

Table of Contents

Description	Reference to	
	Paragraph	Page No.
Preface		vii
Executive Summary		ix
Chapter I: Introduction		
Introduction	1.1	1
Audit Objectives	1.2	4
Audit Criteria	1.3	4
Audit Scope and Methodology	1.4	4
Structure of the Report	1.5	5
Chapter II: Excise Supply Chain Information Management System		
Introduction	2.1	7
ESCIMS's objective of end-to-end tracking of liquor not fulfilled	2.2	9
'Stock-take-sold' exercise coupled with weak attempts to enforce scanning of barcodes defeated the purpose of ESCIMS	2.2.1	9
No efforts made to identify repeated defaulters through ESCIMS data	2.2.2	10
Unused barcodes prone to misuse	2.2.3	12
Risks associated with authenticating sales without scanning of barcodes	2.2.4	13
Vend Sales Data Analysis	2.2.5	13
Undue benefits of ₹ 24.23 crore to Implementing Agency	2.3	16
EIB module of ESCIMS not utilised	2.4	17
Provisions of Service Level Agreement (SLA) not complied	2.5	18
Absence of an Exit Management Plan	2.6	19
Lack of monitoring after the Role of PMU was taken over by the Department	2.7	19
Failure to implement Excise Adhesive Labels	2.8	20
Conclusion	2.9	21
Chapter III: Issue of Licenses		
Introduction	3.1	23
Irregular issue of licenses to related parties	3.2	24
Issue/renewal of licenses without verification of criminal antecedents	3.3	26

Description	Reference to	
	Paragraph	Page No.
Non-adherence to the directions of the competent authority regarding monitoring of the license issued	3.4	27
Issue/renewal of licenses without ensuring solvency of the licensees	3.5	28
Issue/renewal of licenses without ensuring that licensee was not in arrears of any Government dues	3.6	29
Issue/renewal of licenses without verification of persons employed by the licensees	3.7	30
Issue/renewal of licenses without obtaining personal bond with surety from L1 licensees	3.8	31
Issue of L1F licenses without submission of audited financial statements	3.9	31
Issue of L1 and L1F licenses without submission of Sales data and Whole Sale Price (WSP)	3.10	32
Irregular grant of L1F license to supply “Baltika 9” beer	3.11	33
Irregular issue of licenses without ensuring legal possession of premises/vend	3.12	34
Issue of licenses without ensuring insurance against fire and natural hazard	3.13	35
Issue of licenses without ensuring CCTV system	3.14	36
Issue of licenses without declaration regarding conditions as outlined in circular for renewal of license	3.15	37
Issue of licenses without requisite approval of Tourism Department	3.16	38
Conclusion	3.17	38
Chapter IV: Pricing of IMFL and FL		
Introduction	4.1	39
Ex-Distillery Price (EDP)/Ex-Brewery Price (EBP) of IMFL not regulated by Excise Department	4.2	40
Reasonability of EDP/EBP not ascertained	4.2.1	40
Fixation of higher EDP/EBP in Delhi than in other States	4.2.2	41
Discretionary profit margin to Foreign Liquor licensees	4.3	42
Conclusion	4.4	43
Chapter V: Violation of Quality norms		
Introduction	5.1	45
Ambiguity in license conditions/Quality control not compliant with FSSAI Act/BIS Standards	5.2	45

Description	Reference to	
	Paragraph	Page No.
Acceptance of invalid quality test certificates by Excise Department	5.3	47
Licenses issued despite mandatory quality norms not adhered to	5.4	48
L1 Licenses (IMFL) issued despite BIS norms not adhered to	5.4.1	48
Granting of L1F Licenses and supply of Foreign Liquor without quality assurance	5.4.2	50
Unreliable test certificates submitted by licensees were accepted by Excise Department	5.5	52
Irregular registration of brand in wrong category	5.6	54
Irregular issue of License on basis of old certificate	5.7	55
Conclusion	5.8	55
Chapter VI: EIB and Confiscation		
Introduction	6.1	57
EIB Data analysis	6.2	57
Structural weaknesses in Country Liquor procurement promoting its smuggling	6.3	58
Role of Confiscation Branch and lack of coordination with EIB	6.4	60
Other lacunae and lack of coordination	6.5	62
Conclusion	6.6	64
Chapter VII: Enforcement		
Introduction	7.1	65
Deficiencies in Enforcement Process and Outcome	7.2	67
Lack of Planning and laid down procedures for Inspection	7.2.1	67
Conduct of Inspection	7.2.2	69
Anomalies in Inspection Report (IR)	7.2.3	71
Follow up action on Inspection Reports	7.2.4	72
Punishment not enhanced for repeated violation	7.2.5	75
Conclusion and Recommendations	7.3	75
Chapter VIII: Excise Policy 2021-22		
Introduction	8.1	77
Objectives of the Excise Policy 2021-22	8.1.1	78
Features of the Excise Policy 2021-22	8.1.2	79
Chronology of events in the Excise Policy 2021-22	8.2	80

Description	Reference to	
	Paragraph	Page No.
Decisions taken without the approval of competent authority	8.2.1	80
Variations between the report of Expert Committee and recommendations of GoM	8.2.2	81
Issue of Wholesale (L1) licenses to private players only	8.2.2.1	82
Excise Duty delinked to the actual sale of liquor	8.2.2.2	83
Retail licenses to limited entities	8.2.2.3	83
Comparison of Old Excise Policy and New Excise Policy	8.2.3	83
Revenue model in the Excise Policy 2021-22	8.3	85
Design and Award of licenses	8.4	85
Wholesale Licenses	8.4.1	85
Process of award of license	8.4.1.1	86
Exclusivity arrangements increasing risk of monopoly	8.4.1.2	86
Revenue from Wholesale operations	8.4.1.3	86
Nature of Joint Venture partnerships	8.4.1.4	87
Zonal/Retail Licenses	8.4.2	88
Increased risk of monopoly due to reduction in number of Wholesale and Retail licensees	8.4.2.1	89
Viability of Zonal License applications not ensured through bidding documents	8.4.2.2	89
Renewable nature of L-7Z zonal License	8.4.2.3	90
Absence of policy provision for surrender of zonal license	8.4.2.4	91
Detailed examination of complaints, received during the tender process, not conducted	8.4.2.5	91
Related Business entities holding licenses across the supply chain	8.4.3	92
Limiting the scope of the criteria for determining relatedness	8.4.3.1	92
Insufficient documentation and analysis to identify relatedness	8.4.3.2	93
Risk of exclusivity arrangements and Brand Pushing	8.4.4	94
Losses amounting to approximately ₹ 2,002.68 crore	8.5	99
Loss of revenue of about ₹ 941.53 crore due to not taking timely permissions	8.5.1	99
Re-tendering of surrendered zones not done leading to loss of revenue of around ₹ 890.15 crore	8.5.2	100

Description	Reference to	
	Paragraph	Page No.
Loss of revenue of ₹ 144 crore owing to irregular grant of waiver on account of COVID to zonal licensees	8.5.3	100
Incorrect collection of the Security Deposit from zonal Licensees, leading to loss of revenue of ₹ 27 crore	8.5.4	102
Other issues	8.6	103
Tender not floated for Super Premium vends resulting in a loss of opportunity to earn additional revenue	8.6.1	103
Irregular opening of vends in non-conforming wards	8.6.2	103
Discrepancies in calculating the pending License fee amount	8.6.3	104
Critical post of DC (Wholesale Operations) for monitoring and regulation not designated	8.6.4	105
Quality of liquor supplied not ensured	8.6.5	105
Trends in sales of liquor and Geographical Distribution of the retail vends across the geographical area of Delhi	8.6.6	107
Excise Intelligence Bureau and Confiscation	8.6.7	108
Conclusion	8.7	108

Annexures

Number	Particulars	Reference to	
		Paragraph	Page No.
I	Sampling Criteria	1.4	111
II	Cases with high percentage of sale without scanning	2.2.2	112
III	Common Directors (same years)	3.2	113
IV	Common Directors (Last five years)	3.2	116
V	Suspected Multiple Retail Licenses	3.2	129
VI	Decline in Excise Revenue due to discretionary increase in EDP and resultant decline in sale	4.2.1	130
VII	Details of Testing Laboratories	5.3	148
VIII	Details of Test Reports of L1 Licensees	5.4.1	149
IX	Details of Test Reports of L1F Licensees	5.4.2	151
X	Summary of Stock related comments in Inspection Report	7.2.2 (ii)	153
XI	Status of Suspected Bottles (HCR)	7.2.2 (iii)	157
XII	Status of Suspected Bottles (retail vends)	7.2.4 (i)	158
XIII	Status of SCN issued to other Vends	7.2.4 (iii)	159
XIV	Summary of Repeat Violations	7.2.5	160
XV	Decision taken without approval of Cabinet and/or obtaining the opinion of Lieutenant Governor	8.2	163
XVI	Cross Ownership	8.4.3.1	164
XVII	Vends of Zone-23 opened in non-conforming wards	8.6.2	166