

## *Appendices*



Appendix 1.1

(Reference: Paragraph 1.5)

Sampling methodology adopted for selection of districts, audit units, schemes, applications of beneficiaries under various schemes, joint inspection of establishments/sites and beneficiary survey

Sr. No.	Sampling level	Selection methodology	Sample selected
1	District	Three districts were selected on the basis of highest expenditure incurred on the schemes implemented by the Board during the 2017-18 to 2021-22	Kolhapur, Pune and Nagpur districts.
		Three districts having highest Gross State Domestic Product during 2017-18 to 2021-22 were selected	Thane, Mumbai City and Mumbai Suburban districts.
2	Audit units (Planning units)	Two Local Bodies/ Urban Development Authorities were selected from each selected district on random basis	<p><b>Kolhapur district:</b> Kolhapur Municipal Corporation and Ichalkaranji Municipal Corporation.</p> <p><b>Mumbai City district and Mumbai Suburban district:</b> Brihanmumbai Municipal Corporation (BMC) and Mumbai Metropolitan Region Development Authority (MMRDA).</p> <p><b>Nagpur district:</b> Nagpur Municipal Corporation and Kamptee Municipal Council.</p> <p><b>Pune district:</b> Pune Municipal Corporation and Lonavala Municipal Council.</p> <p><b>Thane district:</b> Thane Municipal Corporation and Kulgaon Badlapur Municipal Council.</p> <p><b>Total planning units:10</b></p>
	Building plan selection in Planning units	10 Building Plans (Commencement certificate) in each planning unit were selected on random basis (except in BMC and MMRDA where 40 and 49 building plans each were selected respectively).	Total Building Plans test-checked were 169. (In MMRDA 49 Building Plans were approved during 2017-18 to 2021-22 and all the 49 Building plans were test-checked)
	Audit units (Works executing units)	Two audit units were selected from each selected district based on highest expenditure amongst works implemented by PWD, Irrigation Department, Zilla Parishad and Municipal Corporations during 2017-18 to 2021-22.	<p><b>Kolhapur district:</b> Public Works Division (South) Kolhapur and Kolhapur Municipal Corporation (Water Supply Department).</p> <p><b>Mumbai City district &amp; Mumbai Suburban district:</b> Mumbai Metropolitan Region Development Authority and Brihanmumbai Municipal Corporation.</p> <p><b>Nagpur district:</b> Nagpur Municipal Corporation (works division) and Public Works Department Division (Division 1).</p> <p><b>Pune district:</b> Pimpri Chinchwad Municipal Corporation (Civil Department) and Public Works Division (East).</p> <p><b>Thane district:</b> Thane Municipal Corporation (Works Department) and Navi Mumbai Municipal Corporation (Road Department).</p> <p><b>Total work units:10</b></p>

Sr. No.	Sampling level	Selection methodology	Sample selected
	<b>Construction Works</b>	5 works from each selected works executing units having highest expenditure during 2017-18 to 2021-22. 10 works each in BMC and MMRDA having highest expenditure during 2017-18 to 2021-22 were selected.	Total 60 construction works.
<b>3</b>	<b>Schemes</b>	Total 10 welfare schemes were selected on the basis of Stratified Random Sampling as follows: Five Schemes with more than ₹ 400 crore of financial assistance during 2017-18 to 2021-22. Three schemes with less than ₹ 400 crore financial assistance Two schemes having zero beneficiaries or where beneficiaries could not be identified	1. Mid-Day Meal; 2. Distribution of Essential Kits; 3. Distribution of Safety Kits; 4. Assistance during Covid-19; 5. Direct Benefit Transfer under various Schemes for education, social, financial and health purposes. 6. ₹ 5,000 financial assistance for purchase of tools; 7. Medical check up; 8. Atal Bandhkam Kamgar Awas Yojana. 9. Schemes implemented by Maharashtra Labour Welfare Board out of funds provided by the Board, 10. Recognition of Prior Learning scheme.
<b>4</b>	<b>Number of applications of beneficiaries</b>	10 applications of beneficiaries from 10 selected schemes in the selected district were selected on random basis (excluding two schemes having zero beneficiaries)	Total 440 applications (Number of applications in Atal Bandhkam Kamgar Awas Yojana was less).
<b>5</b>	<b>Joint inspection</b>	Four registered establishments were selected randomly in each selected district. 20 works from each selected works executing units having the highest expenditure during 2021-22 were selected and cross-verified with the list of registered establishments maintained by the Industries, Energy and Labour Department, Government of Maharashtra to ascertain unregistered establishments. Based on the unregistered establishment noticed by Audit, four unregistered establishments were selected using Probability Proportion to Size Without Replacement sampling method in each selected district. Two establishments/sites where incident/accident occurred in each selected district.	24 establishments. 24 establishments. 8 establishments/ accident sites. (In two selected districts there were no accident cases)
<b>6</b>	<b>Accident Reports</b>	15 per cent subject to maximum 10 and minimum two accident reports in each district	37 accident reports.
<b>7</b>	<b>Beneficiary survey</b>	100 workers in each district on random basis (80 registered and 20 unregistered)	Total 600 workers were surveyed (440 registered and 160 unregistered)

**Appendix 3.1**  
(Reference: Paragraph 3.2.1)  
**District-wise number of workers registered with the Board as of March 2022**

Name of the district	Number of live workers registered in the district
Mumbai	21,111
Thane	15,678
Pune	56,328
Nagpur	29,395
Nashik	7,098
Kolhapur	1,86,611
Solapur	36,697
Ahilyanagar	32,432
Chhatrapati Sambhajinagar	71,284
Raigad	9,471
Jalgaon	17,208
Satara	19,350
Sangli	38,715
Nanded	23,129
Amravati	57,996
Latur	12,718
Chandrapur	34,534
Beed	50,407
Dhule	10,034
Yavatmal	30,274
Akola	35,597
Ratnagiri	3,214
Jalna	33,507
Parbhani	30,683
Wardha	72,415
Buldhana	63,661
Dharashiv	3,191
Gondia	8,327
Bhandara	7,852
Nandurbar	454
Sindhudurg	9,536
Hingoli	3,800
Gadchiroli	36,300
Washim	12,133

Source: Information compiled from IWBMS

**Appendix 4.1**

**(Reference: Paragraph 4.1)**

**Cess Collectors, Assessing Officer and Appellate Authorities appointed by the Department**

<b>Sr. No.</b>	<b>Class of construction</b>	<b>Cess Collectors</b>	<b>Assessing Officer</b>	<b>Appellate Authorities</b>
<b>1</b>	<b>Building and other construction work of the Government</b>	Deputy Engineer (Public Works)	Executive Engineer (Public Works)	Superintending Engineer (Public Works)
<b>2</b>	<b>Building and other Construction work of Public Sector Undertaking</b>	Executive Engineer (Concerned Public Sector)	Joint Managing Director/Additional Managing Director/General Manager (Concerned Public Sector)	Managing Director (Concerned Public Sector)
<b>3</b>	<b>Building and other construction work to which approval of the Municipal Corporations is required</b>	Asst. Municipal Commissioner Ward Officer	Dy. Commissioner	Municipal Commissioner.
<b>4</b>	<b>Building and other construction work to which approval of the Municipal Council is required</b>	Tax Superintendent (Municipal Council)	Chief Officer (Municipal Council)	Dy. Collector in charge of Municipal Administration of the District in which municipal corporation is located
<b>5</b>	<b>Building and other construction work to which approval of the Village Panchayat is required</b>	Gram Sevak/Village Development Officer (Village Panchayat)	Block Development Officer (Panchayat Samiti)	Chief Executive Officer (Z.P.)
<b>6</b>	<b>Building and other construction work not falling under any of the above entries</b>	Tahasildar	Sub. Divisional Officer	Collector

*Source: Notification of Department issued in April 2008*

**Appendix 6.1**  
(Reference: Paragraph 6.2.1)

**Expenditure incurred on schemes implemented by the Board from 2017-18 to 2021-22**

Sr. No.	Name of the scheme	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20	2020-21	2021-22	Grand Total	Percentage to total
		(₹ in crore)						
1	Mid Day Meal	0	0	23.43	183.42	719.06	925.91	21.77
2	Distribution of Essential Kits	0	71.60	367.82	120.98	281.12	841.52	19.78
3	Distribution of Safety Kits	0	72.31	358.17	120.44	278.04	828.96	19.49
4	Assistance during covid-19	0	0	0	497.48	186.59	684.07	16.08
5	DBT	18.99	52.08	88.34	72.24	229.98	461.63	10.85
6	₹ 5,000 financial assistance for purchase of tools	41.11	142.13	138.10	0.89	0	322.23	7.58
7	Health Checkup Scheme	0	0	7.14	17.65	34.40	59.19	1.39
8	Atal Vishwakarma Sanman Yojana	0	29.86	14.67	0	0	44.53	1.05
9	Training Expenses/ RPL	0.20	3.76	24.02	0.67	0	28.65	0.67
10	Kamgar Kalyan Mandal Mumbai	0	0	11.10	11.10	0	22.20	0.52
11	Wage Loss Compensation	0	0	11.74	0.25	0.03	12.02	0.28
12	Atal Bandhkam Kamgar Awas Yojna Urban	0	0	0	0	6.82	6.82	0.16
13	Atal Bandhkam Kamgar Awas Yojna Rural	0	0.10	0.15	6.42	0	6.67	0.16
14	Mahatma Phule Jan Arogya Vima Yojana	0	1.84	2.20	0	0	4.04	0.09
15	Special Registration Drive-Expenses	0	0	1.27	1.21	0	2.48	0.06
16	Atal Vishwakarma Sanman Yojana (Dist)	0	2.23	0	0	0	2.23	0.05
17	₹ 3000/- Financial Assistance	0.22	0.10	0	0	0	0.32	0.01
18	Wall Collapse	0	0	0.30	0	0	0.30	0.01
	<b>Total</b>	<b>60.52</b>	<b>376.01</b>	<b>1,048.45</b>	<b>1,032.75</b>	<b>1,736.04</b>	<b>4,253.77</b>	<b>100.00</b>

Source : Information furnished by the Board

**Appendix 6.2**

**(Reference: Paragraph 6.4.1)**

**Experience requirement specified in the Request for Proposal issued by the Board for the distribution of safety kit and essential kit**

<b>Sr. No.</b>	<b>Experience requirement</b>
<b>1</b>	<p>a) The bidder should have experience of at least one work order of supply, delivery and distribution each of value not less than ₹ 80 crore.</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>or</b></p> <p>b) The bidder should have experience of at least one work order of supply, delivery and distribution each of 1,80,000 units of articles/items in Government (State/ Central)/Semi Government/ Corporation in India in the last five financial years as on bid submission date.</p>
	<b>Or</b>
<b>2</b>	<p>a) The bidder should have experience of at least two work orders of supply, delivery and distribution each of value not less than ₹ 50 crore.</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>or</b></p> <p>b) The bidder should have experience of at least two work orders of supply, delivery and distribution each of 1,12,500 units of articles/items in Government (State/ Central)/Semi Government/ Corporation in India in the last five financial years as on bid submission date.</p>
	<b>Or</b>
<b>3</b>	<p>a) The bidder should have experience of at least three work orders of supply, delivery and distribution each of value not less than ₹ 40 crore.</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><b>or</b></p> <p>b)The bidder should have experience of at least three work orders of supply, delivery and distribution each of 90,000 units of articles/items in Government (State/ Central)/Semi Government/ Corporation in India in the last five financial years as on bid submission date.</p>