

CHAPTER III: AMENITIES TO SUBURBAN PASSENGERS

Audit Objective 2: To assess the adequacy of security and amenities provided to passengers availing suburban train services

Suburban sections in the seven Zonal Railways of Indian Railway transport on an average 450 crore passengers every year. Cleanliness and sanitation in trains and stations is, therefore, essential for promotion of public health. In their 83rd Report (2008-09), the Public Accounts Committee Report highlighted areas of concern and made several recommendations for improvement in cleanliness and sanitation at stations and trains. In the present review, the status of cleanliness at 578 suburban stations (CR-76, ER-284, SCR-21, SER-52, SR-85, WR-36 and Metro Railway, Kolkata-24) was examined. It was also observed that contracts for mechanized cleaning of stations were awarded for 95 suburban stations (16 per cent) as indicated in the table 20 below:

Table No. 20: Status and mode of cleanliness adopted at stations.

Zonal Railway	Number of stations	Mode of cleaning at stations outsourced as on 31 st March 2015		Rag picking contract as on 31 st March 2015	Complaints regarding cleanliness during review period	Mechanized cleaning contract in car sheds	No. of offenders held during review period	Fines collected under Sec 198 during review period (In lakh)
		Mechanized	Manual					
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
CR	76	6	Nil	6	76	3	3834	6.49
ER	284	87	158	158	37	4	18613	17.68
SCR	21	Nil	21	21	Nil	1	Nil	0
SER	52	Nil	25	25	Nil	Nil	42420	32.93
SR	85	Nil	30	30	52	Nil	1561	6.85
WR	36	2	25	Nil	125	3	25280	18.63
MR Kolkata	24	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	Nil	11051	30.71
	578	95	259	234	290	11	102759	113.29

Source: Records maintained in concerned Zonal Railways.

From the table above, it would be seen that no contracts for mechanized cleaning of stations were awarded on SCR, SER, and SR. Further, out of total 21 Car sheds (CR-3, ER-6, SCR-1, SER-2, SR-3, WR-3 and Metro Railway, Kolkata-3), contracts for mechanized cleaning of Electric Multiple Unit (EMU) trains had been awarded only for 11 car sheds in three Zonal Railways (CR-3, ER-4, SCR-1 and WR-3). As regards cleaning of EMU coaches in car sheds, it was observed that contracts for mechanized cleaning of EMU coaches were awarded on CR and ER. It was also observed that 102759 offenders were apprehended under section 198 of Railway Act for littering, spitting etc. at stations and fines to the extent of ₹ 1.13 crore were collected.

During Joint Inspection, it was observed that in South Central Railway, a contract for mechanized cleaning of Multi Modal Transport System coaches was awarded in April 2013

for cleaning of the coaches from inside as well as outside for a period of two years. It was noticed that internal as well as external cleaning of EMU coaches was being done manually, due to which coaches were dirty/shabby from outside. This was in violation of the contract conditions which mandated mechanized cleaning of the coaches, but no penalty was recovered as the contract conditions did not provide for levy of penalty for non/poor performance.

During joint inspection of Mahim station/WR, it was observed that in the absence of cleaning contracts, platforms and surrounding areas were very dirty. The Station Master stated that Divisional authorities had not finalized/awarded any cleaning contract or provided housekeeping staff/sweepers for the station.

Thus, the measures initiated by the Ministry of Railways were neither effective nor adequate to improve the state of cleanliness at stations and on trains.

3.1 Deficient Passenger Amenities

Railway Board issued (January, 2007 and September, 2012) comprehensive instructions on provision of passenger amenities for different categories of stations including suburban stations (Category 'C' stations). Some of the important minimum essential passenger Amenities to be provided at suburban stations were booking facilities, drinking water facilities, seating arrangements, platform shelters, high level platforms, urinals and latrines, lighting, fans, time table display, clock, water cooler, public address system and electronic train indicator board etc.

In addition to the above Escalators/Elevators, were also to be provided at all C category suburban stations and stations of tourist importance under 'Desirable Amenities'¹².

Further, Minister of Railways announced (February 2009) that some stations would be developed as 'Adarsh Stations' where improvement in ticketing, circulating area, signages, easy access and exit will be focused upon, with a view to provide enhanced level of passenger facilities within a year. Accordingly, Railway Board had issued various instructions from time to time regarding amenities to be provided at Adarsh stations.

Out of the 578 suburban stations, 153 (including 81 Adarsh Stations) were selected for test check to ascertain compliance with Railway Board's instructions regarding provision of passenger amenities. Scrutiny of records revealed that Minimum Essential Amenities as per prescribed norms and also certain facilities envisaged for provision at Adarsh Stations were not provided there as detailed below:

A. Ticket Booking Facility

There was shortfall in provision of booking counters as per norms under Minimum Essential Amenities at 51 stations inspected on six Zonal Railways.¹³

¹² Amenities which are considered desirable to improve customer satisfaction and interface process at the station.

¹³ ER, SCR, SER, SR, WR and Metro Railway, Kolkata

Automatic Ticket Vending Machines were not provided at 13 suburban stations¹⁴ in two Zonal Railways (ER-12 and SR-1). Smart card sale counters had not been provided at 15 stations¹⁵ in three Zonal Railways (ER-12, SER-2 and SR-1).

The status of booking facility in three Zonal Railways revealed the following:

Western Railway

During Joint Inspection at 15 suburban stations of WR, it was observed that many ticket windows remained-shut down due to shortage of staff. Long queue of passengers for tickets were noticed at some stations despite Automatic Ticket Vending Machines (ATVMs) having been provided. This indicated that usage of ATVMs has not been adequately propagated or the equipment provided was not user friendly. The number of ATVMs provided at suburban stations had increased from 195 to 457 during the period 2012-13 to 2014-15.

South Central Railway

Only one booking counter as against the Railway Board orders for 4 booking counters had been provided at C category stations viz. Dabirpura, Hitech City, Lakdikapul, Vidyanagar, Arts College and Borabanda stations.

Eastern Railway

564 booking windows and 95 ATVMs only had been provided at the 284 suburban stations handling 27 lakh daily commuters with an average of 2 booking windows per station.

B. Platform shelters

Railway Board specified (September 2012) that platform shelters measuring 200 Square metres on each platform were to be provided at all C category suburban stations as per 'Minimum Essential Amenities'. It was observed that all Zonal Railways had complied with these guidelines and codal provisions.

Further, Para 416 (c) of Indian Railway Works Manual provides that whole platform should be covered at important and suburban stations, however it was observed that 366 platforms of 112 stations out of 153 selected stations on all Zonal Railways except Metro Railway Kolkata were not fully covered.

C. Provision of Toilets

Out of 153 selected stations inspected, gents toilets had not been provided at five stations¹⁶ in two Zonal Railways (CR -1 and SR-4) while ladies toilets had not been provided at all on 32 suburban stations of three Zonal Railways (CR-1, ER-5 and SR-26). Though urinals for ladies were provided at 28 suburban stations of ER, they were not as per norms which mandate that one-third of total number of toilets provided should be for ladies. Further, it was

¹⁴ *Mathurapur Road, Krishnanagar City, Birati, Shantipur, Ranaghat, Habra, Budge Budge, Canning, Chakdaha, Kalyani, Machlanadapur, Madhyamgram (ER), Veppambattu (SR).*

¹⁵ *Mathurapur Road, Krishnanagar City, Birati, Shantipur, Ranaghat, Habra, Budge Budge, Canning, Chakdaha, Kalyani, Machlanadapur, Madhyamgram (ER) Kulgachia, Amta (SER) Veppambattu (SR)*

¹⁶ *Chembur (CR) and Pallavaram, Pazhavanthangal, Tambaram and Chennai beach (SR)*

observed that urinals for physically challenged persons were not provided at 109 stations of six Zonal Railways (CR-4, ER-32, SCR-15, SER-16, SR-26 and WR-16).

In WR, 125 complaints were received and penalty of ₹ 1.36 lakh was recovered during the period 2012-13 to 2014-15 from Pay and Use toilet contractors for unclean and dirty toilets and not maintaining cleanliness in toilets as per terms and conditions of the contract.

D. Foot Over Bridges (FOBs)

One FOB of six meter width was required to be provided at all suburban stations. It was observed that FOBs of the prescribed size had not been provided at all at five stations¹⁷ (ER-4 and SR-1).

E. Level of platforms

As per Para 411 of the Indian Railways Work Manual, the height of platform on Broad Gauge route is 840 mm above Rail level in case of suburban stations. This was further revised to 840 mm - 920 mm for Mumbai suburban platforms. It was, however, observed that High Level platforms (range of 760 mm to 840 mm) had not been provided at eight¹⁸ stations on two Zonal Railways (ER-6 and SER-2) while high level platform in revised range of 840 mm to 920 mm for Mumbai suburban platforms had not been provided at 26 stations on two Zonal Railways (CR-4 and WR-22).



The gap between platform and train footboard at Bandra Station (WR)

Government Railway Police records of the suburban sections show that as many as 347 (CR-25, ER-167, SCR-1, SER-80, SR-13 and WR-61) people died after falling in the gap between platform and Electric Multiple Unit (EMU) footboard during the period January 2010 to December 2014. The gaps between platforms and footboard of the trains were noticed at 91 out of 153 suburban stations test checked. In WR, raising the height of 7 out of 16 platforms at six stations¹⁹ sanctioned during 2014-15, had been completed. In CR, the work of raising the height of 14 platforms was in progress, while work on 35 platforms had not yet commenced (July 2015).

F. Time Table Display and provision of fans

As per recommended norms of 'Minimum Essential Amenities', time table should be provided at stations. It was observed that out of 153 suburban stations test checked, time table was not found displayed at 10 suburban stations²⁰ of five Zonal Railways (CR-1, ER-6, SER-1, SR-1 and WR-1). Further, one row of fans should be provided for covered platforms

¹⁷ Budge Budge, Canning, Garia, Shrirampur (ER), Veppambattu (SR).

¹⁸ Naihati, Dum Dum Jn., Habra, Budge Budge, Canning and Madhyamgram (ER) and Deulti, Balichak (SER)

¹⁹ Churchgate, Grant Road, Mumbai Central (L), Mahalaxmi, Elphinston Road and Bandra

²⁰ Kalwa (CR), Habra, BudgeBudge, Canning, Chakdaha, Machlanapur, Madhyamgram (ER), Fuleswar (SER), Pazhavanthangal (SR) and Palghar (WR).

having width of 6-9 Meters. For covered platforms with more than 9 Meter width, fans should be provided in two rows. It was observed that adequate number of fans as prescribed had been provided at all selected stations except for five stations²¹ on Southern Railway.

G. Public Address System

It was observed that public address system had been provided at all selected stations except three stations²² of two Zonal Railways (ER-1 and SER-2). Computer based public address system was required to be provided at all suburban Adarsh stations. It was observed that this facility was not provided at three stations²³ on two Zonal Railways (ER and SER). Passenger survey revealed that the percentage of passengers complaining about non- functional and inaudible public announcement system in coaches was 68 per cent, 95 per cent and 79 per cent in CR, ER and SER respectively.

H. First Aid Kit and Wheel Chair

This facility was provided at all the selected stations except Kulgachia station of SER. In three Zonal Railways (ER-3, SER-1 and SR-15), wheel chairs had not been provided at 19 stations²⁴.

I. Length of Platforms to accommodate 12 Coach EMU Trains

It was observed that the length of 39 platforms was inadequate to accommodate 12 Coach EMU trains at 20 selected stations²⁵ of five Zonal Railways (CR- 9 PFs of 3 stations, ER- 1 platform of 1 station, SER- 2 platforms of 1 Station, SR- 25 platforms of 12 stations and WR- 4 platforms of 3 stations). Besides, surface of 118 platforms at 28 selected stations was uneven and was not conducive to mechanized cleaning.

J. Provision of fencing /Railings between tracks within stations premises

Fencing /railings between tracks within station premises to prevent trespassing had not been provided at 61 stations on four Zonal Railways (CR-10, ER-30, SR-15 and WR-6).

K. Lifts/Escalators

Lifts/Escalators were to be provided at Adarsh suburban stations (subject to feasibility). This amenity was not provided at 72 out of 81 selected stations of five Zonal Railways (CR-6, ER-36, SER-19, SR-4 and WR-7). Minister for Railways in her budget speech (July 2009) had stated that Railways would provide lifts and escalators to facilitate movement of physically challenged and aged persons. It was, however, observed that while lifts had not been provided at any suburban stations, escalators were provided at eight suburban stations viz.

²¹ *St. Thomas Mount , Pazhavanthangal , Pattabiram, Veppambattu, MRTS – Chennai Fort (SR)*

²² *Garia (ER) and Ramrajatala, Kulgachia (SER)*

²³ *Garia (ER) and Ramrajatala, Kulgachia (SER)*

²⁴ *Mathurapur Road, Garia, Madhyamgram (ER) Kulgachia (SER), St. Thomas Mount, Ambattur, Moore Market Complex, Villivakkam, Pallavaram, Nungambakkam, Pazhavanthangal, Saidapet, Kodambakkam, Pattabiram, Korattur, Veppambattu, Tiruvottiyu , Tiruvanmiyur, MRTS Chennai Fort (SR)*

²⁵ *Wadala Road, Mankhurd, Chembur (CR-3 stations /9 Platforms) Bandel (ER- 1 stations /1 Platform), Amta (SER- 1 stations / 2 Platforms) Mahim, Bandra, Andheri (WR- 3 stations/ 4 Platforms) Tiruvallur, Avadi, Villivakkam, Veppambattu, Velacheri, Tiruvottiyur, Tiruvanmiyur, Pattabiram, Moore market complex, Korattur, Ambattur, Perambur (SR-12 stations / 25 Platforms)*

Dombivali (CR), Dum Dum (ER), Kharagpur, Panskura (SER), Tambaram (SR) and Dadar, Andheri, Vileparle and Borivali stations on (WR).

Ramps for physically challenged passengers were also not provided at 55 out of 81 selected Adarsh stations of five Zonal Railways (CR-5, ER-24, SER-18, SR-2 and WR-6).

Thus, Indian Railways failed in implementing its own guidelines for making provision of essential passenger amenities at station. Absence of certain basic amenities such as first aid kit, wheel chair, adequate number of clean toilets, platform shelter, disable friendly ramp/escalator etc. indicated that effective monitoring mechanism was not in place to enforce implementation of guidelines of Railway Board.

In Railway Budget, 2014 it was announced that introduction of first Air Conditioned EMU rake on Mumbai suburban network by July 2014. This was also announced that deployment of 864 additional state-of-the-art EMUs over period of 2 years in Mumbai area.

Review revealed that Air Conditioned EMU rake was not introduced till March 2015, and as against deployment of 864 additional state-of-the-art EMU as of March 2015, only two Bombardier rake comprising of 24 coaches have been received and commissioned after a delay of 15 months.

3.2 Security of Passengers on Suburban Section

An Integrated Security System (ISS) was conceptualized after the 2006 serial bomb blasts in Mumbai, for installation at identified vulnerable stations all over Indian Railways. Accordingly, Railway Board issued instructions in September 2008 specifying guidelines and technical specifications for implementation of ISS at 202 sensitive stations over Indian Railways including 76 suburban stations on seven Zonal Railways. It envisaged an internet protocol based CCTV system, Access Control, Personal and Baggage screening system, Bomb Detection and Disposal System.

Review of the records relating to security measures adopted at 153 selected suburban stations revealed that:

- i. Out of 76 suburban stations identified by Railway Board, review of 44 selected stations revealed that, ISS had not been installed at all at 24 suburban stations, while ISS had been partially implemented at 20 suburban stations²⁶ (CR - 1, ER - 2, SER-2, SR- 5 and Metro Railway, Kolkata-10).



Gap at Entry/Exit point where unmanned DFMDs were provided at Mumbai CST (CR).

²⁶ CST Mumbai (CR), Sealdah, Howrah (ER), Kharagpur, Midnapur (SER), Chennai Egmore, Chennai Beach, Mambalam, Tambaram, Tiruvallur (SR), Dum Dum, Esplanade, Rabindra Sadan, Kalighat, Rabindra Sarabar, Jatin Das Park, Chadni Chawk, Central, Belgachia and Park Street (Metro Rail, Kolkata)

- ii. CCTVs were not provided at 92 stations (ER- 37, SCR-15, SER- 17, SR-19 and WR-04).
- iii. Door frame Metal Detectors (DFMDs) were not provided at 118 selected stations (CR-14, ER- 33, SCR-15, SER-14, SR-22 and WR-20).
- iv. “May I Help you booth” manned by Railway Protection Force/ Government Railway Police were not provided at 95 stations of five Zonal Railways (CR-2, ER-12, SCR- 15, SER-17, SR-19, WR-15 and Metro Rail, Kolkata-15).

Status of implementation of security measure viz. ISS, CCTVs, DFMDs etc in the Zonal Railways revealed the following:

Central Railway

The Integrated Security System was only partially implemented even eight years after it was conceptualized. DFMDs installed at various stations were not monitored by the security personnel. The purpose of installation of DFMDs was defeated due to multiple unauthorized/unmanned Entry and Exit points existing at most of the suburban stations. This was also reinforced by the findings of passenger survey in trains wherein 175 out of 258 passengers and 186 out of 302 passengers at stations expressed dissatisfaction with the security and safety arrangements.

Eastern Railway

Review of selected stations revealed that CCTVs have been provided at three major terminal suburban stations namely Howrah, Sealdah and Sonarpur (Provided by Government Railway Police). DFMDs at seven station (except one under the control of Government Railway Police at Sealdah) were not manned. The purpose of installation of DFMDs was defeated due to multiple unauthorized/unmanned Entry and Exit points existing at most of the suburban stations.

Metro Rail, Kolkata

Installation of CCTV cameras- Eight Pan Tilt Zoom cameras and 43 C-mount cameras were to be installed at nine different locations. However, CCTV cameras had not been installed at any location. Further, the purpose of installation of DFMDs was defeated as multiple Entry and Exit points exist at most of the stations.

Western Railway

The Integrated Security System was partially implemented. DFMDs were installed only at two stations namely Churchgate and Borivali, which did not serve its purpose as they were not monitored by the security personnel and there were multiple Entry and Exit points exist at most of the suburban stations. DFMD at Borivali station was



Gap at the entry/exit point where unmanned DFMDs provided at Churchgate (WR)

found to be non-functional on the day of joint inspection with the Railway officials.

3.3 Security of Lady Commuters on Suburban Sections

Western Railway was the first Zonal Railway to start a special train for lady commuters (Ladies Special) in the year 1992 for safe and comfortable journey. This facility was in addition to the already existing facility of 1st and IInd class coaches exclusively reserved for ladies in all suburban trains. As of March 2015, 31 ladies specials (CR-8, ER-7, SCR-2, SR-6 and WR-8) are being run every day on suburban sections. Implementation of different measures such as deployment of security personnel in ladies compartment, dedicated help line for lady commuters and electronic surveillance system was not uniform in all the Zonal Railways on suburban sections as it was observed that a dedicated helpline was set up and activated exclusively for lady commuters on Mumbai suburban section only and in Western Railway CCTV had been installed inside a ladies compartment on trial basis.

The data of crimes against women on Railways furnished by Government Railway Police and Railway Protection Force indicating 2186 cases (CR-1336, ER-390, SCR-7, SER-10, SR-348, WR-49 and Metro Railway, Kolkata-46) during the review period.

3.4 Public Complaints

Suburban train services play a major role in the day to day activities of the people of a metropolis. Lack of facility/punctuality and even a slight disruption in functioning of the suburban train services affects millions of people dependent on these services and often result in agitations. These agitations at times turn violent resulting in damage to Railway property. Complaints regarding services provided and suggestions for improving efficiency of the suburban system are being received on a regular basis by the Railway administration.

Review of records of Commercial department revealed that during 2010-15, 13260 complaints were received in respect of suburban services as given in the Table 21:

Table No. 21: Nature and number of complaints

Zonal Railways	Deficiencies/ Poor facilities at stations	Facilities in trains	Catering stalls	Others	TOTAL
<i>1</i>	<i>2</i>	<i>3</i>	<i>4</i>	<i>5</i>	<i>6</i>
CR	4422	200	323	2055	7000
ER	681	150	84	65	980
SCR	0	0	0	323	323
SER	58	53	44	62	217
SR	539	105	45	281	970
WR	312	566	106	2437	3421
MR, Kolkata	175	82	0	92	349
TOTAL	6187	1156	602	5315	13260

Source: Records maintained in concerned Zonal Railways

Further, out of 348 incidents (CR-28, ER-218, SCR-8, SER-12, SR-65 and WR-17) of public agitation reported during 2010-15, 125 (CR-16, ER-86, SCR-8, SR-7 and WR-8) were on

account of issues related to suburban train services. The loss of Railway property due to public agitation on suburban section was assessed at ₹ 57.19 lakh (CR- ₹ 48.50lakh, ER- ₹ 4.34 lakh, SCR- ₹ 3.99 lakh and SR- ₹0.36 lakh).

The large number of complaints received on CR, ER and WR are indicative of the fact that Indian Railways failed in providing required facilities to suburban passenger which had resulted in growing dissatisfaction with the services and public agitations.