, Medical Oncologist, Cancer Hospital, Gwalior
16. Shri Praveen Kumar Sharma, Retd. Officer from MP Finance Service
13. Shri Rahul Noronha, Associate Editor, India Today
14. Dr. Parashuram Tiwari, Social Expert,
15. Shri Yogesh Kumar, Executive Director, Samarthan NGO
16. Ms. Nirasha Devi, President, Saraswati Devi, SHG
17. Ms. Vaishali Chowdhary, President Perna Shakti, SHG

**Dy. Accountant General/AMG-III
& Member Secretary-cum-Convener (SAAB)**

Annexure-A

**List of members present in the State Audit Advisory Board meeting held on
20.12.2023.**

Honorary External Members (S/Shri)			Internal Members (S/Shri)		
1	Manoj Shrivastava	Retd. IAS	1	Ms. Priya Parikh	Chairperson and Accountant General (Audit-I & II), MP
2	Prof. Sri Niwas Singh	Director, ABV-IITM, Gwalior (Online through MS Teams)	2	Harjinder Kumar	Member Secretary cum Convener & Dy. Accountant General/AMG-III, O/o Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) M.P, Gwalior
3	Dr. Gunjan Shrivastav	Medical Oncologist, Cancer Hospital, Gwalior	3	Deen Dayal Verma	Ex-Officio Member & Sr. Dy. Accountant General (AMG-V & Admin), O/o Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) M.P, Gwalior
4	Rahul Noronha,	Associate Editor, India Today			
5	Dr. Parashuram Tiwari,	Social Expert, Atal Bihari Vajpayee Institute of Good Governance and Policy Analysis	4	Sunil Kumar Sharma	Ex-Officio Member & Sr. Dy. Accountant General/AMG-I & Admin, O/o Accountant General (Audit-II) M.P, Bhopal
6	Yogesh Kumar,	Executive Director, Samarthan NGO	5	Ajay V. Yeshwanth	Ex-Officio Member & Dy. Accountant General/AMG-IV, O/o Accountant General (Audit-II) M.P, Bhopal
7	Praveen Kumar Sharma	Retd. Officer from MP Finance Service	6	R. Tarak Nath	Ex-Officio Member & Dy. Accountant General/AMG-IV, O/o Principal Accountant General (Audit-I) M.P, Gwalior
8	Ms. Nirasha Devi,	President, Saraswati Devi, SHG (Online through MS Teams)	7	Kevin Toms Skaria	Dy. Accountant General/AMG-II, O/o Accountant General (Audit-II) M.P, Bhopal
			8	Suresh Kumar	Dy. Accountant General/AMG-III, O/o Accountant General (Audit-II) M.P, Bhopal

Annexure-B

List of topics of O/o Pr.A.G.(Audit-I), M.P., Gwalior

Sl.No.	Particulars of topics
1	CA on “Shyama Prasad Mukherji Rurban Mission”
2	CA on “PM Awas Yojna (Urban)”
3	PA on “Establishment and functioning of Anganwadi”
4	CA on “Rashtriya Bal Swasthya karyakrama (RBSK)”
5	PA on free distribution of Uniforms, Textbooks and Laptops to students of School Education Department, MP
6	CA on “MP Police Housing and Infrastructure Development Corporation, Bhopal”

Annexure-C

List of topics of O/o A.G.(Audit-II), M.P., Bhopal

Sl. No.	Particulars of the topics
1	PA on “Diversion of Forest land under Forest Right Act, 2006 in Madhya Pradesh”
2	PA on “Construction of micro irrigation project under Water Resources department of Madhya Pradesh”.
3	PA on “Operation and financial management in DISCOMS of Madhya Pradesh”
4	CA on “Development and Implementation of Working Plan in Forest Department”
5	CA on “National Food Security Mission (NFSM)”
6	CA on “Functioning of Madhya Pradesh Warehousing & Logistics Corporation”
7	CA on “Administration of Tax, Fee and Other Revenue of Transport Department of Madhya Pradesh”
8	Subject Specific Compliance Audit on “Operation and management of Hydrel Power Plant MPCGL Madhya Pradesh Power Generating Company Limited (MPPGCL)”
9	Subject Specific Compliance Audit on “Quality control measures in construction and upgradation of roads”
10	Subject Specific Compliance Audit on “Construction of Building for Tribal Affair Department by PWD Department (PIU)”
11	Subject Specific Compliance Audit on “Construction and Up-gradation of roads in MP through NDB assisted project by MPRDC”