

**Report of the
Comptroller and Auditor General of India**

On

**Information Technology Audit of
Crew Management System in Indian Railways**

for the year ended March 2015

Laid in Lok Sabha/Rajya Sabha on_____

**Union Government (Railways)
Report No.47 of 2015
(Information Technology Audit)**

CONTENTS

	Paragraph	Pages
Glossary		i – vii
Executive Summary and Major Findings		viii – x
Recommendations		x-xi
Chapter 1 – Introduction		
CMS Objectives	1.1	1-2
System Architecture	1.2	2
Organization	1.3	3
Audit Objectives	1.4	3-4
Sample Size and Audit Scope	1.5	4
Audit Methodology	1.6	4-5
Acknowledgement	1.7	5
Chapter 2 – Status of Achievement of Objectives of CMS		
Discrepancy in Sanctioned Strength/Men-in-position as shown in CMS <i>vis-a-vis</i> Manual Records	2.1.1	6
Incorrect/Irregular Inventory of Crew	2.1.2	7
Incomplete Particulars of Crew	2.1.3	8
Incorrect/Invalid Data Pertaining to Pay Particulars	2.1.4	8-9
Incomplete/Incorrect Data Relating to Inactive Profile of Crew	2.1.5	9
Incorrect/Incomplete Family Profile Data	2.1.6	10
Incorrect/Incomplete/Irregular Loco Holding Details	2.1.7	10-11
Incorrect/Incomplete Data of Stations and Routes	2.1.8	11
Booking of Crew using Fetch Crew All option Rather than Fetch Crew as per Rule option	2.1.9	11-12
Irregular Crew Calling Time	2.1.10	12-13
Irregular Crew Call Received/Acknowledged Time	2.1.11	13
Irregular ‘sign on time’ of Crew	2.1.12	13-14
Delay in Supervisory Approval of Crew Sign on Time	2.1.13	14
Irregular Supervisory Approval Time of Crew Sign off	2.1.14	14-15
Irregular Crew Sign on <i>vis-a-vis</i> Crew Sign off Time	2.1.15	15
Booking Through Mobile Short Message Services (SMS) – Non-usage of SMS	2.2.1	15-16
Incorrect Generation of Mileage Reports	2.3.1	16-17
Manual Maintenance of Records	2.3.2	17-18
Failure in Monitoring Crew Road Learning Training	2.4.1	18
Failure to Provide Effective MIS Reports for Monitoring Crew Training	2.4.2	18-19

Discrepancies in loco details used for validating crew competency	2.4.3	19
Lack of provision for Safety tools Sign on/off	2.4.4	19
Non-feeding of Caution Orders/Circulars	2.4.5	20
Booking of Crew on Continuous Running Duties Beyond 10 hours	2.4.6	20
Grading of Crew by Loco Inspectors – Discrepancies Thereof	2.4.7	20-21
Counselling of Crew – Discrepancies Thereof	2.4.8	21-22
Poor Usage of QUICK as a Tool for Upgrading Crew Knowledge	2.4.9	22
Poor Implementation of Breath Analyzer (BA) Units	2.4.10	22-23
Wrong Configuration of Allowances for Non-running Duties/Training at Headquarters/Outstation	2.5.1	23-24
Inconsistencies in Configuration of Admissible Kilometrage for Outstation Duties in CMS	2.5.2	24
Incorrect Charging of Mileage Allowance	2.5.3	24-25
Generation of Mileage Allowance – Non-validation of/Delay in Sign on/off Time, Wrong Configuration of Allowances etc.	2.5.4	25
Same Crew Sign on/off Time from Same Lobby – Generation of Irregular Mileage Allowance	2.5.4.1	25-26
Crew Sign on/Sign off at the Same Time From Two Different Lobbies – Generation of Irregular Mileage Allowance	2.5.4.2	26
Wrong Configuration of Minimum Guarantee /Handicapped Section	2.5.4.3	26-27
Wrong Calculation of Ghat Allowance	2.5.4.4	27
Computation/Payment of Excess Shunting Mileage Allowance Due to Late Signing off	2.5.4.5	28-30
Time Lag in Data-updation Leading to Inadmissible Computation/Payment of Officiating Mileage Allowance	2.5.4.6	30
Increase in Percentage of Non-programmed Utilisation of Crews to Their Programmed Utilisation over the Years	2.5.5	30-31
Comparison of Crew Movement Data <i>vis-a-vis</i> FOIS/CMS/COA Train Departure/Arrival Time	2.5.6	31
Chapter 3 – Review of Application Controls		
Multiple Traffic Advice(TAs) of Same Train – Non-validation of Crew Competency	3.1	32-33
Discrepancies in Traffic Advice Data/Incomplete Data	3.2	33
Multiple Acknowledgement of Call	3.3	33-34
Non-capturing of Train Number	3.4	34
Non-capturing of Traction Details	3.5	34

Non-updation of Training, Leave and Security Records of Crew in CMS	3.6	35
Non-capturing of Correct Data for Cancellation of TA	3.7	35
Improper Capturing of Reasons for Changes in Sign on/off Time of Crew	3.8	36
Review of 'Lobby Utilization Reports' Data	3.9	36-37
Inconsistency in Output Reports	3.10	37-38
Non-usage/Incomplete Usage of Abnormality Module	3.11	38
Non-usage of Link	3.12	39
Chapter 4 - Review of IT Security		
Physical Access controls	4.1	40-41
Logical Access control – Password Policy	4.2	41-42
Poor User Profile Management	4.3	43-44
Non-monitoring of Activities of Database Administrator(DBA)/Lack of Audit Trail	4.4	44-45
Non-installation/Updation of Antivirus and Operating System Patches	4.5	45
Deficiencies in Business Continuity Plan/Disaster Recovery Plan (BCP/DRP)	4.6	45-46
Non/Irregular Maintenance of CMS data backup	4.7	47
Chapter 5 – Review of Contracting Issues, IT Operations, Project Management/Monitoring		
Incomplete Project Implementation	5.1	48-50
Poor Planning for Implementation	5.2	50-51
Non-implementation of Project Within Target Date	5.3	51
Lack of Trained Personnel to Operate the Terminals	5.4	51-52
Non-usage of CMS	5.5	52-53
Manual Reporting of Various Type of Information by Different Lobbies to Control Office	5.6	53
Contracting Issues – Supply of Hardware/Thin Clients and Maintenance Thereof	5.7	53
Non-execution of Annual Maintenance Contract at CMS Locations	5.7.1	53-54
Non-replacement of Over-aged and Defective Hardware and Non-maintenance of Stock for Spares	5.7.2	54
IT Operations/CMS Operations	5.8	54
Custodian of Lobbies Not Fixed	5.8.1	54-55
Non-provision of Dust Free and Air Conditioned Environment	5.8.2	55
Chapter 6 – Review of Change Management and Outsourcing of Activities		
Change Management – Lack of Formal Change	6.1	56

Procedure		
Non-updation of CMS Documentation	6.2	56-57
Lack of Dedicated Staff at Lobbies for CMS Operations	6.3	57-58
Chapter 7 – Conclusion and Recommendations		
Conclusion	7.1	59-60
Recommendations	7.2	60-61
Appendix /Annexure		
CMS Server Architecture	Appendix I	62
Statement Showing Discrepancies in the Crew Bio-Data	Appendix II	63
Statement Showing Cases of Important Details of Crew Not Being Captured	Appendix III	64
Statement Showing Incomplete/Incorrect Family Details	Appendix IV	65
Statement Showing Details of Locos having no Corresponding Zone Codes	Appendix V	66
Statement Showing Incomplete/Inconsistent data of Station, Routes, Distance etc.	Appendix VI	67
Statement Showing Details of Transactions/Discrepancies Where Crew Were Booked with Fetch All Option	Appendix VII	68
Statement Showing Results of Analysis of Data of Call Made to Crew	Appendix VIII	69
Statement Showing Results of Analysis of Data pertaining to Call Serve Time and Receive/Acknowledge Time	Appendix IX	70
Statement Showing Results of Analysis of Data Pertaining to Crew Sign on Time	Appendix X	71
Statement Showing Results of Analysis of Data pertaining to Supervisory Approval of Crew Sign on Time	Appendix XI	72
Statement Showing Discrepancies in Supervisor Approval of Crew Sign off Time	Appendix XII	73
Statement Showing Irregularity in Crew Sign on <i>vis-à-vis</i> Sign off Time	Appendix XIII	74
Statement Showing Status of Usage of SMS over Different Zones	Appendix XIV	75
Statement Showing Cases Where LR Due Date was not computed Correctly	Appendix XV	76
Statement Showing Discrepancies in Training Reports/Data	Appendix XVI	77
Statement Showing Discrepancies Noticed in Loco Details used in TA	Appendix XVII	78

Statement Showing Discrepancies in the Crew Counselling Data	Appendix XVIII	79
Statement Showing Status of Breath Analyzer Devices over Different Zones	Appendix XIX	80-81
Statement Showing Details of Discrepancies in the Configuration of Mileage Allowance	Appendix XX	82
Statement Showing Details of Discrepancies in Admissible Kilometrage	Appendix XXI	83
Statement Showing Details of Discrepancies/Irregularities in Crew Sign on Time <i>vis-a-vis</i> Train Departure/Arrival Time	Appendix XXII	84
Statement Showing Discrepancies in Particulars of Traffic Advice	Appendix XXIII	85
Statement Showing Details of Cases Having Inconsistencies in CMS Reports	Appendix XXIV	86
Statement Showing Deficiencies in Security Measures Noticed over Different Zones	Appendix XXV	87
Statement Showing Deficiencies/Irregularities Noticed in the Management of Railway CMS Users at Different Levels	Appendix XXVI	88
Statement Showing Details of Irregularities in the Management of CMS Users	Appendix XXVII	89
Statement Showing Deficiencies in Infrastructure/Business Continuity Plan at Lobbies	Appendix XXVIII	90
Statement Showing Cases of Delay in Commissioning of Lobbies over Different ZRs	Appendix XXIX	91
Statement Showing Details of Non-usage of CMS over Different Zones	Appendix XXX	92
Statement Showing Names of Railway Zones and Divisions Selected as Sample	Annexure 1	93-95
Statement Showing Sanctioned Strength and Men In Position as per CMS and Manual Records	Annexure 2	96
Statement Showing Results of Analysis of Profiles of Active Crew	Annexure 3	97
Statement Showing Number of Blank Records of Active Crew	Annexure 4	98-99
Statement Showing Details of Incorrect/Invalid Data for Different Fields	Annexure 5	100
Statement Showing Reason-wise Analysis of Inactive Status of Crew	Annexure 6	101
Statement Showing Number of Cases of Family Particulars	Annexure 7	102
Statement Showing Loco Holdings Position in CMS <i>vis-a-vis</i> Manual Records	Annexure 8	103
Statement Showing Details of Non-availability/Incorrect Data of Zone/Divisional Codes/Stations in CMS and Differences in Distances recorded in Working	Annexure 9	104-105

Time Table, CMS and RBS		
Statement Showing Booking of Crew Using Fetch All Option Rather Than Fetch Crew as Per Rule Option	Annexure 10	106
Statement Showing Difference Between Train Ordering Time and Crew Call Time	Annexure 11	107
Statement Showing Difference Between Call Time and Call Received/Acknowledged Time	Annexure12	108
Statement Showing Difference Between Crew Sign on Time & Train Ordering Time	Annexure 13	109
Statement Showing Difference Between Crew Sign on Time and Supervisory Sign on Approval Time	Annexure 14	110
Statement Showing Difference Between Crew Sign off Time and Supervisory Sign off Approval Time	Annexure 15	111
Statement Showing Difference Between Crew Sign on and Crew Sign off Time	Annexure 16	112
Statement Showing Position of SMS During 5th September 2014 to 5th December 2014	Annexure 17	113
Statement Showing Reason-wise Position for Non-generation of Mileage Report through CMS	Annexure 18	114
Statement Showing Review of Route Learning Data,- Details of Cases where LR Due Date not Computed Correctly	Annexure 19	115
Statement Showing Position of Grading Done by Loco Inspector	Annexure 20	116
Statement Showing Counselling Details of Crew	Annexure 21	117
Statement Showing Status of Crew Who Have Taken Quiz	Annexure 22	118
Statement Showing Results of Data Analysis of Breath Analyzer Test	Annexure 23	119
Statement Showing Mileage Allowance Charged by CMS for Performing Non-running Duties at Headquarters	Annexure 24	120
Statement Showing Admissible Kilometrage Configured in CMS by IR Lobbies	Annexure 25	121-122
Statement Showing Different Mileage Allowance Charged for Loco Pilot and Guards	Annexure 26	123
Statement Showing Mileage Charged for Zero Duty Hours Transaction	Annexure 27	124
Statement Showing Handicapped Sections	Annexure 28	125
Statement Showing Year-wise Programme Hours and Non-Programme Hours of Crew	Annexure 29	126-127
Statement Showing Results of Comparison of Crew Sign on/off Time with CMS/COA/FOIS Train Departure/Arrival Time	Annexure 30	128
Statement Showing Details of Multiple Traffic Advices Prepared for Crew Booking	Annexure 31	129

Statement Showing Multiple Call Acknowledgement by Crew	Annexure 32	130
Statement Showing Railway Zone Wise Missing Traction Details	Annexure 33	131
Statement showing Wrong/Incomplete Details of Period of Crew Utilization	Annexure 34	132
Statement Showing Details of Password Used by Crew	Annexure 35	133
Statement Showing Details of Password Used by CMS Operators	Annexure 36	134
Statement Showing Details of Password Used by Chief Loco Inspector/Senior Loco Inspector/Loco Inspector	Annexure 37	135
Statement Showing Railway wise CMS Users (ALP/TNC/Call Boy/Porter/Gang-man/RR Bearer/Private Operator) having Supervisory Privileges.	Annexure 38	136
Statement Showing Cases Where Booking and Supervisory Operations Performed by Same Person	Annexure 39	137