

CHAPTER X : MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS

Delhi Police

10.1 Delay in commissioning of CCTV surveillance system

Failure of the Delhi Police and Ministry of Home Affairs to assess and determine technical requirement for CCTV surveillance system in high security areas resulted in a CCTV surveillance project awarded in February 2013 for New Delhi and Central District remaining incomplete as of October 2017 despite an expenditure of ₹ 42.94 crore. Further, the Delhi Police has been incurring a monthly expenditure of ₹ 21.02 lakh on hiring CCTV cameras for these areas.

In February 2008, Delhi Police (DP) decided to install CCTV Surveillance System across its policing jurisdiction to monitor and resolve crimes and address security challenges. This was to be completed in phases. In October 2008, Ministry of Home Affairs (MHA) nominated M/s Electronics Corporation of India Limited (ECIL) to execute this work. In July 2012, MHA approved the use of 1,888 surplus CCTV cameras and associated equipment left over from the Commonwealth Games 2010 (CWG Items) for CCTV surveillance projects of Delhi Police. The CWG items were in the possession of the Sports Authority of India, Delhi University and Jamia Millia Islamia University and were to be book transferred from the Ministry of Youth Affairs and Sports (MYAS) to DP.

In February 2013, DP awarded a contract to ECIL for ₹ 74.29 crore for the supply, installation, and commissioning of CCTV System in the high security areas under the jurisdiction of six police stations¹ of New Delhi and Central District in which 1,211 CWG cameras and associated systems and equipment² valued at ₹ 14.81 crore were to be used. This work, which was to be completed within 150 days of receipt of road cutting permission from civic agencies for the respective sites, remains incomplete as of October 2017 despite an expenditure of ₹ 42.94 crore³ having been incurred . Audit observed the following:

- (i) ECIL had completed civil and related work and the sites were ready for installation of security equipment by 15 October 2013. MHA had since revised scheduled completion date of project to March 2015. However,

¹ Police stations Chanakyapuri, Parliament Street, Barakhamba Road, Connaught Place, Gole Market-Mandir Marg, and Paharganj.

² PTZ Auto dome IP Camera, Fixed IP camera with lens, LCD Monitor, Video Management Professional Work station etc.

³ ₹ 37.14 crore as advance and ₹ 5.80 crore as reimbursement of road restoration charges.

- the CCTV Surveillance system could not be made operational due to non-receipt of CWG items for three years between July 2012 and June 2015.
- (ii) In June 2015, based on performance and picture quality of 281 CWG cameras already utilised in different sites of projects implemented in other phases, DP concluded that the specifications of cameras used in CWG were such that the basic purpose of identifying an object, person or number plate of a vehicle was not possible under most conditions. Consequently, it was decided not to use these cameras for CCTV sites in areas under the jurisdiction of these six police stations. In November 2015, DP approved updated technical specifications of CCTV cameras. However, the total requirement of these cameras which was raised to 2,727 and techno-commercial offer of ECIL were finalised 20 months later in August 2017 and award of contract to ECIL was pending as of October 2017. Thus, installation and commissioning of a CCTV surveillance system in high security areas for which a contract was awarded in February 2013 could not be completed even after lapse of over four years. This delay could have been avoided had DP determined the technical requirements and carried out an evaluation of the CWG cameras to assess their suitability for their requirement prior to the decision to utilise them for this project.
- (iii) In meantime, DP hired 145 CCTV surveillance cameras for the Central Vista, SP Marg and Parliament House falling under New Delhi District. Had the installation of CCTV cameras been completed timely, the monthly recurring expenditure of ₹ 21.02 lakh on hiring these cameras could have been avoided. The total payment against this ongoing hiring arrangement up to September 2017 alone was ₹ 6.75 crore.

The Ministry stated (October 2017) that installation of the CCTV Surveillance system had been delayed due to non-receipt of CWG items and award of work based on a revised techno-commercial offer, was under process.

Thus, failure of DP to systematically determine and assess its requirements before deciding to utilize a CCTV system which apparently did not meet its requirements resulted in the surveillance project remaining incomplete as of October 2017 despite an expenditure of ₹ 42.94 crore. As a result of delay, Delhi Police has been incurring a monthly expenditure of ₹ 21.02 lakh on hiring CCTV cameras for three areas while other parts of both the districts remained outside the CCTV surveillance system.

10.2 Irregular Leave Travel Concession claims

Employees in some offices of Delhi Police submitted Leave Travel Concession (LTC) claims with inflated air fares in violation of Government orders. These were passed without due scrutiny resulting in irregular reimbursement amounting to ₹ 2.56 crore to 435 employees.

Rule 21 of the General Financial Rules (GFR) 2005 stipulates that every officer incurring or authorizing expenditure from the public funds should be guided by the highest standards of financial propriety and should enforce financial orders and strict economy. It also states that the amount of allowances granted to meet expenditure should be so regulated that allowances are not on the whole a source of profit to the recipients.

Government of India (GOI) permitted all employees including non-entitled employees to travel by Air India to North East region and by any airline to Jammu and Kashmir (J&K) on Leave Travel Concession (LTC) vide its orders dated 2 May 2008⁴ and 18 June 2010⁵ respectively, as extended from time to time, subject to conditions contained therein. GOI orders⁶ stipulated that air tickets for travel on LTC was to be purchased either directly from the airlines at booking counters/websites of the airlines or by utilizing the services of authorized travel agents *viz.* M/s Balmer Lawrie and Company, M/s Ashoka Travel and Tours and IRCTC.

Audit scrutinized LTC claims of four offices⁷ of Delhi Police in respect of 1,196 non-entitled employees⁸ who had travelled by air to J&K and the North East region for the block years 2010-13 and 2014-17. Audit could retrieve travel details of 435 of 567 employees who had travelled by one private airline from the website of that private airline. In all these cases, it was found that air tickets had neither been directly purchased from the airline nor from the authorized travel agents. Airfare amounting to ₹ 2.56 crore claimed by these 435 employees (**Annexe-V**) and reimbursed by Delhi Police was also higher than the cost of tickets shown on the website of the airline charged from these employees. These employees had not submitted original tickets of the airline and the air fares claimed appeared to be inflated. However, the claims were allowed by the

⁴ For North East: Department of Personnel and Training (DoPT) OM No F. No. 31011/4/2007 Estt. (A) Dated 2nd May 2008, 20 April 2010 and 30 April 2012 and OM No. 31011/3/2014-Estt. (A-IV) dated 26 September 2014.

⁵ For J&K: DoPT OMs No. 31011/2/2003-Estt.(A-IV) dated 18 June 2010 and 15 June 2012, DoPT OM No. 31011/7/2014-Estt.(A-IV) dated 28 November 2014.

⁶ Ministry of Finance OM No 19024/1/2009- E-IV dated 16 September, 2010.

⁷ Deputy Commissioners of Police (DCsP), namely Operations and Communications (O&C), Security, West Delhi and Central Delhi.

⁸ O&C -390, Security-403, West- 277 and Central – 126.

concerned authorities without exercise of due diligence and without ensuring compliance with the extant instructions.

Audit was not able to retrieve ticket details in respect of the remaining 132 employees who had travelled by the same private airline. Further, travel details of 629 employees who had used other airlines could also not be checked as these were not available on the websites of these airlines.

Ministry/Delhi Police stated (January 2017/ July 2017) that the concerned offices of Delhi Police had commenced recovery and ₹ 1.68 crore has been recovered as of July 2017. One of the offices namely DCP (West Delhi) had taken the position that as the employees had performed the journey, only the excess amount claimed over the actual cost of ticket is irregular.

Audit observed that the audit findings raised issues of gross financial wrong doing as well as integrity on the part of the LTC claimants and negligent scrutiny of claims by the concerned authorities in passing the claims that called for deterrent action to prevent recurrence. However, it has not been intimated if any disciplinary and other action has been initiated against the employees for submitting false and fraudulent claims. Moreover, no steps were initiated to scrutinize the claims of the remaining employees in the four offices for which details could not be obtained by audit and of employees of other offices of Delhi Police who may have similarly availed of LTC during the same period. Further, the position that only the excess amount claimed over the actual cost of ticket being irregular is not valid as the entire reimbursement becomes irregular since the air tickets were bought in an unauthorized manner and claims had been fabricated.

10.3 Idling of servers and software and avoidable expenditure on rent of hired servers

Failure of Delhi Police to synchronize the purchase of server and software with the procurement of leased internet lines resulted in idling of servers and software for three and half years and avoidable expenditure of ₹ 1.11 crore on hired servers.

The State Crime Record Bureau (SCRB) of Delhi Police under the Ministry of Home Affairs (MHA) initially hosted the Zonal Integrated Police Network (ZIPNET) for sharing information on missing persons/goods with the neighbouring States and the Online Criminal Dossier System (OCDS) for investigating officers on the server of the National Informatics Centre (NIC). As NIC subsequently shut down Delhi Police applications from their server, Delhi Police decided (May 2009) to host these applications on alternate servers. Two servers (Linux and Windows) were hired (May and December 2009) from a private agency through limited tender on annual rent of ₹ 29.73 lakh plus taxes.

In February 2013, Delhi Police decided to host these two systems on in-house servers in SCRB to save the annual expenditure of ₹ 29.73 lakh on hiring. Accordingly, Delhi Police procured servers and software in May 2013 at a cost of ₹ 1.06 crore (₹ 63.19 lakh for servers and ₹ 42.37 lakh for software) and installed them in July 2013. These in-house servers and software however could not be put to use for over three and half years as tender for procurement of leased internet lines was not finalized.

Audit observed that after deciding in February 2013 to host these two applications on in-house servers, Delhi Police took another eight months to finalise the specifications and sought approval of MHA on 12 November 2013 to invite limited tender. MHA raised several queries on the proposal submitted by Delhi Police on seven occasions encompassing 12 months and finally conveyed administrative approval on 20 May 2015 to finalise contract in open tender after completing all codal formalities. Discrepancies cited by MHA on the proposal of Delhi Police included absence of comprehensive communication plan, unsigned submission of this plan and delay in forwarding the proposal for approval of tender bids. Subsequent proposals of Delhi Police were also not approved by MHA due to the former's failure to adhere to the codal formalities prescribed in the General Financial Rules and incomplete documentation.

Delhi Police could finally order the leased internet lines from MTNL in September 2016 after MHA delegated financial powers to Delhi Police in March 2016 for leasing of lines. The installation work of internet leased lines was completed in March 2017. Delhi Police in the meantime continued to use the servers of the private agency for its web based programmes and incurred an expenditure of ₹ 1.11 crore towards rent on hired servers from August 2013 to March 2017 which was avoidable.

The Ministry (January 2017) stated that the servers were used for intranet applications by using existing cyber highway connectivity and thus were not kept idle. It attributed the delay in procurement of leased internet lines to "unhealthy" competition in the tender process. It added that the migration of Windows server and Linux server applications from rental servers to Data Centre of SCRB has been completed and all the web-sites have been shifted to the servers owned by Delhi Police.

Audit observed that there was undue delay of over three years in leasing of internet lines. The delay was due to failure of Delhi Police to ensure proper documentation and compliance with the GFRs that resulted in the proposals being repeatedly returned by MHA. The reply that the servers were used for intranet applications does not address the issue raised in audit as the servers were meant

for replacing the rental servers but were not used for over three years for want of leased lines.

Thus, failure of Delhi Police to expeditiously progress their proposal for leasing of internet lines in conformity with all codal formalities resulted in avoidable expenditure of ₹ 1.11 crore incurred on hiring of servers from a private party.