

Chapter - 7

Human Resources

Chapter 7: Human Resources

Effective and efficient functioning of health sector necessitates availability of adequate number of motivated, empowered, trained and skilled human resource in administrative offices as well as in health education and care facilities. The availability and utilisation of human resources in Ayurveda, Unani and Homeopathy Services are discussed in succeeding paragraphs:

7.1 Human resources under Directorate of Ayurveda Services

The status of human resources working under the directorate of Ayurveda Services under Group A, B, C and D Services is given in the **Table-10** below:

Table 10: Details showing sanctioned strength and person in position and shortages under Directorate of Ayurveda Services

Group	Sanctioned Strength	Men-in-Position	Shortage (%)
A	552	156	396 (71.74 %)
B	4187	2401	1786 (42.66%)
C	3719	2037	1682 (45.23 %)
D	5472	3793	1679 (30.68 %)
Total	13930	8387	5543 (39.79 %)

(Source: Information furnished by Director, Ayurveda Services)

The shortages of some key posts under A, B and C groups are given in **Table-11**:

Table 11: Details showing Sanctioned strength, person in position and shortages of key posts under Directorate of Ayurveda Services

Sl. No.	Group	Name of the post	SS	PIP	Shortage (%)
1	A	Director	2	0	2 (100%)
2		DAUO	56	34	22 (38%)
3		Principal	8	2	6 (75%)
4		Professor	108	43	65 (60%)
5		Reader	128	73	55 (43%)
6	B	Medical Officer (Ayurvedic)	2224	1479	745 (33%)
7		Lecturer	279	112	167 (60%)
8	C	Chief Pharmacist	156	18	138 (88%)
9		Sister	94	0	94 (100%)
10		Staff Nurse	479	287	192 (40%)
11		Pharmacist (Ayurveda)	2100	1118	982 (47%)

(Source: Information furnished by Director, Ayurveda Services)

Audit of test checked Ayurveda hospitals and dispensaries in selected districts revealed that:

- Regulations governing Minimum Standard Requirement (MSR) for Ayurveda MCHs provided minimum 56 medical paramedical and support staff (including part time teachers) for UG Ayurveda, GMCHs. Ayurvedic GMCHs of Banda had only 46 PIP (including 10 excess staff¹), leading to shortages of 8 medical, and 12 paramedical and support staff². The shortage of Medical Staff included one each of Deputy Medical Superintendent, Medical Specialist, Surgical Specialist, Gynecologist, Pathologist,

¹ Four Ward boy/Ayah, one darkroom attendant, two peon or attendant and three consultants.

² One matron/nursing superintendent, three nurses for IPD, one Dentist, one X-ray technician/Radiographer, one physiotherapist one Panchkarma Nurse, two Panchkarma Assistant, one Nurse, two workers.

Anesthesiologist, Ophthalmologist, pediatrician, Radiologist, House Officer/Clinical Registrar, two Emergency MOs, and five Resident Medical/Surgical/MOs.

- Test check of 7 dispensaries (Ayurveda) and 25 4/15/25 bedded hospitals (Ayurveda) in 8 test checked districts revealed shortage of 11 MOs (Ayurveda) and 21 pharmacists (Ayurveda).

The shortage of human resources was mainly attributable to the posts being promotional post, direct recruitment posts, and selection being in progress at Selection Commissions.

The Government stated (January 2025) that promotions are continuously in progress, requisition for the vacant posts have been sent to selection commissions, appointments of some MOs have been completed and further appointments are in progress.

7.2 Human resources under Directorate of Unani Services

The status of human resources working under the directorate of Unani Services under Group A, B, C and D Services is given in the **Table-12** below:

Table 12: Details showing sanctioned strength and person in position and shortages under Directorate of Unani Services

Group	Sanctioned Strength	Person-in-position	Shortage (%)
A	77	37	40 (51.95%)
B	310	256	54 (17.42%)
C	427	213	214 (50.12 %)
D	616	421	195 (31.66%)
Total	1430	927	503 (35.17 %)

(Source: Information furnished by Director, Unani Services)

The shortages of some key posts under A, B and C groups are given in **Table-13**:

Table 13: Details showing Sanctioned strength, person in position and shortages of key posts under Directorate of Unani Services

Sl. No.	Group	Name of the post	SS	PIP	Shortage (%)
1	A	Director	1	0	1 (100 %)
2		RUO	4	0	4 (100 %)
3		Principal	2	1	1 (50 %)
4		Professor	28	16	12 (43 %)
5		Reader	34	19	15 (44 %)
6	B	Medical Officer (Unani)	264	232	32 (12 %)
7		Lecturer	45	24	21 (47 %)
8	C	Chief Pharmacist	10	2	8 (80 %)
9		Pharmacist (Unani)	264	114	150 (57 %)
10		Staff Nurse	37	7	30 (81 %)

(Source: Information furnished by Director, Unani Services)

Audit of test checked Unani hospitals and dispensaries in selected districts revealed that:

- Regulations governing Minimum Standard Requirement (MSR) for Unani Medical Colleges and Attached hospitals (MCHs) provided minimum³ 71 medical, paramedical and support staff for Unani GMCHs. Unani GMCH,

³ Including part time teachers.

Lucknow, however, had 54 PIP leading to a shortage of 17 paramedical and support staff (excluding 19 excess staff).

- Test check of 3 Unani dispensaries and 16 Unani four-bedded hospitals in 8 test checked districts⁴ revealed shortage of 1 Unani MOs and 10 Unani Pharmacists.

The shortage of Human Resources was mainly attributable to unavailability of recruitment rules, unavailability of eligible candidates⁵ and posts advertised for recruitment.

The Government furnished no reply (January 2025). The Directorate, however, accepted (September 2024) the reasons for the posts lying vacant.

7.3 Human resources under Directorate of Homeopathy Services

The status of human resources working under the Directorate of Homeopathy Services under Group A, B, C and D Services is given in the **Table-14** below:

Table 14: Details showing sanctioned strength and person in position and shortages under Directorate of Homeopathy Services

Category	Sanctioned Strength	Person in Position	Shortage (%)
A	769	387	382(49.67%)
B	1487	1255	232(15.60%)
C	1896	962	934(49.26%)
D	2610	2589	21(0.80%)
Total	6762	5193	1569(23.20%)

(Source: Information furnished by Director, Homeopathy Services)

The shortages of some key posts under A, B and C groups are given in **Table-15**:

Table 15: Details showing sanctioned strength, persons in position and shortages of key posts under Directorate of Homeopathy Services

Sl. No.	Group	Name of the post	SS	PIP	Shortage (%)
1	A	Additional Director	1	0	1 (100%)
2		DHMO	75	73	2 (3%)
3		Principal	9	1	8 (89%)
4		Professor	100	49	51 (51%)
5		Reader	138	64	74 (54%)
6	B	Medical Officer (Homeopathy)	1182	1130	52 (4%)
7		Lecturer	150	101	49 (33%)
8	C	Pharmacist (Homeopathy)	1604	889	715 (45%)
9		Staff Nurse	69	0	69 (100%)

(Source: Information furnished by Director, Homeopathy Services)

Audit of test checked Homeopathic hospitals and dispensaries in selected districts revealed that:

- Regulations governing MSR for Homeopathic MCHs provided minimum⁶ 57 medical, paramedical and support staff for Homeopathy GMCHs. Homeopathic GMCH, Moradabad, however, had only 13 PIP; leading to a

⁴ There was no Unani dispensary/hospital in Jhansi.

⁵ Director, Additional Director, Deputy Director and Medicine Inspector.

⁶ Including part time teachers.

shortage of 44 Medical, Paramedical and Support Staff. The shortage included one MS, one Deputy Medical Superintendent (DMS), three MOs, one Resident MO, one Surgeon, one General Physician, one gynecologist, one Pathologist, eight house physician and 16 Paramedical and support staff. Similarly, Homeopathic GMCHs, Prayagraj had 27 PIP (excluding 5 excess house physicians); leading to a shortage of 30 Medical, Paramedical and Support Staff. The shortage included one MS, one DMS, two MOs, one Resident MO, one Surgeon, one gynaecologist, one Pathologist and 22 Paramedical and support staff.

- Audit of 16 Homeopathic dispensaries in 8 test checked districts also revealed that there was shortage of 2 Homeopathic MOs and 5 Homeopathy Pharmacists.

The shortage of human resources was mainly attributable to not renewing of the posts⁷, not fixing of educational qualifications/source of appointment, and requisition sent to UPPSC, appointments of two posts of Principals of Homeopathic GMCHs being under consideration of the Hon'ble High Court. etc.

The Government did not furnish detailed reasons for the vacant posts, instead stated (January 2025) that process of promotion is continuously in progress, requisition for the vacant posts have been sent to selections commissions and appointments have been done. The Directorate, however, accepted (November 2024) the reasons for the posts lying vacant.

7.4 Human resources under State AYUSH Society

7.4.1 Fifty-Bedded Integrated AYUSH Hospitals

NAM guidelines provide deployment of 69 medical, paramedical and support staff on 21 type of posts in FIAHs, which included recruitments against the posts⁸ mentioned at Sl. No. 3 to 13, mentioned in paragraph 4.3 of the guidelines on a contractual basis and the remaining on outsourcing basis, except the one post of Hospital Superintendent and 3 posts of Specialist MOs.

Audit noticed that there was shortage of 538 (71 *per cent*) human resources in 11 functional FIAHs against the prescribed norm. Test check of three FIAHs in Kanpur Nagar, Lucknow and Varanasi districts revealed that there was a shortage of average 53 *per cent* of manpower. The shortage included 3 Senior MOs, 7 MOs and 24 Nursing Staffs.

Audit further observed that:

- Even though the guidelines provided making recruitments on contractual basis⁹; SAS hired the services of the posts at Sl. No. 3 to 13 through

⁷ 22 posts of Lab Technician, 28 posts of Laboratory Attendants, 14 posts of Registration Clerk, 7 posts of Radiographer, 7 posts of Telephone Operator, 7 posts of Receptionist, 7 posts of Store Superintendent, 7 posts of librarian, 2 posts of X-ray Technician and 9 posts of Library Superintendent.

⁸ MO, Residential MO, Accounts Officer, Assistant Matron, Nursing Staff, Panchkarma Technician, Yoga Instructor, Pharmacist/Dispenser, Laboratory Technician, Storekeeper/ Registration Clerk.

⁹ Paragraph 2.1 (iv) of the old guidelines and Paragraph 2.1 (iv) of the new guidelines provides that the deployment of manpower will be subject to the condition that all the appointments will be contractual and the Central Government's liability will be limited to the extent of Central Share admissible for the cost on salary for the mission period.

outsourcing to an outsourcing agency¹⁰ (OA). This resulted in deviation from guidelines for deployment of medical, paramedical and support staff, and avoidable expenditure of service charges and GST amounting to ₹ 4.83 crore on supply of manpower mentioned at Sl. No. 2¹¹ to 13 during the periods December 2021 to November 2023.

- The ‘add on terms and conditions for outsourcing healthcare services’ forming part of the contract’ stipulates preparing list of candidates applied on Sewayojan Portal by OA and providing the names of five candidates for selection of 1 employee and three times of the posts for selection of 2 or more employees, subject to the minimum of 10 for selection by the buyer department. OA, however, provided¹² final list of candidates for deployment in three¹³ (31 candidates) and eight¹⁴ (105 candidates) FIAHs respectively. Further, OA selected the candidates through interview, leading to arbitrary¹⁵ and opaque¹⁶ selection of the candidates. This resulted in irregular selection and recruitment of 136 candidates.

The Government stated (January/February 2025) that the appointments were made after the concurrence of the Government, and the department participated in preparation of list of candidates applied on Sewayojan Portal through random process. The reply does not address the issues raised by audit.

7.4.2 Yoga Wellness Centres and Health and Wellness Centres

NAM guidelines (September 2014) provide establishment of YWCs under flexi pool activities. GO issued (July 2017) for operationalisation of YWCs provided deployment of one Yoga Trainer (YT) and one Yoga Assistant (YA) in each YWC. NAM guidelines also required establishment of HWCs and deployment of one male and one female Yoga Instructor (YI) in each HWC.

Audit noticed that:

- GoI sanctioned 225 YWCs during the period 2015-16 to 2020-21, of which 224 YWCs¹⁷ were operationalised. Audit noticed that there was shortage of 22 YTs and 39 YAs (January 2025).
- GoI sanctioned 871 HWCs during the period 2019-20 to 2021-22. Audit noticed that there was shortage 102 YIs (Male) and 196 YIs (Female).

The Government stated (January 2025) that instructions have been issued to fill the vacant posts.

¹⁰ Hansraj Infracon Private Limited (HIPL), Lucknow

¹¹ Though, NAM guidelines provided recruitment of staff mentioned at Sl. No. 3 to 13 on contractual basis and employing SMOs (Panchkarma/Ksharsutra/Homeopathy/Ilaj-bit-tadbir/Thokkanam) on regular basis.

¹² vide letters dated 22.11.2021 and 25.11.2021

¹³ Kaushambi, Amethi and Bareilly

¹⁴ Kanpur Nagar, Kanpur Dehat, Deoria, Lucknow, Sonbhadra, Varanasi, Lalitpur and Sant Kabir Nagar.

¹⁵ The arbitrariness in selection of candidates is evident from the list of selected candidates, changed frequently, unilaterally and arbitrarily by the service provider showing various reasons, like some of the candidates selected in the previous list are not joining the services, some of the candidates are not joining due to some domestic problems etc.

¹⁶ The eligibility criteria for selection of Medical Officers (Ayurveda/Homeopathy/Unani), as fixed by the TC stipulates giving preferences to candidates having MS/MD degree, in addition to Graduation degree in their respective system of medicine. There were no records showing that preferences were given to the candidates having masters’ degree.

¹⁷ One YWC was not made operational due to repetition.

7.5 Training to Accredited Social Health Activists/Auxiliary Nursing and Midwives

With the objective to propagate ancient Indian system of medicine and spread awareness for prevention and cure of common diseases including diabetes through Ayurveda and Yoga, GoI sanctioned ₹ 15.00 crore, ₹ 2.93 crore and ₹ 8.00 crore (total: ₹ 25.93 crore) against the proposals made in SAAP for the years 2017-18, 2018-19 and 2020-21 respectively for conducting cascading training programs to Accredited Social Health Activist (ASHA)/Auxiliary Nurse Midwife (ANM).

Audit noticed that a master trainer programme was organised (October 2017) in New Delhi with the objective to provide training to all the ASHA/ANM of the State. Accordingly, state level training programmes were also organised in March 2018, May 2018 and June 2018 in which trainees of 55, 4 and 16 districts participated. Audit also noticed that:

- SAS transferred (March 2018) ₹ 8.95 crore¹⁸ to the Director, Ayurveda Services, Lucknow with the directives to utilise the funds by the end of March 2018 in PHC/Block/District level trainings. The Director issued frequent letters¹⁹ to all the CMOs; but received no response from any of them for getting ASHA/ANM trained. This resulted in non-utilisation of funds and non-achievement of the objectives of the scheme.
- Instead of utilising Master Trainers/Trainers, already trained in New Delhi and Lucknow, GoUP nominated (November 2019) Shreetron India Limited (SIL), a State PSU engaged in undertaking Information Technology (IT) and Information Technology enabled Services (ITeS) projects²⁰ for imparting trainings to ASHA/ANM on prevention and cure of diseases through Ayurveda and Yoga. SIL organised first (December 2019 to June 2020), second (September 2021 to December 2021) and third (June 2023) phases of training and covered 17, 19 and 21 districts respectively (total: 57 districts), leaving 18 districts as uncovered; and received payment of ₹ 24.15 crore, against the approved expenditure of ₹ 40.25 crore.

The above indicates that due importance was not given to the training programmes resulting in partial coverage of ASHA/ANM.

The Government stated (January/February 2025) that Director, Ayurveda Services wrote to all the CMOs to get the MO (AYUSH)/Medical Officer Community Health (MOCH) trained from master trainers for further training to ASHA/ANM; and since MOs took no interest, the work of training to ASHA/ANM was awarded to Shreetron India Limited; and the training has since been completed. The reply indicates that the objective of providing training to master trainers were not achieved as the capacity built were not utilised in training of downstream trainees and due importance to training was

¹⁸ An expenditure of ₹ 4.00 lakh was expected on organising state level training for trainees Hence, against the released amount of ₹ 8.99 crore, ₹ 4.00 lakh was retained by SAS.

¹⁹ No. 409 (iii)/Aa. Mi./2018-19/Yojna dated 04.10.2018; No. 458 (ii)/370/2018-19/Yojna dated 05.12.2018; No. 552 (3)/Aa. Mi./2018-19/Yojna dated 06.12.2018; No. 01/370/ASHA/ANM/2018-19/Yojna dated 04.01.2019.

²⁰ Hardware, networking, software and implementation of IT training IT solutions and other related jobs. Reasons for nominating SIL for organising the said training and not involving the trainers, already trained in Delhi and Lucknow; and other Ayurveda and Yoga specialists was not available on records.

neither given by MO (AYUSH)/MOCH, nor by Directorate of Ayurveda Services, as they could have trained at least MOCHs, working under their administrative control.

To sum up, there were considerable shortage of officers and staff in the Directorates and downstream administrative offices as well as shortage of medical, paramedical and support staff like Medical Officers (Ayurveda: 33 *per cent*, Homeopathy: 4 *per cent*, Unani: 12 *per cent*), Chief Pharmacists (Ayurveda: 88 *per cent*, Unani: 80 *per cent*), Pharmacists (Ayurveda: 47 *per cent*, Homeopathy: 45 *per cent*, Unani: 57 *per cent*) and Staff Nurses (Ayurveda: 40 *per cent*, Homeopathy: 100 *per cent*, Unani: 81 *per cent*) in the Medical Colleges, hospitals, dispensaries. There was shortage of 538 (71 *per cent*) human resources in 11 functional FIAHs against the prescribed norm. Test check of three FIAHs in Kanpur Nagar, Lucknow and Varanasi districts revealed that there was a shortage of average 53 *per cent* of manpower. The shortage included 3 Senior MOs, 7 Mos and 24 Nursing Staffs. NAM guidelines also required establishment of HWCs and deployment of one male and one female Yoga Instructor (YI) in each HWC. GoI sanctioned 871 HWCs during the period 2019-20 to 2021-22. There were shortages of 102 male YIs (12 *per cent*) and 196 female YIs (26 *per cent*). Further, there were shortages of 22 Yoga Trainers (10 *per cent*) and 39 Yoga Assistants (17 *per cent*) in 224 Yoga Wellness Centres.

Recommendation 12: Efforts should be made to fill all the vacancies, especially in hospitals and dispensaries to provide quality health care facilities to needy population.

Recommendation 13: Contractual appointments for Health and Wellness Centres and Yoga Wellness Centres should be expedited, so that these centres could run with optimum capacity.

Recommendation 14: Due importance should be given to training of the human resources.

