Chapter II

Human Resource

Chapter II

Human Resource

Adequate human resource is critical to achieve health policy goals. As of March 2022, there was a deficit of about 21 *per cent* staff in Health & Family Welfare Department of GNCTD. There was overall shortage of 30, 28 and 9 *per cent* in the category of teaching specialists, non-teaching specialists and medical officers respectively in 28 Hospitals/Colleges records of which were furnished to Audit. Besides, the deficit in the cadres of nurse and paramedic staff was about 21 *per cent* and 38 *per cent* respectively.

There was 36 *per cent* vacant posts under NHM in Delhi (2020-21). There was skewed deployment of technicians in Radiology Department of Hospitals. Absence of promotion and career progression opportunity and unchanged salary structure resulted in shortage and inconsistency in the availability of super specialist doctors in two test checked hospitals. No person was posted against the posts of Health Educator, Chief Pharmacist, Psychological Social Worker and Fire safety officer in test checked Lok Nayak Hospital.

2.1 Introduction

For effective and efficient functioning of a health institution, adequate number of motivated, empowered, trained and skilled human resource is essential. Human resource planning is a must before investing in other components like infrastructure, equipment, drugs etc. The number and type of staff in terms of General Duty Medical Officers (GDMOs), Specialists, nurses, allied health professionals, administrative and support staff etc. has to be ascertained taking into consideration health facility requirements of the people to which the health institution caters to. Availability of manpower and related issues have been discussed in the succeeding paragraphs.

2.2 Human resource availability against sanctioned strength

None of the Health-related directorates maintained a complete list of permanent and contractual medical staff available in all health institutions under the Government of Delhi. Therefore, Audit analyzed the data of Human Resource Management system (HRMS), a module/application of Integrated Financial Management System (IFMS) obtained from Treasuries and Accounts Department, Delhi (31 March 2022). The HRMS data contains information of permanent staff deployed in various departments under GNCTD. Audit obtained and analyzed the data related to -

- i. Department of Health and Family Welfare
- ii. Directorate General of Health Services (DGHS)
- iii. State Health Mission

- iv. Drug Control Department
- v. Maulana Azad Medical college
- vi. Lok Nayak Hospital
- vii. Rajiv Gandhi Super Speciality Hospital
- viii. Janakpuri Super Speciality Hospital
- ix. Chacha Nehru Bal Chikitsalaya

Sanctioned strength and person-in-position for all the offices of the abovementioned departments were as given in **Table 2.1**.

Table 2.1: Manpower Position across the different Health Departments						
(as of March 2022)						

Name of the	Sanctioned	Working	Vacant	Percentage
Department/Institute	strength	Strength	Posts	of vacancy
Department of Health and	15508	12240	3268	21
Family Welfare				
Director General Health Services	4080	2548	1532	37.55
(DGHS)				
State Health Mission	3222	2186	1036	32.15
Drug Control Department	145	70	75	51.72
Selected	Medical Colleg	e and hospita	ls	
Maulana Azad Medical college	1111	608	503	45.27
Lok Nayak Hospital	4280	3699	581	13.57
Rajiv Gandhi Super Speciality	882	303	579	65.64
Hospital				
Janakpuri Super Speciality	457	159	298	65.20
Hospital				
Chacha Nehru Bal Chikitsalaya	787	465	322	40.91

Department of Health and Family Welfare and DGHS have major share in the total sanctioned strength. In terms of percentage of vacant posts, there was shortage of 21 *per cent* and 37.55 *per cent* in the above two Departments/Institutes. Audit also noticed that the percentage of vacancies in DGHS increased from 19.96 *per cent* in 2016-17 to 37.55 *per cent* in 2021-22. In selected hospitals and Drug Control Department, the vacancies persisted during the audit period.

Analysis of hospital data¹ revealed shortage of nurses, para-medical staff and doctors and their irrational distribution among these health units (**Annexure I**) as discussed below:

1. Nursing staff: There was overall shortage of nursing staff (21 per cent) and hospital-wise shortage ranged from one to 34 per cent. There were significant vacancies in major hospitals such as GB Pant Hospital (34 per cent), GTB Hospital (28 per cent), LNH (20 per cent) and Bhagwan Mahavir Hospital (33 per cent).

¹ Data of 28 hospitals/colleges furnished.

- 2. Paramedical staff: There were 79 categories of posts sanctioned under paramedical staff against which there was overall shortage of staff (38 *per cent*) and no staff was posted against 23 category of posts. There were more than 30 *per cent* vacancies in 19 different categories of posts such as Occupational Therapist/ Physiotherapist, Speech Therapist, Refractionist, Audiometric Assistant, Dietician, Post Mortem Assistant, Technical Assistant Ophthalmology, Orthoptist, Psychiatric Social worker, Lab Technician, OT Technician, Radiographer, Medical Record Technician etc. (Annexure I B)
- **3.** Teaching specialists, non-teaching specialists and medical officers: The overall shortage in the categories of teaching specialists, non-teaching specialists and medical officers were 30, 28 and 9 *per cent* respectively. There were significant vacancies of non-teaching specialist in major hospitals such as Dr. Baba Saheb Ambedkar (38 *per cent*), LNH (40 *per cent*) and Babu Jagjiwan Ram Memorial (44 *per cent*).

There was no sanctioned strength of specialists in three hospitals (Ambedkar Nagar Hospital, Burari Hospital and Indira Gandhi Hospital) but 11 non-teaching specialists were working in these hospitals on diverted capacity. Also, in these hospitals, 68 Medical Officers were working on diverted capacity against the sanctioned strength of 12.

With regard to lack of sanctioned strength of specialists in three hospitals, Government stated (December 2023) that 36 specialists posts have been sanctioned in Indira Gandhi Hospital against which 17 posts have been filled on regular basis.

Due to shortage of health staff, patient health care services are adversely affected. Department had not made any effort to fill up the vacant posts in different cadres.

4. District and department-wise shortage of specialists in 27 district level hospitals

Data of sanctioned strength and availability of specialists/doctors in various departments of 27 district level hospitals² was collected by Audit. Hospitals located in a particular revenue district of GNCTD were grouped to ascertain the position district wise.

Audit noted that in many of there 27 hospitals, ENT services (3), General Medicines (2), Pediatrics (2), General Surgery (3), Ophthalmology (2), Dental (7), Obstetrics & Gynecology (3), Psychiatry (19), orthopedics (3) and dermatology (5) were not available. Further audit noted that no GNCTD hospital was available in New Delhi district.

² Excluding seven super specialty hospitals, one central jail hospital and four AYUSH hospitals.

District wise distribution of doctors as of March 2023 under 10 specialty departments of 27 hospitals spread in 10 districts is given in Table 2.2.

Name of the		ıtral		ast		orth	E	rth- ast	W	rth- 'est		hdara		outh	E	outh ast		n West		/est	Total
Dept ³	SS	MIP	SS	MIP	SS	MIP	SS	MIP	SS	MIP	SS	MIP	SS	MIP	SS	MIP	SS	MIP	SS	MIP	SS MIP Shortage In per cent
ENT	15	15	6	5	4	3	1	1	7	6	3	3	1	0	1	2	8	6	6	5	52 46 11
GM	30	15	3	1	12	3	3	3	22	16	8	6	2	0	3	3	23	8	21	14	127 69 45
Pead	40	34	90	63	10	3	2	3	17	11	17	12	1	1	2	2	21	13	19	18	219 160 27
GS	33	22	24	14	10	3	2	2	12	7	7	3	1	0	3	1	23	7	17	14	132 73 44
Optha	46	24	5	4	4	2	1	1	<u>14</u>	_7	3	_2	1	_0	1	1	8	4	8	7	91 52 42
Dental	1	0	5	2	6	_1	2	1	_8	_5_	2	2	1	_0_	2		_6_	3	8	_5_	41 20 51
O&G	53	46	2	2	16	9	3	2	23	15	20	20	2	2	3	3	24	11	30	24	176 134 23
Psy	0	0	1	1	2	0	0	0	3	3	0	1	0	0	0	1	3	1	1	1	10 8 20
Ortho	31	29	8	8	8	3	2	2	12	6	5	5	1	0	2	1	16	8	13	8	98 70 28
Derma	7	7	5	4	3	2	1	1	5	4	3	2	1	0	1	1	4	2	6	3	36 26 27
Total	256	192	149	104	75	29	17	16	123	80	68	56	11	3	18	16	136	63	129	99	982 658
Shortage In <i>per cent</i>		25		30		61		5		35		17		72		11		53		23	33

Table 2.2: District wise distribution of specialists in hospitals

Shortage of manpower are shaded red

There was overall shortage of 33 per cent of doctors in the ten departments of 27 hospitals of GNCTD. District wise shortage was 72 per cent in South, 61 per cent in North and 53 per cent in South West Districts. Shortage of doctors in other districts ranged between 17 to 30 per cent except in South East (11 per cent) and North East (5 per cent).

Overall shortage of specialists in General Medicine, General Surgery, Ophthalmology and Dental were 45, 44, 42 and 51 per cent respectively. Shortage of doctors in other departments ranged between 20 to 33 per cent except in ENT (11 per cent).

There was shortage of doctors in all departments of hospitals in South West and North Districts. Further, in hospitals of North West and West Districts, shortage was noticed in all departments except Psychiatry.

2.3 Availability of staff in various posts under Directorate General of Health Services (DGHS)

In DGHS, 1,532 posts, i.e., 37.55 per cent of total sanctioned strength of 4,080 were vacant. Category wise vacancy position is shown in Table 2.3.

³ ENT-Ear, Nose, Throat, GM- General Medicine, Pead- Peadiatrics, GS-General Surgery, **Optha**-Opthalmology, **O&G**-& Obstetrics Gynecology, **Psy**-Psychology, Ortho-Orthopedics, Derma- Dermatology

Category	Sanctioned posts	Working strength	Vacant posts	Vacancy percentage
Doctor	677	539	138	20.38
Nurse	560	526	34	6.07
Paramedics	985	755	230	23.35
Other ⁴	1858	728	1130	60.82
Total	4080	2548	1532	37.55

It can be seen from above table that the vacant posts under above mentioned four categories ranged from 6.07 *per cent* to 60.82 *per cent*.

2.4 Human Resource under Drugs Control Department (DCD)

Total sanctioned strength of DCD, Delhi was 145. It has been observed that 51.72 *per cent* posts, i.e. 75 posts were lying vacant in DCD. Shortage of manpower in some of the posts in DCD were as given in **Table 2.4**.

Table 2.4: Manpower position under DCD (as of September 2022)

SI. No.	Name of Post	Sanctioned posts	Working strength	Vacant posts	Percentage of vacant posts
1.	Drug Controller	1	0	1	100
2.	Deputy Drug Controller	2	1	1	50
3.	Senior Scientific Officer	1	0	1	100
4.	Drug Inspector	46	17	29	63
5.	Junior Scientific Officer	4	0	4	100
6.	Sr. Scientific Assistant	14	2	12	86
7.	Lab Assistant	2	1	1	50
8.	Sample Packer	1	0	1	100
	Total	71	21	50	70.42

Source: Information provided by the DCD

It can be seen from **Table 2.4**, that there was acute shortage of staff in the critical posts of Drug Inspector (63 *per cent*), Junior Scientific Officer (100 *per cent*) and Sr. Scientific Assistant (86 *per cent*).

2.5 Sanctioned strength and availability in test checked hospitals

During the FYs 2016-17 to 2021-22, there was shortfall in the availability of doctors, paramedical staff/technicians, and nursing staff against the sanctioned strength in the four selected hospitals as per the details given in **Table 2.5**.

Source: DGHS, GNCTD Annual report 2021-22

⁴ Dresser, Safai Karamchari, Attendant, etc.

Hospital	Sanctioned		Vacancy					
Name	strength	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19	2019-20	2020-21	2021-22	(in per cent)
Doctors								
LNH	669	542	542	553	551	573	587	12 to 19
RGSSH	238	61	64	82	73	115	119	50 to 74
CNBC	189	121	106	144	132	119	127	24 to 44
JSSH	158	74	70	78	79	57	76	50 to 64
Paramedic	al staff							
LNH	464 (16-17) 464 (17-18) 464 (18-19) 463 (19-20) 507 (20-21) 553(21-22)	363	345	327	316	348	454	18 to 32
RGSSH	136	106	96	78	67	67	60	22 to 56
CNBC	105	93	74	73	75	89	76	11 to 30
JSSH	88 (2016-17) 90 (2017-22)	36	42	34	36	34	31	53 to 66
Nursing sta	ıff							
LNH	1646 (1650 in 2020-22)	1449	1440	1416	1382	1458	1576	4 to 16
RGSSH	428	16	19	19	114	114	114	73 to 96
CNBC	408	238	237	236	221	220	213	42 to 48
JSSH	174	36	36	34	32	30	30	79 to 83

Table 2.5: Staff position in selected hospitals

- In LNH, the shortage of doctors, paramedical staff/technicians and nursing staff ranged between 12 to 19 per cent, 18 to 32 per cent and 4 to 16 per cent respectively.
- In CNBC, the shortage of doctors, paramedical staff/technicians and nursing staff ranged between 24 to 44 *per cent*, 11 to 30 *per cent* and 42 to 48 *per cent* respectively.
- In RGSSH, the shortage of doctors, paramedical staff/technicians and nursing staff ranged between 50 to 74 *per cent*, 22 to 56 *per cent* and 73 to 96 *per cent* respectively.
- In JSSH, the shortage of doctors, paramedical staff/technicians and nursing staff ranged between 50 to 64 *per cent*, 53 to 66 *per cent* and 79 to 83 *per cent* respectively.

In addition to the above, specific and significant shortages in various cadres in all the test checked hospitals are highlighted below:

In LNH, there was overall shortage of 21 per cent of specialist doctors in various departments of Anaesthesia, Neurosurgery, Burns and Plastic, General Surgery, Radio-diagnosis, General Medicine and Orthopaedics as of March 2022. There was acute shortage of senior residents in the Department of Neonatology against the nine new posts created in April 2016, the same were filled only in January 2023. Further, no person

was posted against some of the posts like CCU Assistant, Technical Supervisor (PCR), Technical Assistant (Dialysis), Technical Assistant (ENT), Technical Supervisor (ENT), Psychological Social Worker, Scientific Assistant, Health Educator, Chief Pharmacist, Mechanic OT, Neuro Technician, Neuro Assistant OT, Laundry Mechanic, Fire Safety Officer etc. as of September 2022.

- In JSSH, no Specialist doctors were posted in Microbiology and Pathology during 2016-17 to 2019-20 and in Cardiology Department during 2016-17 to 2018-19. Further, against 24 sanctioned posts (one post each of Professor, Associate Professor and Assistant Professor in eight Departments⁵), only two Professors, two Associate Professors and five Assistant Professors were posted (March 2022). No person was posted against some of the posts i.e. Technical Assistant (Radiology), Speech Therapist, Senior Radiographer (Radiology), Dark Room Attendant, Lab Attendant and Dresser as of March 2022. There were vacancies in the posts of Technical Assistants (five vacant out of seven), ECG Technicians (two vacant out of five) and Radiographers (23 vacant out of 24) as of March 2022.
- In RGSSH, against the sanctioned strength of 26 Professors/Associate Professors, no Professor/Associate Professor was available during the period 2016-17 to 2017-18 whereas only one to five Professors/Associate professors were available during the period 2018-19 to 2021-22.

Government replied (December 2022) that RGSSH conducts regular Walk-in-Interviews for SRs and tender has been floated for the post of paramedical staff and is under process.

Thus, shortage of doctors/para medical staff in departments/hospitals directly affect patient care services.

In respect of test checked hospitals, Audit noted instances where OTs were not being utilized due to shortage of manpower. Moreover, the average waiting time for surgeries in test checked hospitals ranged between one month to 10 months. This has been detailed in Chapter III of the Report.

2.6 Shortage of teaching doctors in selected autonomous Super specialty hospitals

Audit examined the availability of teaching doctors in selected autonomous⁶ Rajiv Gandhi Super Specialty Hospital (RGSSH) and Janakpuri Super specialty Hospital (JSSH) of GNCTD.

⁵ Cardiology, Nephrology, Neurology, Gastroenterology, Anesthesia, Radiology, Pathology and Microbiology

⁶ Both RGSSH and JSSH were to function as advanced centers for research and training in the field of medical sciences and were to be set up as a state of the art teaching facilities for Post-doctoral and post graduate levels.

As per MoA between GNCTD and hospitals concerned, teaching doctors are to be recruited for five years with performance review after three years and extension of one year each time on completion of five year tenure till superannuation on fixed remuneration. Remuneration for teaching faculties was fixed by GNCTD in July 2014 i.e., Assistant professors (\gtrless 1.25 lakh), Associate Professors (\gtrless 1.65 lakh) and Professors (\gtrless 2.00 lakh).

Audit noted that the aspects of promotions and career progression for a satisfied and consistent workforce had not been included in the MoA. In the absence of promotion and career progression opportunities, RGSSH and JSSH failed to attract teaching doctors. Audit observed that RGSSH had 14 (2017-18) to 29 (2020-21) teaching doctors (Regular/Contractual) against a sanctioned strength of 85 whereas JSSH had a maximum of eight teaching doctors against a sanctioned strength of 24 (31 March 2021). In the year 2016-17, there was no teaching faculty posted in JSSH. This resulted in shortage and inconsistency in the availability of Super Specialty Doctors to run super specialty departments like Cardiology, Pulmonology, Gastroenterology, GI surgery, Urology etc.

It was also observed that instead of revising the contractual terms and conditions and enhancing remuneration, RGSSH started recruiting teaching faculty for one year and thereafter, extension of one year was being given. Further, on not receiving sufficient responses even for one year, doctors (teaching faculty, SRs and JRs) had been recruited through walk-in interview for three months and then extension for another three months had been granted. The frequent change of doctors besides their shortage affected the functioning of the hospitals compromising the ability of these Hospitals in providing super specialty health care facilities to the patients.

2.7 Sanctioned strength and men-in-position in selected Medical College

There are three medical colleges of Government of NCT of Delhi. The details are given in **Table 2.6**.

Sl.	Name of the Medical	Name of the	Year of	Number of
No.	College	University	establishment	seats
1	Dr. Baba Saheb Ambedkar	Guru Gobind Singh	2016	125
	Medical College, Rohini,	Indraprastha		
	Delhi	University		
2	Maulana Azad Medical	Delhi University	1959	250
	College, New Delhi			
3	University College of	Delhi University	1971	170
	Medical Sciences & GTB			
	Hospital, New Delhi			

Table 2.6: Details of medical colleges of GNCTD

Maulana Azad Medical College (MAMC) was selected for detailed audit. Medical College Regulations, 1999 issued by MCI (now National Medical Commission) emphasizes that the number of teachers must be as per provisions so as to effectively impart the education. The teaching staff of the college also provides patient care services in the Hospital. During the years 2016-17 to 2021-22, there was overall shortage of 20 to 32 *per cent* of faculty members in MAMC as shown in **Table 2.7**.

Year	No. of posts sanctioned	Filled post	Vacancy	Vacancy (in <i>per cent</i>)
2016-17	288	195	93	32
2017-18	291	207	84	29
2018-19	292	211	81	28
2019-20	292	213	79	27
2020-21	292	234	58	20
2021-22	295	226	69	23.39

 Table 2.7: Staff position in MAMC

Further, out of total 295 teaching faculty posts, 73 posts were temporary in nature and had continued as such for the last 20 years in MAMC. Audit noted that 38 temporary posts in different categories⁷ were lying vacant (March 2021).

Government replied (December 2022) that MAMC has initiated the process of filling up the vacant posts of teaching faculties on contractual basis.

2.8 Sanctioned strength and availability of staff in Nursing college, LNH

As per Indian Nursing Council guidelines, there should be one post of Principal and Vice Principal each and two posts of Associate Professors and three posts of Assistant Professors in each nursing college with intake of 40-60 students. There should be teachers in the ratio of 1:10 to the total intake of students. There were 172 (2016-17) to 224 (2021-22) students studying B.Sc Nursing Course in the Nursing College of LNH.

Audit noted that:

- No Principal was posted during 2016-17 to 2021-22.
- Five Associate Professors/ Assistant Professors were required as per norms. Against this only two posts were filled (2018-19 onwards) out of four sanctioned posts whereas post of Clinical Instructor filled ranged from one (2019-20) to five (2018-19) against the sanctioned strength of six.
- 17 to 22 teachers were required as per the norms. However, only 10 to 13 teachers were posted in the college during the period of audit against the sanctioned strength of 16. Thus, there was shortage up to 19 per cent (2018-19) to 37 per cent (2019-20) of teaching staff against the sanctioned strength.

⁷ Neonatology (1), Pulmonary Medicine (2), Child Development Centre (7), Radiation Physics (1), Genetic Lab (1), Surgery (4), Medicine (4), Reproductive Biology Centre, (Dept of O & G) (9), and Nephrology (9).

2.9 Vacant posts under NHM

As per the MoU signed between GoI and GNCT of Delhi, contractual/outsourced human resource are to be engaged under NHM. DSHS sends the Programme Implementation Plan (PIP) to the MoH&FW, GoI (including requirement of human resource for programmes under NHM) every year for a period of 12 months. Thereafter, the MoH&FW, GOI approves human resources in the Records of Proceedings (RoP) against the proposed PIP.

As per RoP (approved PIP) of DSHS for the period 2020-21, the MoH&FW, GoI approved 2,581 posts of doctors, nurses, technicians and other para medical staff etc. against which only 1,643 posts were filled up and 938 posts (36 *per cent*) remained vacant as of March 2021.

The shortfall in various categories of posts are given in **Table 2.8**.

Sl.	Category of the post	Number of	Number	Vacancy	Vacancy
No.		posts	of posts		in
		approved	filled up		per cent
1.	Nurses	1163	845	318	27
2.	Technicians	439	347	92	21
3.	Pharmacists	134	98	36	27
4.	Physiotherapist / Occupation therapist	21	0	21	100
5.	Medical Officer (Doctors)	105	75	30	29
6.	Social workers	22	2	20	91
7.	Psychiatrists	5	0	5	100
8.	Dental staff for National oral health	106	0	106	100
	programme	100	0	100	100
9.	Counsellors	37	5	32	86
10.	Psychologists	19	1	18	95
11.	Microbiologists	6	2	4	67
12.	Audiometric assistants/Audiologists	18	1	17	94
13.	Lab Assistant / Attendant	23	13	10	43
14.	Consultant	29	1	28	97
15.	Miscellaneous medical staff	403	249	154	38
16.	Other administrative staff	51	4	47	92
	Total	2581	1643	938	36

 Table 2.8: Availability of staff under NHM

It can be seen from the above table that there were significant vacancies in important posts such as Medical Officers (29 *per cent*), Nurses (27 *per cent*), Pharmacists (27 *per cent*), Lab Assistant (43 *per cent*) and Counsellors (86 *per cent*).

DSHM stated (July 2022) that it implements and runs the program by giving additional responsibilities to the existing contractual employees.

The reply is not acceptable as DSHS has not made any efforts for recruiting sufficient contractual/outsourced staff as approved in the PIP by GoI.

2.10 Deployment of Radiology staff

As per Atomic Energy (Radiation Protection) Rules 2004 and Medical Diagnostic Radiology Module (guidelines for e-Licensing of Radiation Applications- eLORA) issued by the Atomic Energy Regulatory Board (AERB), radiologist/ X-ray operators/technicians are mandatory for obtaining License for all X-ray equipment.

Audit examined the records of availability of radiologists/doctors and technicians in health facilities vis-à-vis machinery and equipment available as of June 2022 (Annexure II).

Audit found that in five hospitals viz. Rao Tula Ram Memorial hospital, Satyawati Raja Harish Chand hospital (SRHCH), Guru Gobind Singh hospital, Deep Chand Bandhu Hospital and A&U Tibbia College & Hospital, there was no Specialist/GDMOS/SR, thereby affecting reporting of the X-ray films in contravention of the eLORA diagnostic radiology guidelines. Moreover, in two hospitals viz. Rajiv Gandhi Super Speciality Hospital and Chaudhary Brahm Prakash Ayurved Charak Sansthan, no technicians were posted despite availability of X-ray machines.

The issue was also flagged in the meeting held (December 2018) under the chairmanship of Secretary (H&FW).

DGHS stated (February 2022), that the manpower distribution in the hospitals in respect of all cadres in diagnostic services is not in its purview.

The reply is not acceptable as overall responsibility for manpower distribution lies with the Department/DGHS.

Recommendation 2.1: Vacancies against the sanctioned posts should be filled to improve the functioning of public health facilities of GNCTD.

Recommendation 2.2: In view of shortage of teaching doctors in its autonomous hospitals, Government may review the recruitment norms to make it more attractive for teaching doctors so that a satisfied and consistent workforce of teaching doctors is available in these hospitals.